



THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT OF
THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



Adobe Acrobat Reader

Finding Words

You can use the Find command to find a complete word or part of a word in the current PDF document. Acrobat Reader looks for the word by reading every word on every page in the file, including text in form fields.

To find a word using the Find command:

1. Click the Find button (**Binoculars**), or choose Edit > Find.
2. Enter the text to find in the text box.
3. Select search options if necessary:
Match Whole Word Only finds only occurrences of the complete word you enter in the box. For example, if you search for the word *stick*, the words *tick* and *sticky* will not be highlighted.

Match Case finds only words that contain exactly the same capitalization you enter in the box.

Find Backwards starts the search from the current page and goes backwards through the document.

4. Click Find. Acrobat Reader finds the next occurrence of the word.

To find the next occurrence of the word, Do one of the following:

Choose Edit > Find Again

Reopen the find dialog box, and click Find Again.

(The word must already be in the Find text box.)

Copying and pasting text and graphics to another application

You can select text or a graphic in a PDF document, copy it to the Clipboard, and paste it into another application such as a word processor. You can also paste text into a PDF document note or into a bookmark. Once the selected text or graphic is on the Clipboard, you can switch to another application and paste it into another document.

Note: *If a font copied from a PDF document is not available on the system displaying the copied text, the font cannot be preserved. A default font is substituted.*



To select and copy it to the clipboard:

1. Select the text tool **T**, and do one of the following:
To select a line of text, select the first letter of the sentence or phrase and drag to the last letter.

To select multiple columns of text (horizontally), hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option (Mac OS) as you drag across the width of the document.

To select a column of text (vertically), Hold down Ctrl+Alt (Windows) or Option+Command (Mac OS) as you drag the length of the document.

To select all the text on the page, choose Edit > Select All. In single page mode, all the text on the current page is selected. In Continuous or Continuous – facing mode, most of the text in the document is selected. When you release the mouse button, the selected text is highlighted. To deselect the text and start over, click anywhere outside the selected text. The Select All command will not select all the text in the document. A workaround for this (Windows) is to use the Edit > Copy command. Choose Edit > Copy to copy the selected text to the clipboard.

2. To view the text, choose Window > Show Clipboard

In Windows 95, the Clipboard Viewer is not installed by default and you cannot use the Show Clipboard command until it is installed. To install the Clipboard Viewer, Choose Start > Settings > Control Panel > Add/Remove Programs, and then click the Windows Setup tab. Double-click Accessories, check Clipboard Viewer, and click OK.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **REPORT OF ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED SESSION**

2 **ON TUESDAY JULY 28, 2015, ON PAGE 180**

3

4

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF

7 SUPERVISORS JULY 28TH MEETING IS GOING TO BEGIN. IF THE

8 AUDIENCE WILL PLEASE RISE. WE WILL BE LED IN INVOCATION BY

9 CHAPLAIN DOV COHEN OF THE JEWISH WAR VETERANS DEPARTMENT FOR

10 THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA AND THE PLEDGE ALLEGIANCE WILL BE BY

11 OUR OWN PETER ROMAN, DEPARTMENT OF MILITARY VETERANS AFFAIRS

12 AND VETERAN OF OUR MILITARY, AS MANY OF US ARE. SO PASTOR

13 RABBI.

14

15 **CHAPLAIN DOV COHEN:** GOOD MORNING. WE'LL ASK THOSE OF YOU WHO

16 ARE ABLE TO PLEASE STAND. EACH IN OUR OWN WAY, WE ASK THAT GOD

17 BLESS THE MEMBERS OF THIS BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. BLESS THEIR

18 STAFFS AND ALL WHO HOLD POSITIONS OF LEADERSHIP AND

19 RESPONSIBILITY IN OUR LOCAL AND NATIONAL LIFE. GUIDE THEIR

20 DELIBERATIONS, THAT THEY MAY GOVERN WITH WISDOM AND JUSTICE,

21 WITH GRACE AND COMPASSION. SOVEREIGN OF THE UNIVERSE, WHO

22 CREATED ALL IN LOVE, TEACH US TO LOVE ALL THAT IS GOOD AND

23 BEAUTIFUL IN THE WORLD. TEACH US TO HONOR THE DIGNITY OF

24 DIFFERENCE, RECOGNIZING THAT ONE WHO IS NOT IN OUR IMAGE IS

25 NONETHELESS IN GOD'S IMAGE. AND NEVER FORGETTING THAT PEOPLE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 NOT JUST LIKE US ARE STILL PEOPLE, LIKE US. WE PRAY THAT YOU
2 WILL KEEP OUR SERVICEMEN AND WOMEN, BOTH MILITARY AND
3 CIVILIAN, SAFE FROM HARM'S WAY, AND THAT YOU WILL SPEEDILY
4 RETURN THEM HOME TO THEIR LOVED ONES. WE ASK THAT YOU WATCH
5 OVER THEIR FAMILIES, HELPING THEM ENDURE THE SEPARATIONS THAT
6 MILITARY SERVICE DEMANDS AND CIVILIAN SERVICE MANDATES. MAY
7 EVERY VETERAN AND ALL ACTIVE DUTY PERSONNEL BE HONORED FOR THE
8 SACRIFICES THEY HAVE MADE AND CONTINUE MAKING FOR OUR FREEDOM.
9 MAY WE SOON HAVE WAR NO MORE. AT THIS FATEFUL MOMENT IN THE
10 HUMAN STORY, BLESS US THAT WE MAY BE A BLESSING TO OTHERS.
11 GUIDE THE NATIONS OF THE WORLD TO HONOR YOU BY HONORING ONE
12 ANOTHER SO THAT BY REACHING OUT IN LOVE WE MAY TURN ENEMIES
13 INTO FRIENDS AND BECOME YOUR FAMILY ON EARTH AS YOU ARE OUR
14 LORD IN HEAVEN. WE INVITE ALL TO SAY TOGETHER, AMEN.

15

16 **ALL:** AMEN.

17

18 **PETER ROMAN:** PLEASE REMAIN STANDING. FACE THE FLAG AND JOIN ME
19 IF THE PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE. [PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE RECITED.]

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL?

22

23 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** GOOD MORNING. IT'S MY GREAT PLEASURE TO
24 INTRODUCE THE GENTLEMAN WHO GAVE OUR INVOCATION TODAY AND WHO
25 WILL, AFTER I INTRODUCE AND HONOR HIM, STEP TO THE MIC TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 INTRODUCE OUR HONORED GUESTS. CHAPLAIN DOV COHEN BEGAN HIS
2 CHAPLAINCY IN JUNE OF 1962 WITH THE UNITED STATES AIR FORCE,
3 AS AN ACTING JEWISH CHAPLAIN. SERVED MORE THAN FOUR YEARS IN
4 TEXAS, FRANCE, SPAIN, MOROCCO AND LIBYA, LEADING TORAH
5 CONVOCATIONS IN BIRCHES GARDEN, GERMANY AND INCLUDING HIS
6 ACTIVE DUTY TOUR AT EGLIN AIR FORCE BASE IN FLORIDA. CHAPLAIN
7 COHEN'S MANY COMMUNITY SERVICE ACTIVITIES INCLUDE SERVING AS
8 CHAPLAIN AT THE CALIFORNIA INSTITUTION FOR WOMEN IN CORONA AND
9 CONDUCTING INTERFAITH PASSOVER SEDERS AT THE MARYVALE CATHOLIC
10 ORPHANAGE. MOST RECENTLY WORKING WITH CATHOLIC CHAPLAIN STEVE
11 STAREY IN AUGUST OF 2014, HE HELPED ESTABLISH VETERANS IN
12 PRISON POST NO. 1, OFFERING SERVICES AND SUPPORT TO HONORABLY
13 DISCHARGED VETERANS WHO ARE CURRENTLY INCARCERATED AND TO
14 THOSE VETERANS EMPLOYED IN THESE INSTITUTIONS. ON MARCH 8 OF
15 THIS YEAR, CHAPLAIN COHEN WAS APPOINTED JEWISH WAR VETERANS
16 DEPARTMENT CHAPLAIN FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. PLEASE
17 WELCOME CHAPLAIN COHEN. [APPLAUSE.]

18

19 **CHAPLAIN DOV COHEN:** IT IS INDEED AN HONOR TO BE HERE. AND
20 SOMETIMES THERE'S A LITTLE BIT OF SUBTERFUGE. I'M NOT HERE TO
21 BE HONORED TODAY. WE ARE ALL HERE TODAY TO HONOR OUR FRIEND
22 AND OUR COLLEAGUE SADIE SONNENERITH. SADIE CELEBRATED HER
23 101ST BIRTHDAY LAST THURSDAY. [APPLAUSE.] SADIE IS SEATED AT
24 THE HEAD TABLE HERE. SHE IS A WORLD WAR II VETERAN WHO SERVED
25 HER TOUR OF DUTY IN BERMUDA. NEXT TO HER IS CARRIE MCNEIL WHO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SERVED HER-- SHE IS A KOREAN WAR VETERAN, SERVED IN GERMANY.
2 AND NEXT TO HER IS OUR VIETNAM WAR VETERAN REPRESENTATIVE,
3 JOHN SMITH. [APPLAUSE.] AT THE VETERANS HOME OF CALIFORNIA IN
4 WEST LOS ANGELES WE ARE HOME CURRENTLY TO 233 VETERANS OF
5 WORLD WAR II, KOREA AND VIETNAM. A NUMBER OF THEM ARE WITH US
6 TODAY IN THE AUDIENCE. I'D LIKE TO JUST BRIEFLY ACKNOWLEDGE
7 THEM. BILL FOX, MANNY RAZA, PAUL ROACH, LARRY KAUFMAN, MARK
8 GLOVER AND MY DEAR FRIEND LINDA JACKSON WHO IS HERE FROM CAPE
9 TOWN, SOUTH AFRICA, ALL TO HONOR SADIE SONNENREITH. I'VE BEEN
10 ASKED TO TELL YOU A VERY BRIEF STORY AND I'LL KEEP IT VERY
11 BRIEF. THREE YEARS AGO I TOOK SADIE TO A YIDDISH CONCERT. HER
12 FIRST LANGUAGE WAS YIDDISH. AND AT THE END OF THE CONCERT SHE
13 PUT HER HAND ON MINE AND SAID, "CHAPLAIN DOV, I WILL REMEMBER
14 THIS FOR THE REST OF MY LIFE-- OR AT LEAST UNTIL TUESDAY."
15 WHEREUPON SHE PUT HER ELECTRIC POWER CHAIR IN REVERSE AND RAN
16 OVER MY FOOT. I TURNED TO SADIE AND SAID, "SADIE, I, TOO, WILL
17 REMEMBER THIS FOR THE REST OF MY LIFE." SO WE'RE HERE TO HONOR
18 SADIE SONNENREITH. [APPLAUSE.]

19

20 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** LET ME ALSO PRESENT THIS CERTIFICATE TO THE
21 CHAPLAIN TO COMMEMORATE HIS VISIT AND HIS WONDERFUL
22 INVOCATION. [APPLAUSE.]

23

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **CHAPLAIN DOV COHEN:** AND NOW OUR SUPERVISOR, SHEILA KUEHL, WILL
2 PRESENT SOMETHING VERY SPECIAL TO SADIE SONNENREITH ON HIS
3 101ST BIRTHDAY. THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR KUEHL.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU FOR COMING DOWN.

6

7 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** GOOD MORNING, MR. MAYOR AND
8 MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. WE WILL BEGIN ON PAGE 2, PRESENTATION
9 AND SET MATTERS. ON ITEM NO. S-2, SUPERVISOR KNABE REQUESTS
10 THAT THIS ITEM BE CONTINUED TWO WEEKS TO AUGUST 11, 2015. ON
11 PAGE 3, PUBLIC HEARINGS, ITEMS 1 THROUGH 5, ON ITEM NO. 5,
12 SUPERVISOR KNABE REQUESTS THAT THIS ITEM BE CONTINUED TO
13 AUGUST 25, 2015. THE REMAINING ITEMS WILL BE HELD FOR HEARING.
14 ON PAGE 5, ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS, BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, ITEM
15 6 THROUGH 13. ON ITEM NO. 6, THIS INCLUDE THE ADDITIONS AS
16 POSED ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL AGENDA AND ON THIS ITEM, MEMBERS OF
17 THE PUBLIC REQUEST THAT IT BE HELD. ON ITEM NO. 12, SUPERVISOR
18 ANTONOVICH REQUESTS THAT THIS ITEM BE CONTINUED TWO WEEKS TO
19 AUGUST 11, 2015. THE REMAINING ITEMS UNDER THE BOARD OF
20 SUPERVISORS ARE BEFORE YOU.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY SUPERVISOR KNABE. SECOND,
23 WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** ON PAGE 8, CONSENT
2 CALENDAR, ITEMS 14 AND 15, ON ITEM NO. 14, MEMBERS OF THE
3 PUBLIC REQUEST THAT THIS ITEM BE HELD. ON ITEM NO. 15, THE
4 INTERIM CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER REQUESTS THAT THIS ITEM BE
5 CONTINUED TO SEPTEMBER 1, 2015. ON PAGE 9, DISCUSSION ITEMS,
6 NO. 16, THIS ITEM WILL BE HELD FOR DISCUSSION. ON PAGE 10,
7 MISCELLANEOUS ADDITIONS TO THE AGENDA WHICH WERE POSTED MORE
8 THAN 72 HOURS IN ADVANCE OF THE MEETING AS INDICATED ON THE
9 SUPPLEMENTAL AGENDA. ON ITEM NO. 17-A, A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC
10 REQUESTS THAT THIS ITEM BE HELD. AND THAT COMPLETES THE
11 READING OF THE AGENDA. BOARD OF SUPERVISORS SPECIAL ITEMS
12 BEGIN WITH SUPERVISORIAL DISTRICT NO. 2.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS. OKAY.
15 SUPERVISOR SHEILA KUEHL. DOES SHEILA HAVE ANY PROCLAMATIONS?
16 SUPERVISOR KNABE?

17

18 **SUP. KNABE:** AT THIS TIME I'D LIKE TO INTRODUCE TO YOU A GOOD
19 FRIEND TO ALL OF US UP HERE, DR. MICHAEL BROPHY, WHO IS THE
20 PRESIDENT OF MARYMOUNT UNIVERSITY. PRESIDENT BROPHY WILL BE
21 LEAVING THE UNIVERSITY AT THE END OF AUGUST AFTER LEADING THE
22 SCHOOL FOR THE PAST 10 YEARS TO SERVE AS THE NEW PRESIDENT OF
23 BENEDICTINE UNIVERSITY IN LISLE, ILLINOIS. DR. BROPHY TOOK
24 OVER AS PRESIDENT OF MARYMOUNT COLLEGE IN 2006 WITH AN
25 ENROLLMENT OF SOME 750 STUDENTS. OVER THE LAST DECADE, THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SCHOOL HAS ADDED TWO MORE CAMPUSES, CHANGED ITS NAME AND NOW
2 EXPECTS TO ENROLL CLOSE TO 1300 STUDENTS THIS COMING FALL. HIS
3 TIME WITH THE SCHOOL HAS BEEN MARKED WITH MAJOR, MAJOR
4 TRANSFORMATIONS IN HIS EFFORTS TO MEET THE VISIONARY GOALS OF
5 EXPANSION AND GROWTH. TODAY, THAT PREVIOUS JUNIOR COLLEGE
6 PROVIDES STUDENTS WITH THE OPPORTUNITY TO EARN A BACHELOR'S
7 DEGREE AS WELL AS GRADUATE DEGREES. THE UNIVERSITY HAS NEARLY
8 DOUBLED ITS SIZE IN FIVE YEARS AND HAS INCREASED THE NUMBER OF
9 PROGRAMS THAT IT OFFERS. HE'S BEEN A MAJOR LEADER DOWN THERE
10 THROUGHOUT THE REGION. THE CHAIRMAN OF THE BOARD OF TRUSTEES
11 CREDITED THE INCREDIBLE GROWTH OF THE UNIVERSITY TO DR.
12 BROPHY'S "INTELLIGENT VISION, INSPIRATIONAL STAMINA, AND
13 PERSISTENCE." I THINK THAT EQUALS WHAT YOU'VE GONE THROUGH THE
14 LAST NUMBER OF YEARS. AS I SAID, YOU WON SOME, YOU LOST SOME,
15 AND SOME WERE RAINED OUT, BUT IT'S BEEN A GREAT GROWTH TIME.
16 SO WE'D LIKE TO SECOND THAT STATEMENT WITH GREAT APPRECIATION
17 AND PRESENT HIM ON BEHALF OF MYSELF AND MY COLLEAGUES UP HERE
18 AND THE 10 MILLION RESIDENTS OF LOS ANGELES COUNTY SAY,
19 CONGRATULATIONS, DR. BROPHY, A JOB WELL DONE. WE WISH YOU WELL
20 IN YOUR NEW ASSIGNMENT. [APPLAUSE.]

21

22 **DR. MICHAEL BROPHY:** ON BEHALF OF MARYMOUNT CALIFORNIA
23 UNIVERSITY, I WANT TO RECOGNIZE AND THANK THE SUPERVISOR FOR
24 ALL HIS SUPPORT OVER THESE PAST 10 YEARS. THE MIGHTY SMALL
25 BUT-- SMALL BUT MIGHTY COLLEGE OF MARYMOUNT PALOS VERDES HAS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 GROWN. IT IS NOW MARYMOUNT CALIFORNIA UNIVERSITY AND THE
2 SUPERVISOR HAS BEEN PART OF A GROUP OF FOLKS ACROSS THE
3 REGION, PARTICULARLY IN THE SOUTH BAY, WHO HAVE HELPED US
4 GROW; AND, MOST IMPORTANTLY, HELPED US MEET THE NEEDS OF SO
5 MANY DESERVING STUDENTS NOT ONLY AT THE ASSOCIATE DEGREE LEVEL
6 BUT THE BACCALAUREATE LEVEL AND NOW THE GRADUATE LEVEL. THIS
7 TRANSFORMATION WAS VERY MUCH INSPIRED BY OUR FACULTY AND OUR
8 STAFF. AND I WANT TO RECOGNIZE THE REPRESENTATIVES TODAY OF
9 OUR FACULTY AND STAFF WHO HELPED MAKE THAT HAPPEN, WHO REALLY
10 HELPED RE-ENGINEER THE INSTITUTION TO FIT LOS ANGELES, TO FIT
11 OUR COUNTY AND TO CERTAINLY BE RELEVANT IN 2015. ALSO WANT TO
12 RECOGNIZE OF COURSE THE LEADERSHIP OF OUR BOARD OF TRUSTEES,
13 ALSO REPRESENTED HERE TODAY, WHO HAD THE WISDOM AND
14 UNDERSTANDING THAT THE MOST IMPORTANT THING FOR US TO DO WAS
15 TO SUSTAIN THE MISSION OF OUR FOUNDING ORDER. AND SO IF YOU
16 WOULD JOIN ME IN THANKING OUR STAFF, OUR FACULTY AND OUR BOARD
17 MEMBERS WHO ARE REPRESENTED TODAY. THANK YOU. [APPLAUSE.]
18 PLEASE STAND. PLEASE STAND. [APPLAUSE.] AND, FINALLY, AND MANY
19 OF YOU KNOW THE STORY, BUT ALMOST 100 YEARS AGO, A PHENOMENAL
20 GROUP OF WOMEN IN TERRYTOWN, NEW YORK RECEIVED A PHONE CALL
21 FROM LOS ANGELES INVITING THEM TO COME OUT. AND THESE WERE THE
22 WOMEN OF THE RELIGIOUS OF THE SACRED HEART OF MARY, AND THEY
23 CAME OUT ALMOST 100 YEARS AGO. AND AS YOU WELL KNOW, THEY HAVE
24 CERTAINLY FOUNDED AT LEAST THREE EXCELLENT INSTITUTIONS HERE
25 IN LOS ANGELES, AND THOSE SISTERS ARE REPRESENTED TODAY BY ONE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OF OUR FORMER BOARD MEMBERS, SISTER MARY LEAH PLAN. SISTER
2 MARY LEAH, PLEASE STAND. [APPLAUSE.] THE CHARISM OF THE
3 R.S.H.M. TO SERVE OTHERS SO THAT ALL MAY HAVE LIFE. WHEN I WAS
4 DRIVING HERE TODAY, SUPERVISOR, I WAS THINKING OF YOU. YOU
5 CERTAINLY HAVE SERVED OTHER. I KNOW THAT YOU DO SO SO THAT ALL
6 MAY HAVE LIFE. SO ON BEHALF OF THE UNIVERSITY AGAIN, THANK YOU
7 VERY MUCH FOR THIS HONOR. [APPLAUSE.]

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WELL TODAY THIS IS A VERY SPECIAL
10 YOUNG LADY THAT WE'RE GOING TO RECOGNIZE, MIA DI RUSSELL. SHE
11 ATTENDED A PROGRAM AT U.C.L.A. SHE'S FROM THE ANTELOPE VALLEY,
12 QUARTZ HILL. I WAS JUST TELLING HER I WAS IN QUARTZ HILL
13 YESTERDAY. WE DEDICATED THE GROUNDBREAKING OF A NEW LIBRARY
14 THAT IS GOING TO BE THREE TIMES THE SIZE OF THE CURRENT ONE
15 THAT WILL BE OPENING IN NOVEMBER OF 2016. BUT WHILE ATTENDING
16 THE U.C.L.A. SUMMER PROGRAM, CALLED THE U.C.L.A. SUMMER
17 ACADEMY SHE LEARNED ABOUT PHILANTHROPY IN A CLASS WHICH WAS
18 CALLED PAY IT FORWARD. AND SHE RECEIVED A \$200 GIFT AT THE END
19 OF THAT CLASS. EACH STUDENT WAS GIVEN \$200 TO DONATE TO A
20 CAUSE CLOSE TO THEIR HEART. NOW, THIS PAST WEEK AS YOU ALL
21 KNOW, WE'VE HAD THE SPECIAL OLYMPICS IN LOS ANGELES COUNTY.
22 WELL MIA VOLUNTEERED AT THE SPECIAL OLYMPICS AND SHE NOTICED
23 THAT THE TEAM FROM HAITI DID NOT HAVE THE SHOES OR THE PROPER
24 CLOTHING, AND HER FATHER WAS FROM HAITI. AND SO SHE HAD A
25 SPECIAL NEED THAT SHE RECOGNIZED AND SHE GAVE THAT \$200 TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HELP BUY SHOES AND UNIFORMS. RECOGNIZING THAT THAT WAS NOT
2 ENOUGH MONEY, SHE THEN SPEARHEADED A COMMUNITY FUNDRAISING
3 EFFORT AND RAISED OVER \$3,000 SO THAT THE HAITIANS--
4 [APPLAUSE.] -- WOULD BE ABLE TO HAVE THE NEW SPORTS GEAR FOR
5 THE HAITIAN SOCCER AND TRACK TEAMS. SHE ACCOMPLISHED ALL OF
6 THIS ON HER OWN, PUTTING HER OWN CHALLENGES ASIDE AND OPENED
7 HER HEART TO THE HAITIAN ATHLETES. AND SO SHE DEMONSTRATED THE
8 WARMTH, THE WELCOMING SPIRIT, THE CAN-DO ATTITUDE TO ASSIST
9 OTHERS, A NEED WHICH WE SHOULD ALL STRIVE FOR. AND WITH HER
10 TODAY IS HER FOSTER MOTHER, INAL, AND WE WANT TO GIVE HER THIS
11 PROCLAMATION AND THANK YOU FOR YOUR DEDICATION TO GOOD
12 PHILANTHROPY. [APPLAUSE.]

13

14 **MIA DI RUSSELL:** THANK YOU FOR THE AWARD. I REALLY DON'T KNOW
15 WHAT TO SAY. SO, YEAH, THANKS. [APPLAUSE]

16

17 **SPEAKER:** I'M THE FOSTER MOM. I WASN'T SURPRISED WHAT MIA DID.
18 BECAUSE TO BE HONEST, SHE HAS A BIG HEART. WE'RE REALLY
19 BLESSED TO HAVE HER AS PART OF OUR FAMILY NOW. [APPLAUSE.]

20

21 **PHILIP BROWNING:** MR. MAYOR, I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU FOR
22 RECOGNIZING MIA AND FOR HER SOCIAL WORKER NADINE ROSE WHO IS
23 BEHIND ME AND THE FOSTER MOTHER. THERE ARE PEOPLE OUT HERE
24 TAKING PICTURES, PETER AND PAIGE AND OTHERS, WHO MAKE THIS A
25 MEMORABLE EVENT. WE HAVE SO MANY YOUNG PEOPLE THAT ARE WITHIN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE D.C.F.S. FAMILY, AND THIS IS JUST ONE OF THEM. YOU'LL MEET
2 SOME OTHERS IN A FEW MINUTES. BUT I THINK WE WANT TO TAKE
3 THESE OPPORTUNITIES TO RECOGNIZE THINGS THAT THEY'VE DONE THAT
4 GO ABOVE AND BEYOND WHAT WE NORMALLY THINK ABOUT FOR OUR
5 YOUTH. AND SO THIS COULDN'T HAVE BEEN DONE WITHOUT ALL THE
6 PEOPLE WHO WERE INVOLVED, INCLUDING ESPECIALLY THE SOCIAL
7 WORKER AND THE FOSTER PARENT BEHIND US. SO I'D LIKE FOR YOU TO
8 GIVE THEM ALL A ROUND OF APPLAUSE. THANK YOU. [APPLAUSE.]

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NOW A GROUP OF YOUNG STUDENTS WE ARE
11 VERY, VERY PROUD OF WHO HAVE DONE THE BEST IN ACHIEVING THEIR
12 ACADEMIC STANDARDS, ENRICHMENTS. THIS IS A PROGRAM THAT I'VE
13 INITIATED MANY YEARS AGO WITH THE DEPARTMENT OF CHILDREN AND
14 FAMILY SERVICES. IT'S CALLED THE ENRICHMENT PLUS PROGRAM. AND
15 WE ALSO HAVE \$50 GIFT CERTIFICATES FOR BARNES & NOBLE
16 BOOKSTORE TO ALLOW THEM TO BUY ADDITIONAL BOOKS AND SCHOOL
17 SUPPLIES. AND THAT'S DONATED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF CHILDREN AND
18 FAMILY SERVICES. RIGHT NOW, THE FIRST STUDENT IS PRISCILLA
19 SCHENKER, WHO IS A TENTH GRADER AT DIAMOND RANCH HIGH SCHOOL
20 IN POMONA AND A RESIDENT OF THE FIRST DISTRICT RECEIVING THE
21 MOST IMPROVED ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENT. HER SOCIAL WORKER'S HERE.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** JUSTIN TURNER, A 12TH GRADER AT ARROYO
24 HIGH SCHOOL IN EL MONTE AND A RESIDENT OF L.A. COUNTY FOR THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BEST ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENT AWARD. SO CONGRATULATIONS, JUSTIN.

2 VERY GOOD. [APPLAUSE.]

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** GENEVA BURKE, 12TH GRADER AT VIEW PARK
5 SCHOOL IN LOS ANGELES, A RESIDENT OF THE SECOND DISTRICT FOR
6 HER BEST ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENT AWARD. CONGRATULATIONS, GENEVA.
7 [APPLAUSE.]

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** CINDY GARCIA WHO IS A NINTH GRADER AT
10 GANESHA HIGH SCHOOL IN POMONA AND RESIDENT OF L.A. COUNTY FOR
11 THE BEST ACADEMIC ACHIEVEMENT AWARD. CINDY? [APPLAUSE.]

12

13 **PHILIP BROWNING:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR AND THE BOARD. I REALLY
14 DO WANT TO SAY HOW D.C.F.S. APPRECIATES THIS OPPORTUNITY TO
15 RECOGNIZE SOME OF THE YOUTH AND YOUNG INDIVIDUALS THAT WE DEAL
16 WITH EVERY DAY WHO HAVE GONE OVER AND ABOVE. AND ONE OF THE
17 THINGS I DIDN'T MENTION ABOUT MIA WAS A COUPLE YEARS AGO, SHE
18 WAS UP HERE RECEIVING ONE OF THESE AWARDS, ALSO. AND SO I
19 THINK BY BEING ABLE TO RECOGNIZE THESE INDIVIDUALS, WE MAY NOT
20 KNOW EXACTLY HOW THAT WILL IMPACT THEM TOMORROW, BUT I CAN
21 ASSURE YOU THAT THIS RECOGNITION GOES A LONG WAY TOWARD
22 IMPROVING THEIR EDUCATION AND THEIR LIFE SKILLS. SO, AGAIN, ON
23 BEHALF OF THE THOUSANDS OF SOCIAL WORKERS WITH D.C.F.S., I
24 WANT TO THANK THE BOARD AND ALL OF YOU AND PARTICULARLY THE
25 FOSTER PARENTS WHO SHOWED UP, THE EDUCATORS WHO SHOWED UP, AND

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE SOCIAL WORKERS WHO SHOWED UP FOR THIS EVENT. SO THANK YOU
2 VERY MUCH. [APPLAUSE.]

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NOW WE'RE GOING TO RECOGNIZE GRANADA
5 HILLS CHARTERED HIGH SCHOOL ACADEMIC DECATHLON TEAM ON THEIR
6 FOURTH CONSECUTIVE NATIONAL CHAMPIONSHIP. FOURTH. THEY
7 COMPETED AGAINST 30 TEAMS IN APRIL ACROSS THE WORLD IN
8 ANAHEIM. THEY COMPETED AGAINST STUDENTS FROM AS FAR AWAY AS
9 CHINA AND GREAT BRITAIN. THIS IS A VERY RIGOROUS DECATHLON,
10 TEN SUBJECT COMPETITION WHICH STUDENTS ARE TESTED ON ANYTHING
11 FROM LITERATURE AND ART TO MATH AND SCIENCE. GRANADA HILLS
12 SCORED 53, 592 OUT OF 60,000 POINTS. THESE 11 STUDENTS USED
13 THEIR INTELLECTUAL POWERS BY DOMINATING THE OPPOSITION IN THAT
14 COMPETITION. TODAY WE HAVE OUR COACHES, MATTHEW ARNOLD AND
15 JONATHAN STUVERANT, AND STUDENTS IRENE LEE, PETER CHO,
16 FERNANDO SANCHEZ, JEANINE DOCTOR, JASMINE KIM, NATALIE
17 GONZALEZ, JORGE SEBELIA, TANTILLA WONSTEIN, MESSED UP ON THAT
18 ONE, JOSHUA LIN, JEANNIE HAN AND AND ASHA MAHMUT. SO MR.
19 ARNOLD? JONATHAN AND MATTHEW?

20

21 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR HAVING US HERE. WE WANT TO
22 THANK THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. THIS TEAM HAS WORKED SO HARD.
23 THEY START IN JUNE. I CAN'T TELL YOU THE AMOUNT OF HOURS THESE
24 GUYS PUT IN. AND I'M REALLY HONORED TO BE A PART OF THIS TEAM
25 AND THEIR HARD WORK AND DEDICATION IS TRULY INSPIRING. SO THEY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 REALLY DESERVE THIS, AND THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THIS HONOR.

2 [APPLAUSE.]

3

4 **SPEAKER:** THANK YOU SO MUCH FOR THIS HONOR. I THINK ALL OF US,
5 WHEN WE INVEST OURSELVES IN THIS ORGANIZATION, WE CAN'T HELP
6 BUT WONDER: IS IT REALLY WORTH SACRIFICING OUR OTHER
7 EXTRACURRICULARS, OUR TIME WITH OUR FAMILIES AND SOMETIMES
8 EVEN OUR SOCIAL RELATIONSHIPS WITH OUR FRIENDS? BUT IT'S THESE
9 MOMENTS WHERE WE'RE GIVEN THESE AWARDS AND RECOGNIZED FOR ALL
10 OUR HARD WORK, WHERE YOU SHOW THE TENS OF THOUSANDS OF
11 DECATHLETES THAT INVEST THEMSELVES IN THIS ORGANIZATION, THAT
12 INVESTING IN YOURSELF AND GOING FOR THE ACADEMICS IS TRULY
13 WORTHWHILE. THANK YOU SO MUCH. [APPLAUSE.]

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NOW WE HAVE A LITTLE FOUR-MONTH OLD
16 LITTLE GIRL. HER NAME IS JUNEBUG. LITTLE TERRIER. LITTLE
17 JUNEBUG WOULD LOVE TO RUN AROUND THE VINEYARDS, HELP THOSE
18 GRAPES GROW. [APPLAUSE.] YOU ALREADY HAVE A FAN CLUB OUT
19 THERE, YEAH. OKAY. ANYWAY, ANYBODY LIKE TO ADOPT LITTLE
20 JUNEBUG, YOU CAN CALL AREA CODE 562-256-1649 OR ANYBODY IN THE
21 AUDIENCE OR ANYBODY WHO'S LISTENING ON THEIR COMPUTER, LITTLE
22 JUNEBUG WOULD LOVE TO HAVE A HOME AND GIVE YOU ALL KINDS OF
23 LOVE. THANK YOU. JUNEBUG.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** MR. MAYOR, I BELIEVE WE
2 WOULD TAKE UP THE PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS AT THIS TIME. SO IF I
3 CAN, I'LL SWEAR IN THE INDIVIDUALS WHO ARE HERE TO TESTIFY. SO
4 ALL THOSE WHO PLAN TO TESTIFY BEFORE THE BOARD, PLEASE STAND
5 AND RAISE YOUR RIGHT HAND TO BE SWORN IN. THIS IS FOR ITEMS 1,
6 2, 3 AND 4. IN THE TESTIMONY YOU MAY GIVE BEFORE THE BOARD, DO
7 YOU SOLEMNLY SWEAR TO TELL THE TRUTH, THE WHOLE TRUTH AND
8 NOTHING BUT THE TRUTH SO HELP YOU GOD? THANK YOU. MR. MAYOR,
9 ON ITEM NO. 1, I'LL READ IN THE SHORT TITLE FOR THE RECORD.
10 THIS IS THE HEARING ON THE ANNEXATION OF 35 PARCELS TO THE
11 CONSOLIDATED SEWER MAINTENANCE DISTRICT WITHIN THE
12 UNINCORPORATED TERRITORIES AND CITIES AND THE LEVY OF SEWER
13 SERVICE CHARGES WITHIN THE ANNEXED PARCELS TO BE AFFECTED IN
14 FISCAL YEAR 2016/2017. ON THIS ITEM, THERE IS A DEPARTMENTAL
15 STATEMENT AND NO CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED.

16

17 **NICHOLAS AGBOBU:** YES, NICHOLAS AGBOBU. I'M A SENIOR CIVIL
18 ENGINEER FOR THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS. I AM FAMILIAR
19 WITH THESE PROCEEDINGS FOR THE ANNEXATION TO THE CONSOLIDATED
20 SEWER MAINTENANCE DISTRICT OF AND LEVYING OF SEWER SERVICE
21 CHARGES TO 35 PARCELS IDENTIFIED IN THE BOARD LETTERS WHICH
22 ARE LOCATED IN THE UNINCORPORATED COMMUNITIES OF CERRITOS,
23 EAST LOS ANGELES, EAST SAN GABRIEL, HACIENDA HEIGHTS, LA
24 RAMBLA, LA VERNE, ROWLAND HEIGHTS, VIEW PARK, WESTFIELD AND IN
25 THE CITIES OF BALDWIN PARK, CARSON, COMMERCE, DIAMOND BAR,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DUARTE, GLENDORA, INDUSTRY, LOMITA, RANCHO PALOS VERDES,
2 ROLLING HILLS ESTATES, SAN DIMAS AND SOUTH EL MONTE. THE
3 INVOLVED CITIES HAVE GRANTED THEIR CONSENT AND JURISDICTION.
4 IN MY OPINION, ALL 35 PARCELS WILL BE BENEFITED BY THE
5 ANNEXATION TO THE DISTRICT AND BY THE SERVICE TO BE PROVIDED.
6 IN MY OPINION, THE SEWER SERVICE CHARGES HAVE BEEN FAIRLY
7 IMPOSED

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. ONE SPEAKER. MR. SACHS.

10

11 **ARNOLD SACHS:** THANK YOU, GOOD MORNING, ARNOLD SACHS. EVEN
12 THOUGH IT'S JUST 35 PARCELS AND THERE WAS NO RESPONSE, NO
13 MAJORITY PROTEST, WAS THERE ANY PROTEST RECEIVED BY THE
14 DEPARTMENT? BECAUSE BASICALLY MY REAL CONCERN IS HOW THESE
15 HEARINGS ARE ANNOUNCED TO THE PUBLIC. YOU YOURSELVES HAVE SAID
16 AT LEAST TWO MAJOR TIMES THAT PUBLIC NOTICE FOR HEARINGS IS A
17 LITTLE BIT SHORT OF WHAT IT SHOULD BE. ONE WAS WHEN YOU WANTED
18 TO DO THE CLEAN WATER BILL, I BELIEVE A LOT OF THE REMARKS
19 WERE THAT THE NOTIFICATION FOR THAT ASSESSMENT WAS LIKE JUST
20 JUNK MAIL. AND I DON'T KNOW. HAVE YOU TAKEN ANY ATTEMPT TO
21 ADOPT THE YAROSLAVSKY POLICY FOR THE IN BASKET AND THE OUT
22 BASKET THAT HE EXPLAINED WHEN YOU TALKED ABOUT THE WATER,
23 CLEAN WATER ACT? AND THEN THE OTHER WAS THE HOUSING SITUATION
24 I BELIEVE IN SUPERVISOR-- THEN SUPERVISOR MOLINA'S DISTRICT
25 WHERE THE RESIDENTS OF THE COMPLEX WEREN'T TOLD THAT THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH SERVICES WAS MOVING INTO THE FIRST FLOOR
2 OF THE MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT, AND THERE WAS NO NOTIFICATION.
3 SO, IT'S THE ADDRESSING OF THESE HEARINGS THAT IS A MAJOR
4 CONCERN. AND HAS THE AGENCY TAKEN STEPS TO CLARIFY THAT? AND
5 AGAIN, 35 PARCELS, WHAT WAS THE RATIO OF PROTESTS VERSUS
6 ACCEPTANCE TO THIS ANNEXATION? BECAUSE IF YOU DON'T HEAR
7 ANYTHING, PEOPLE MAY NOT EVEN KNOW IT'S GOING ON UNTIL IT'S
8 TOO LATE. THANK YOU.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY--

11

12 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** MR. MAYOR AND MEMBERS OF
13 THE BOARD, A DETERMINATION HAS BEEN MADE THAT NO MAJORITY
14 PROTESTS EXISTS AGAINST THE PROPOSED ANNEXATION OF PARCELS TO
15 THE CONSOLIDATED SEWER MAINTENANCE DISTRICT WITHIN THE
16 UNINCORPORATED TERRITORIES AND CITIES, AND LEVYING OF SEWER
17 SERVICE CHARGES WITHIN THE ANNEXED PARCELS FOR FISCAL YEAR
18 2016 AND '17. AS A RESULT, IT WOULD BE APPROPRIATE FOR THE
19 BOARD TO CLOSE THE PUBLIC HEARING AND ADOPT THE RESOLUTION
20 APPROVING AND ACCEPTING NEGOTIATIONS HAT THERE WILL BE NO
21 EXCHANGE OF PROPERTY TAX REVENUES AS A RESULT OF THE
22 ANNEXATION FOR FISCAL YEAR 2016/'17.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. SUPERVISOR SOLIS MOVES TO CLOSE
25 THE HEARING AND APPROVE THE ITEM. SECONDED, WITHOUT OBJECTION.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR. ITEM NO. 2, THIS IS A**
3 **HEARING ON CONFIRMATION OF FISCAL YEAR 2014/'15, HAZARDOUS**
4 **VEGETATION WEED ABATEMENT CHARGES TO BE ASSESSED TO OWNERS OF**
5 **DESIGNATED PARCELS OF LAND. ON THIS ITEM, THERE IS NO**
6 **DEPARTMENTAL STATEMENT, NO CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED AND**
7 **THERE IS ONE SPEAKER.**

8

9 **>>SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MR. SACHS? OKAY. MOTION BY
10 SUPERVISOR KUEHL. SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

11

12 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** ON ITEM NO. 3, THIS IS THE
13 HEARING ON PROPOSED STREET NAME CHANGE NO. 763 TO CHANGE THE
14 NAME ON THE SEGMENT OF WEST 120TH STREET AND SOUTHWESTERN
15 AVENUE TO CHARLIE SIFFERT DRIVE. ON THIS ITEM, THERE IS NO
16 DEPARTMENTAL STATEMENT, NO CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED AND
17 THERE IS A MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MR. TODD ZAGURSKI AND ARNOLD SACHS.

20

21 **ARNOLD SACHS:** YES, THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. ARNOLD SACHS
22 ACTUALLY THE REASON I HELD THIS ITEM WAS THE LAST LINE. THE
23 EXTENSION OF THIS ROAD TO THE SOUTHERN PACIFIC TRANSPORTATION
24 COMPANY. AND HERE I AM THINKING IT'S ALWAYS BEEN THE SOUTHERN
25 PACIFIC RAILROAD AND IT'S ACTUALLY THE SOUTHERN PACIFIC

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TRANSPORTATION COMPANY. AND IT'S THE MEANING, IT'S THE
2 AUTHORITY GIVEN TO THE TRANSPORTATION COMPANY. I'M TRYING TO
3 THINK OF THE SHAKESPEAREAN QUOTE. THE MESSAGE IS IN THE
4 MEANING. I CAN'T THINK OF THE QUOTE RIGHT NOW, BUT WHEN I COME
5 BEFORE THIS BOARD AND I MENTION CERTAIN PECULIARITIES WITH THE
6 NAMING OF THESE AUTHORIZED BUSINESSES, SUCH AS THE GOLD LINE
7 CONSTRUCTION TRUST AUTHORITY VERSUS THE GOLD LINE CONSTRUCTION
8 AUTHORITY, IT'S JUST WATER UNDER THE BRIDGE. SO THE IMPORTANT
9 PART HERE IS IT'S ACTUALLY THE SOUTHERN PACIFIC TRANSPORTATION
10 COMPANY AND NOT THE SOUTHERN PACIFIC RAILROAD COMPANY. THEY
11 COULD BE THE SAME ENTITY. ONE COULD BE A SUBENTITY OF THE
12 OTHER. LIKE YOU HAVE AN ITEM ON YOUR AGENDA TODAY ABOUT
13 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON. WE DON'T REALLY KNOW IF THAT'S THE
14 ORIGINAL SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON OR THE SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA
15 EDISON THAT WAS SPUN OFF FROM EDISON INTERNATIONAL AFTER
16 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON INCORPORATED. BUT WHAT'S IMPORTANT
17 FOR THE PUBLIC TO KNOW IS: WHO PAYS THE BILLS? AND WHO GETS
18 THE FREE RIDE HERE? BECAUSE WHEN PROPERTY COMES AROUND IN L.A.
19 TO BE DEVELOPED, AND I'M SURE PART OF THIS IS PART OF THE WELL
20 HEARD OF CRENSHAW LINE, WHO'S ACTUALLY GETTING THE MONEY? AND
21 WHO'S ACTUALLY GETTING THE LIABILITY IN REGARDS TO THIS? THIS
22 IS THE IMPORTANT STUFF ON THIS LITTLE ITEM, THE NAME AND THE
23 STREET, GREAT ASTRONAUT. THANK YOU.
24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS
2 MOVES TO CLOSE THE HEARING, APPROVE THE ITEM. I'LL SECOND IT.
3 WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

4

5 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** AND ON ITEM NO. 4, MR.
6 MAYOR, THIS IS A HEARING ON THE ADOPTION OF AN ORDINANCE
7 EXTENDING INTERIM ORDINANCE NO. 2015-0022 U, WHICH TEMPORARILY
8 PROHIBITS THE ESTABLISHMENT OR EXPANSION OF VINEYARDS EITHER
9 AS A PRIMARY OR ACCESSORY USE ON ALL PROPERTIES LOCATED IN THE
10 AREA REGULATED BY THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA
11 COMMUNITY STANDARDS DISTRICT FOR A PERIOD OF 10 MONTHS AND 15
12 DAYS. THERE IS A DEPARTMENTAL STATEMENT ON THIS ITEM.
13 CORRESPONDENCE WAS RECEIVED. AND WE HAVE A NUMBER OF SPEAKERS
14 ON THIS ITEM.

15

16 **ANITA GUTIERREZ:** HELLO, ANITA GUTIERREZ FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF
17 REGIONAL PLANNING. ON JUNE 26, 2015, THE BOARD IMPLEMENTED A
18 TEMPORARY PROHIBITION ON NEW VINEYARDS AS EITHER A PRIMARY OR
19 ACCESSORY USE ON ALL PROPERTIES LOCATED IN THE SANTA MONICA
20 MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA C.S.D. AT THAT TIME, YOU DIRECTED
21 REGIONAL PLANNING TO EXPLORE THE CONCERNS ASSOCIATED WITH
22 DEVELOPING VINEYARDS IN THE NORTH AREA AND TO CONSIDER HOW
23 THESE CONCERNS WOULD BE ADDRESSED THROUGH ZONING REGULATIONS.
24 AT THE JUNE 16TH MEETING, YOU ANNOUNCED THAT A PUBLIC HEARING
25 WILL BE HELD ON JULY 28TH, TODAY, TO CONSIDER, ONE, WHETHER TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 EXTEND THE URGENCY ORDINANCE, TWO, THE INFORMATION AND
2 RECOMMENDATIONS PROVIDED BY REGIONAL PLANNING, AND, THREE, TO
3 PROVIDE FURTHER DIRECTION. PLANNING HAS BEGUN TO EXPLORE THE
4 POTENTIAL ISSUES RELATED TO VINEYARDS AND DEFINED THE SCOPE OF
5 OUR STUDY AREAS. WE WERE ALSO IN COMMUNICATION WITH
6 STAKEHOLDERS AGENCIES, INCLUDING NATIONAL PARK SERVICE,
7 ENVIRONMENTAL GROUPS, VINE GROWERS ASSOCIATIONS AND PERMIT
8 APPLICANTS. EARLIER THIS MONTH, THE DEPARTMENT HELD AN INITIAL
9 OUTREACH MEETING WITH A SMALL GROUP OF WINE GROWERS AND
10 APPLICANTS WITH PENDING PROJECTS, WHICH WAS HELPFUL IN
11 UNDERSTANDING THE VITICULTURE HABITS IN THE EXISTING VINEYARDS
12 IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. WITH THAT WE'RE READY FOR
13 FURTHER DIRECTION.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME CALL UP SNOWDY DODSON. DAKOTA
16 SEMLER. MICHAEL FRAWLEY. DENISE GOODEN. JUST GIVE YOUR NAME
17 BEFORE YOU SPEAK.

18

19 **SNOWDY DODSON:** MY NAME IS SNOWDY DODSON. I REPRESENT THE
20 CALIFORNIA NATIVE PLANT SOCIETY, L.A. SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS
21 CHAPTER. I AM HERE TO SPEAK IN FAVOR OF ADOPTING THIS
22 TEMPORARY ORDINANCE TO BAN FURTHER VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT IN
23 THAT AREA. CURRENTLY THE LOCAL COASTAL PLAN PROTECTS THE AREA
24 TO THE SOUTH. AND I THINK THAT PROTECTION SHOULD BE EXTENDED
25 TO THE NORTH AREA. SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS ARE PART OF A LARGE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ECOSYSTEM THAT NEEDS TO BE PROTECTED. COASTAL SAGE SCRUB,
2 CHAPPARAL HABITAT, ALL OF OUR WILDLIFE CORRIDORS. THERE ARE
3 TONS OF NATIVE PLANTS AND TONS OF NATIVE ANIMALS, BIRDS, LARGE
4 MAMMALS, INSECTS, POLLINATORS THAT DEPEND UPON THIS ECOSYSTEM
5 TO SURVIVE. THE OTHER ISSUE IS THE VIEW SHED IN THE SANTA
6 MONICA MOUNTAINS. THAT WAS ONE OF THE THINGS THAT THE LOCAL
7 COASTAL PLAN WAS ADOPTED TO PROTECT SO THAT WHEN WE GO INTO
8 THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, WE DO NOT SEE TONS AND TONS OF
9 VINEYARDS, BUT THAT WE SEE THE NATIVE HABITAT THAT WE ALL
10 VALUE. AGAIN, THIS IS A BIODIVERSITY HOT SPOT. IT'S A VERY,
11 VERY VALUABLE MEDITERRANEAN CLIMATE. AND IF YOU ERADICATE IT,
12 IT'S ALMOST IMPOSSIBLE TO RESTORE IT. SO I HOPE YOU WILL
13 CONSIDER EXTENDING THIS. THIS IS A SHORT TIME. IT'S ONLY 10
14 MONTHS. WHILE WE CAN DO MORE STUDYING AND GIVE MORE INPUT.
15 THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. YES, MA'AM.

18

19 **DENISE GOODEN:** DENISE GOODEN. I'M IN OPPOSITION. BUT CAN I
20 GIVE MY TIME TO JOHN GOODEN TO SPEAK?

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YES. IS HE HERE?

23

24 **DENISE GOODEN:** YES. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** DO YOU WANT TO GIVE IT TO DON OR JOHN?

2

3 **DENISE GOODEN:** JOHN GOODEN.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** I'LL CALL HIM UP AND THEN GIVE HIM
6 YOUR TIME.

7

8 **DENISE GOODEN:** THANKS.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WELL, LET ME CALL UP JOHN GOODEN, AS
11 WELL. AND ALSO PAUL CULBERG. YES, SIR.

12

13 **DAKOTA SEMLER:** MY NAME IS DAKOTA SEMLER. I'M SPEAKING TO
14 OPPOSE THE MOTION TO CONTINUE THE MORATORIUM ON VINEYARD
15 INSTALLATIONS IN THE NORTH AREA PLAN. SPEAKING FROM
16 EXPERIENCE, WE ARE A GROWER, AN EXISTING GROWER WITHIN THE
17 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, AND WE HAVE A TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF
18 EXPERIENCE IN DEVELOPING NEW VINEYARD INSTALLATIONS THROUGHOUT
19 THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS BUT ALSO THROUGHOUT CALIFORNIA. ONE
20 OF THE THINGS THAT WE'VE DONE SINCE THE INITIAL VINEYARD
21 OUTREACH MEETING IS PROVIDE THE SUPERVISORS' DEPARTMENTS AND
22 ALSO SOME OF THE KEY PEOPLE WORKING ON THIS PROGRAM WITH SOME
23 INFORMATION FOR SUSTAINABILITY MANAGEMENT AND THE PRACTICES
24 THAT WE UTILIZE WITHIN OUR OWN VINEYARD, WHICH IS KIND OF
25 ADVISE THEM, I THINK, ON HOW MUCH OF STEWARDS OF THE LAND THAT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WE ARE AS MALIBU GROWERS, KIND OF WITHIN THE MALIBU COASTAL
2 A.V.A. WE SUBMITTED SEVERAL THINGS FOR THEIR CONSIDERATION.
3 ONE OF THEM WAS THE INTEGRATED PEST MANAGEMENT PLAN, WHICH IS
4 HOW MINIMAL THE IMPACT OF VINEYARDS ARE ON THE LOCAL HABITATS
5 WITHIN BOTH THE LOCAL COASTAL AREA BUT ALSO IN THE NORTH AREA
6 PLAN. THE OTHER THING I KNOW THAT SUPERVISOR KUEHL'S CONCERN
7 WAS WE HAD SOME WATER CONCERNS BOTH IN WATER USAGE BUT ALSO IN
8 RUNOFF AND THE POTENTIAL IMPACT ON THE WATERSHEDS WITHIN THE
9 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAIN AREAS. I THINK SOME OF THE INFORMATION
10 THAT WE PROVIDED WAS TO SHOW THAT VINEYARDS ACTUALLY HAVE LESS
11 OF AN IMPACT THAN ANY OF THE OTHER TYPES OF AGRICULTURE THAT
12 ARE ALLOWED WITHIN THOSE TWO PLANS. AND WE REALLY TRIED TO
13 SHOW THE COUNTY AND SHOW THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING
14 THAT WE'RE ONE OF THE LEAST IMPACTFUL USES WITHIN THE SANTA
15 MONICA MOUNTAINS. I UNDERSTAND THAT WATER USAGE IS STILL A
16 CONCERN, BUT, AGAIN, WE'VE TRIED TO REALLY INFORM THE COUNTY
17 ON HOW WATER IS UTILIZED WITHIN OUR VINEYARDS.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. YES, SIR. YES.

20

21 **MIKE FRAWLEY:** MY NAME IS MIKE FRAWLEY. I'M THE PRESIDENT OF
22 THE TRIUNFO LOBO COMMUNITY ASSOCIATION. THE ASSOCIATION'S
23 VOTED IN OPPOSITION OF THE EXTENSION OF THE MORATORIUM ON THE
24 BASIS THAT THE PEOPLE WHO HAVE APPLIED, BOUGHT THE PROPERTY
25 AND APPLIED TO PUT A VINEYARD ON THEIR PROPERTY DID SO ON THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BASIS THAT THAT WAS AN ALLOWED USE. AND IF THE COUNTY DECIDES
2 TO CHANGE THE ALLOWED USE, THEN THEY HAVE TO GIVE NOTICE. THE
3 PEOPLE WHO HAVE PUT IN THEIR PERMITS SHOULD BE GRANDFATHERED
4 IN, ALLOWED TO GO FORWARD. I ASK THAT THE ASSOCIATION BE
5 CONTACTED AS SOON AS POSSIBLE, POSSIBLY BY TIM LITMAN,
6 SUPERVISOR KUEHL'S AREA REPRESENTATIVE, SO HE CAN CONTACT US
7 AND TALK ABOUT THE CONCERNS. THANK YOU.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** ONE SECOND. LET ME ALSO CALL UP PAUL
10 CULBERG. PAUL, YOU'RE HERE? DAVID VALDEZ. LEAH CULBERG.

11

12 **JOHN GOODEN:** HI, GOOD MORNING. JOHN GOODEN, PRESIDENT OF THE
13 MALIBU COAST VINTNERS AND GRAPE GROWERS ALLIANCE. I'M HERE
14 TODAY TO REQUEST THAT YOU VOTE NO ON EXTENDING THE URGENCY
15 ORDINANCE. THE ORDINANCE SERVES NO USEFUL PURPOSE. IT
16 DISCRIMINATES AGAINST A CLASS OF L.A. COUNTY TAX-PAYING
17 FAMILIES WHO WANT TO DO NOTHING MORE THAN USE THEIR AG1 LAND
18 FOR AGRICULTURE. OVER THE LAST 2-1/2 WEEKS, I HAVE MET ON
19 MULTIPLE OCCASIONS WITH SUPERVISOR KUEHL'S STAFF, HER DEPUTY
20 PLANNER AND THE REGIONAL PLANNER TRYING TO UNDERSTAND WHAT
21 MOTIVATED THIS URGENCY ORDINANCE. IT BECAME CLEAR THAT AN
22 INCREASE IN THE NEW VINEYARD APPLICATIONS WAS DIRECTLY RELATED
23 TO THE MEETING BETWEEN THE L.A. COUNTY PLANNING DEPARTMENT AND
24 THE TRIUNFO LOBO CANYON HOMEOWNERS' ASSOCIATION THAT WAS BACK
25 IN JUNE OF 2014 TO EXPLAIN THE NEW S.E.A. RULES THAT WERE TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BE FORTHCOMING. THE PLANNERS SUGGESTED TO THE HOMEOWNERS THAT
2 IF THEY WERE PLANNING TO PLANT A VINEYARD, THEY SHOULD DO SO
3 BEFORE THE NEW RULES WERE ADOPTED. VIRTUALLY ALL OF THE NEW
4 VINEYARD APPLICATIONS WERE LOCALIZED IN THOSE TWO CANYONS.
5 WHEN I POINTED THIS OUT TO THE SUPERVISOR'S STAFF AND WE
6 SUGGESTED AN ORDINANCE MODIFICATION TO ALLOW VINEYARD
7 APPLICATIONS OF 5 ACRES OR LESS TO CONTINUE TO BE PROCESSED,
8 THE STAFF PRESENTED THE IDEA TO SUPERVISOR KUEHL, BUT THE
9 COMPROMISE WAS REJECTED. IT IS CLEAR THAT THIS ORDINANCE IS
10 NOT ABOUT THE CALIFORNIA DROUGHT, AS VINEYARDS ARE DROUGHT-
11 TOLERANT PLANTS. IT IS NOT ABOUT WATER QUALITY OR RUNOFF AS
12 ALL VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS ARE DRIP IRRIGATED
13 AND CREATE NO RUNOFF AND ACTUALLY STABILIZE HILLSIDES WITH
14 THEIR EXTENSIVE ROOT SYSTEMS. IF YOU ALLOW THE ORDINANCE TO
15 CONTINUE ON NEW VINEYARD APPLICATIONS, YOU'LL NEED TO ASK
16 YOURSELF: HOW WILL THE PLANNING DEPARTMENT APPLY THESE
17 RESTRICTIONS IN YOUR DISTRICT? SUPERVISOR KNABE, SUPERVISOR
18 SOLIS AND SUPERVISOR ANTONOVICH ALL HAVE VINEYARDS IN THEIR
19 DISTRICT. HOW WILL YOU EXPLAIN THIS DISCRIMINATORY ORDINANCE
20 TO YOUR VOTERS? IF YOU ALLOW AVOCADOS OR LEMONS, WHICH USE
21 SIGNIFICANTLY MORE WATER, THEN WHEN WILL THIS STOP? WHAT WILL
22 WE BAN NEXT? SO IN CLOSING, I ASK THAT YOU PLEASE VOTE NO TO
23 EXTEND THE URGENCY ORDINANCE AND ALLOW THE 200-YEAR TRADITION
24 THAT EXISTS IN LOS ANGELES COUNTY OF GRAPE GROWING TO
25 CONTINUE. THANK YOU.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. YES, SIR.

3

4 **PAUL CULBERG:** MY NAME IS PAUL CULBERG AND I LIVE IN LOBO
5 CANYON AND I STRONGLY SUPPORT EXTENDING THE ORDINANCE
6 PROHIBITING THE EXPANSION OF VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA
7 MOUNTAINS AND URGE THE BOARD TO TAKE MOST SERIOUSLY THE
8 CRITICAL DEPLETION OF RESOURCES RESULTING FROM THE EXPANSION
9 OF VINEYARDS AS WELL AS THE HARM CAUSED BY THE GROWTH OF
10 UNRESTRICTED AGRICULTURE IN OUR REELING WATERSHED. MY HOME IS
11 ON A WELL, HAS BEEN FOR 40 YEARS, WHICH IS OUR ONLY SOURCE OF
12 WATER. IN THE YEAR 2013/'14, OUR WATER TABLE DROPPED MORE THAN
13 100 FEET, WHICH IS UNPRECEDENTED. THE NUMBER FAR EXCEEDS ANY I
14 HAVE SEEN FOR DROUGHT-STRESSED CENTRAL CALIFORNIA AS REPORTED
15 IN THE L.A. TIMES. THE VINEYARDS SURROUNDING US HAVE DAMMED
16 WATERWAYS, SUNK 1,000 FEET WELLS TO ACCESS CHEAP WATER FOR
17 THEIR VINES AND IN SO DOING, HAVE SUCKED UP THE GROUND WATER,
18 THE AQUIFER AND THE CREEKS MAKING THE RIPARIAN WOODLAND AND
19 THE CHAPARRAL EVER DRIER, CREATING A MORE FLAMMABLE
20 ENVIRONMENT AND LEAVING US WITH EVEN LESS WATER WITH WHICH TO
21 FIGHT A FIRE WHEN IT COMES. WE WROTE THE NORTH AREA PLAN ACT--
22 WHEN WE WROTE THE NORTH AREA PLAN, AGRICULTURE WASN'T EVEN
23 CONSIDERED AS PART OF THE FUTURE OF OUR COMMUNITY. WE THOUGHT
24 THE PLAN'S PROMISE WOULD GUARANTEE THAT THE MOUNTAINS WOULD
25 REMAIN A RURAL MOUNTAIN COMMUNITY AS THE SANTA MONICA

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MOUNTAINS RECREATION AREA HAS IDENTIFIED AND NOT A RURAL
2 FARMING COMMUNITY. PLEASE STOP THIS WHOLESale DESTRUCTION OF
3 OUR WATERSHED BY VOTING FOR THIS EXTENSION. THANK YOU.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
6 LEAH CULBERG.

7

8 **PAUL CULBERG:** I WILL SUBMIT THIS FOR THE RECORD.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THE SERGEANT WILL TAKE IT. LEAH AND--
11 OH, YOU'RE HERE. AND ALSO PHILIP CAVANAUGH? AND LIZ BARRETT.
12 YES, MA'AM. YES, MA'AM. LEAH?

13

14 **LEAH CULBERG:** YEAH, OKAY. GOOD MORNING, HONORABLE SUPERVISORS.
15 MY NAME IS LEAH CULBERG AND ON BEHALF OF THE LAS VIRGINES
16 HOMEOWNERS' FEDERATION AND OUR 10,000-STRONG RESIDENTS IN THE
17 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, WE UNEQUIVOCALLY SUPPORT REGIONAL
18 PLANNING'S RECOMMENDATION TO EXTEND THE INTERIM ORDINANCE. IT
19 IS CRITICAL TO ENABLE AND GIVE THE COUNTY ENOUGH TIME TO
20 RESEARCH, ANALYZE AND MAKE ACCURATE DETERMINATIONS AND
21 RECOMMENDATIONS, INCLUDING THE POTENTIAL ZONING AMENDMENT TO
22 MITIGATE THE DESTRUCTIVE AND UNDESIRABLE IMPACTS THIS
23 UNPRECEDENTED FLURRY OF NEW AND EXPANDED VINEYARD APPLICATIONS
24 WILL CAUSE. IT IS SMART PLANNING TO BE CAUTIOUS AND ENSURE
25 LOOPHOLES ARE PLUGGED AND BEST MANAGEMENT PRACTICES

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 IMPLEMENTED SO THAT OUR PROPERTY VALUES AND RESOURCE VALUES
2 WHICH GO HAND-IN-HAND ARE NOT NEGATIVELY IMPACTED. THE FLOOD
3 OF CURRENT VINEYARD APPLICATIONS RAISES MAJOR RED FLAGS
4 RELATED TO WATER SUPPLY, WATER QUALITY AND LAND USE
5 COMPATIBILITY. VINEYARDS REQUIRE THE REMOVAL OF NATURAL
6 HABITAT WITH EXTENSIVE GRADING DUE TO STEEP SLOPES, OFTENTIMES
7 TO INCREASING RUNOFF, EROSION AND SEDIMENTATION AND CAUSING
8 PESTICIDES AND FERTILIZERS TO INFILTRATE WATERWAYS. THE SANTA
9 MONICA MOUNTAINS ARE A SPECTACULAR WORLD RENOWNED NATURAL
10 RESOURCE. THE CUMULATIVE EFFECT OF VINEYARDS NOT ONLY IMPAIRS
11 FRAGILE WATERSHEDS BUT HARMFULLY IMPACTS THE PUBLIC'S SCENIC
12 RESOURCES, DENUDING HILLSIDES AND RIDGELINES, ERADICATING
13 NATIVE HABITAT, IRREPARABLY DAMAGING AND TRANSFORMING THE TRUE
14 CHARACTER OF THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. AS A MATTER OF FACT,
15 FOR A PORTION OF THE YEAR, VINEYARDS ARE DEAD. NOTHING BUT
16 THIS BARREN AND BROWN DIRT AND WOODEN STAKES. THIS DECREASES
17 HOMEOWNER PROPERTY VALUES AND OUR NATURAL RESOURCE VALUES.
18 VINEYARDS ALSO FRAGMENT OUR ENVIRONMENT AND BLOCK AND INHIBIT
19 WILDLIFE CORRIDORS. UNLESS THE INTERIM ORDINANCE--

20
21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, LEAH. YES, SIR.

22
23 **DAVID VALDEZ:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS DAVID VALDEZ, AND I
24 OPPOSE THE EXTENSION ON THE BAN ON NEW VINEYARD APPLICATIONS
25 IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. 11 YEARS AGO MY WIFE AND I

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PLANTED A SMALL VINEYARD IN THE CITY OF MALIBU. AND I AM HERE
2 TO TELL YOU THAT A VINEYARD SAY LABOR OF LOVE AND IT OFFERS
3 MANY, MANY SATISFACTIONS. IT IS THE ENJOYMENT OF THE OUTDOORS,
4 THE COMMUNITY WITH NATURE AND THE JOY OF NURTURING PLANTS AND
5 SEEING THEM YIELD THEIR BOUNTY. I OPPOSE THE EXTENSION OF THE
6 BAN ON VINEYARDS AS IT WILL LIMIT SMALL FAMILY FARMERS LIKE
7 MYSELF THESE SATISFACTIONS. TWO WEEKS AGO, THE MALIBU COAST
8 VINTNERS IN AND GRAPE GROWERS ALLIANCE, OF WHICH I AM A
9 MEMBER, POSTED A PETITION ONLINE AT CHANGE.ORG ASKING FOR
10 PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. I
11 WOULD LIKE TO READ IT FOR THE RECORD. IT SAYS, "PROTECT
12 VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA PLAN." AND
13 IT READS "VINEYARDS ARE PART OF A LONG HISTORY OF THE SANTA
14 MONICA MOUNTAINS DATING BACK ALMOST 200 YEARS. GRAPE VINES ARE
15 THE MOST ECOFRIENDLY FORM OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT FOR THE
16 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS AND THE SANTA MONICA RECREATIONAL AREA.
17 LET THE SUPERVISORS KNOW THAT YOU SUPPORT VINEYARDS AND ENJOY
18 THE RURAL CHARACTER AND BEAUTY OF VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA
19 MONICA MOUNTAINS. AS OF THIS MORNING, IN TWO WEEKS, WE HAVE
20 COLLECTED 692 SIGNATURES FOR THIS PROPOSAL, FOR THIS PETITION
21 AS WELL AS AN ADDITIONAL 61 SIGNATURES AT LOCAL TASTING ROOMS.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR.

24

25 **PHILIP CAVANAGH:** CAN I GIVE MY TWO MINUTES?

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WHAT IS YOUR NAME?

3

4 **PHILIP CAVANAGH:** PHILIP CAVANAUGH.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. GO ON, MR. VALDEZ.

7

8 **DAVID VALDEZ:** I WOULD LIKE TO ENTER INTO THIS HEARING'S RECORD

9 A LIST OF THE ALMOST 750 PEOPLE WHO REPRESENT WIDE, PUBLIC

10 SUPPORT FOR SUSTAINABLE, ECOLOGICALLY SENSITIVE VINEYARDS IN

11 THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, WHICH PROVIDES SCENIC ENJOYMENT

12 AND RECREATIONAL OPPORTUNITIES TO THIS COUNTY'S RESIDENTS.

13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. RUTH GOMEZ? DAVID GOMEZ.

16 DAN FREDMAN. OKAY.

17

18 **LIZ BARRETT:** MY NAME IS LIZ BARRETT AND I WANT THE GIVE MY

19 TIME TO ISABEL KARST.

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** TO ISABEL?

22

23 **LIZ BARRETT:** ISABEL.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** ISABEL, ARE YOU HERE? OKAY. COME UP.

2 EITHER ONE CAN GO FIRST. WHOEVER WANTS TO.

3

4 **RUTH GOMEZ:** I'M RUTH GOMEZ. WE HAVE A SMALL ALPACA FARM WITH A
5 SMALL, ORGANIC DRIP- IRRIGATED VINEYARD WITH NO RUNOFF OR
6 FERTILIZERS IN AN AGRICULTURALLY ZONED AREA IN THE SANTA
7 MONICA MOUNTAINS WITH NO WELL. AND I WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT
8 FOR THE RECORD THAT THERE IS ABSOLUTELY NO AQUIFER IN THE
9 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. [APPLAUSE.] WATER ONLY-- WE WATER ONLY
10 WHEN THE BERRIES ARE ON THE VINES, WHICH IS APPROXIMATELY
11 THREE MONTHS OUT OF 12. OUR GRAPES USE APPROXIMATELY 70
12 PERCENT LESS WATER THAN AVOCADOS. IT TAKES 58 GALLONS OF WATER
13 TO MAKE A GALLON OF WINE. AND IT TAKES 220 GALLONS OF WATER
14 FOR EVERY AVOCADO YOU EAT. OUR WINES ARE PRODUCED IN A
15 LICENSED, CUSTOM-CRUSH WINERY AND STORED IN A LICENSED
16 FACILITY. WE FEEL WE ARE BEING DISCRIMINANTLY DEPRIVED OF THE
17 RIGHT TO USE OUR PROPERTY. AND WE URGE YOU TO VOTE NO ON THIS
18 ORDINANCE.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM.

21

22 **RUTH GOMEZ:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, SIR.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **DAVID GOMEZ:** I'M DAVID GOMEZ, HER HUSBAND. WE HAVE THAT SAME
2 SMALL VINEYARD IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. I'M ALSO HERE
3 SPEAKING IN OPPOSITION TO THIS ORDINANCE. MY FAMILY CAME TO
4 THE SAN FERNANDO VALLEY IN ABOUT 1910. MY FATHER AND I WERE
5 BOTH BORN IN THE SAN FERNANDO HOSPITAL, MY DAUGHTER IN THE
6 NORTHRIDGE HOSPITAL. AND MY GRANDCHILDREN AT THE U.C.L.A.
7 MEDICAL CENTER. WE'VE BEEN IN THIS STATE AND IN LOS ANGELES
8 COUNTY FOR QUITE A LONG TIME. WE HAVE A VERY SMALL VINEYARD ON
9 OUR PROPERTY. IT COMPOSES PROBABLY AN EIGHTH OF THE AREA OF
10 THE PROPERTY. IT'S NESTLED NICELY INTO THE SURROUNDING
11 CHAPARRAL. IT LOOKS REALLY NICE WITH THAT CHAPARRAL
12 SURROUNDING IT. I'M REALLY CONCERNED WITH THE PREJUDICIAL
13 TREATMENT OF VINES, GROWING VINES IN THE AGRICULTURAL AREA, IN
14 THE NORTH AREA. IT SEEMS LIKE VINES ARE BEING SINGLED OUT FROM
15 ALL OTHER AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTS. AN ANALOGY MIGHT BE LIKE
16 VINES ARE THE GAY FRUIT IN THE AGRICULTURE GROUP OR BLACK
17 FRUIT, I DON'T KNOW. BUT CERTAINLY THIS ORDINANCE IS DESIGNED
18 TO STOP ANYMORE VINES FROM MOVING INTO THE SANTA MONICA
19 MOUNTAIN NEIGHBORHOOD AND I'D LIKE TO PUT AN END TO THAT IF
20 POSSIBLE. THANK YOU.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MR. GOMEZ. LET ME ALSO CALL
23 UP GREGORY BARNETT? GREGORY BARNETT. YES, MA'AM. AND YOU ARE
24 GIVEN THE OTHER TWO MINUTES BY THE PREVIOUS SPEAKER. YES,
25 MA'AM.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **ISABEL KARST:** MY NAME IS ISABEL KARST AND I'M OPPOSING THE
3 EXTENSION OF THE BAN ON VINEYARDS. I RECENTLY GRADUATED FROM
4 SONOMA STATE UNIVERSITY WHERE STUDIED WINE BUSINESS
5 STRATEGIES. WE LEARNED NOT ONLY ABOUT THE POSITIVE ECONOMICAL
6 IMPACTS ON THE COMMUNITY THAT THE WINE BUSINESS CAN HAVE, BUT
7 ALSO ON HOW FARMING AND THE WHOLE LAND CAN INTERACT PEACEFULLY
8 WITH THE BUSINESS SIDE OF IT. IN TERMS OF THE WATER USAGE, THE
9 AMOUNT OF LANDS THAT HAVE BEEN APPLIED FOR HAS BEEN EXTREMELY
10 MINIMAL, 270 ACRES. THIS IS AROUND 1.3 PERCENT OF THE 21,000
11 ACRES IN THE NORTH AREA PLAN. THIS IS A REALLY MINIMAL
12 PORTION. AND IT SHOULD NOT BE SO HEAVILY FOCUSED ON. GRAPE
13 VINES ARE EXTREMELY DROUGHT TOLERANT. THIS CAN BE SEEN IN
14 REGIONS AROUND THE WORLD AS PORTUGAL AND SPAIN. THEY ARE
15 LEGALLY NOT EVEN ALLOWED TO BE IRRIGATED. THEY USE VIRTUALLY
16 NO WATER THE GRAPE VINES IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS ALL USE
17 DRIP IRRIGATION WHICH PINPOINTS THE WATER DELIVERY. THERE IS
18 NO EVAPORATION WASTE AND THERE IS NO RUNOFF. THIS IRRIGATION
19 OCCURS ONLY 1 TO 4 TIMES PER MONTH, THREE TO FIVE MONTHS PER
20 YEAR. THE GRAPE VINES THRIVE UNDER DURESS. IT'S THE PERFECT
21 CROP FOR THE DROUGHT-IMPACTED CALIFORNIA. WHEN GRAPES ARE
22 STRESSED OUT, NUTRIENTS ARE DIRECTED TO THE GRAPES, NOT THE
23 LEAVES, RESULTING IN BETTER QUALITY FRUIT. TO COMPARE THIS TO
24 OTHER THINGS THAT HAVE RECENTLY PASSED, IN THE WEEK OF JUNE
25 26TH ALONE THERE WERE OVER 6 PERMITS ISSUED. THE AVERAGE POOL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 IN L.A. COUNTY HOLDS 20,000 GALLONS OF WATER AND LOSES AROUND
2 1,000 GALLONS OF WATER PER MONTH. IT'S EASY TO SEE THAT POOLS
3 USE MUCH MORE WATER THAN THE GRAPE VINES, AND YET THEY HAVE
4 BEEN APPROVED RECENTLY. GRAPE VINES ARE ALSO BENEFICIAL TO OUR
5 SURROUNDINGS THAT WE LIVE IN. THEY OFFER HILLSIDE SOIL
6 PROTECTION IN A COUPLE OF WAYS. THE SHALLOW ROOTS HOLD TOPSOIL
7 IN PLACE DURING THE INTENSE RAIN AND WIND, WHICH WE OFTEN
8 EXPERIENCE. THE DEEP ROOTS HOLD HILLSIDES TOGETHER BELOW THE
9 TOPSOIL. THEY ARE ALSO NATURAL FIRE BREAKS. WITH THE
10 INCREASING DROUGHT CONDITIONS, FIRES WILL BECOME MORE
11 PREVALENT IN OUR DRY, FLAMMABLE CHAPARRAL AREA. THE GRAPE
12 VINES ARE NATURAL FIRE BREAKS, DUE TO THE LOW AMOUNT OF OILS
13 THAT ARE FOUND IN THE LEAVES AND BRANCHES. ORDERLY VINE ROWS
14 OFFER LESS FUEL THAN CHAPARRAL BRUSH COVERED HILLSIDES AND MAY
15 PROHIBIT THE LOSS OF MANY PROPERTIES IN THE SANTA MONICA
16 MOUNTAINS AND PREVENT SPREADING TO THE MORE INHABITED AREAS
17 ALONG PACIFIC COAST HIGHWAY. VINEYARDS ALSO HELP THE ECONOMY.
18 THEY CREATE JOBS NOT ONLY FOR FARMERS, VINEYARD WORKERS,
19 NURSERIES, HARDWARE STORES AND THE SURROUNDING AREA BUT THEY
20 ALSO INCREASE PROPERTY TAXES. VINEYARDS ADD VALUE TO PROPERTY
21 AND INCREASE PROPERTY TAX REVENUE WHICH GOES DIRECTLY INTO OUR
22 LOCAL ECONOMY. AND SO VINEYARDS ARE THE MOST ECOFRIENDLY FORM
23 OF AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT FOR THE NORTH AREA PLAN. THEY ARE
24 SUSTAINABLE AND LOW IMPACT. THEY HAVE MINIMAL IMPACT ON THE
25 COUNTY WATER USAGE. THEY ARE NATURAL FIRE BREAKS AND THEY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ATTRACT VISITORS TO THE SANTA MONICA RECREATION AREA AND WILL
2 GENERATE REVENUE FOR THE COUNTY. AND I GUESS THAT'S IT.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. LET ME ALSO CALL
5 UP JOHN KISH. JOHN KISH? AND STEVEN GILBARD? YES, SIR.

6

7 **DAN FREDMAN:** MY NAME IS DAN FREDMAN WITH THE MALIBU COAST
8 VINTNERS IN AND GRAPE GROWERS ALLIANCE. WE'VE HEARD THE WORDS
9 BEST FARMING PRACTICES TODAY. WE ARE ALREADY DOING THAT.
10 VIRTUALLY EVERYBODY IN THE AREA IS ALREADY FARMING SUSTAINABLY
11 ACCORDING TO THE DIRECTIONS GIVEN BY THE WINE INSTITUTE'S
12 SUSTAINABILITY PROGRAM. A NUMBER OF US ARE CERTIFIED. WE ALL
13 WORK WITH THE WORKBOOKS TO MAKE SURE THAT OUR BIODIVERSITY AND
14 IMPACT ON BIODIVERSITY IS AT THE MAXIMUM AND OUR IMPACT ON THE
15 ENVIRONMENT IS AT THE MINIMUM. WE'VE REALLY ENJOYED THE
16 OPPORTUNITY OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF WEEKS TO BE WORKING WITH
17 NICOLE ENGLAND FROM SUPERVISOR KUEHL'S OFFICE, WITH ANITA
18 GUTIERREZ FROM THE REGIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION. THERE'S BEEN
19 A LOT OF EDUCATION GOING BACK AND FORTH HERE. I AM AN
20 EDUCATOR, BEEN A WINE EDUCATOR FOR A LONG TIME AND IT'S GREAT
21 FINDING PEOPLE WILLING TO LEARN. WE HAVIE UNCOVERED A
22 TREMENDOUS AMOUNT OF INFORMATION. IT'S AN ONGOING PROJECT AND
23 WE'RE VERY APPRECIATIVE OF BEING INVOLVED IN THIS, REGARDLESS
24 OF THE RESULT OF THE VOTE TODAY. WE WANT TO CONTINUE TO BE
25 VERY MUCH A PART OF IT. ONE OF OUR CONCERNS THAT WE'VE SORT OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 COME UP WITH AND IN MY PHONE CALLS, EVEN THOUGH THIS MEASURE
2 IS FOCUSED ON THE THIRD DISTRICT, I'VE BEEN TALKING TO PEOPLE
3 WITH VINEYARDS ON SANTA CATALINA ISLAND, I'VE BEEN SPEAKING TO
4 PEOPLE OUT IN POMONA AND THE AND ANTELOPE VALLEY WINERY
5 ASSOCIATION HAS BEEN VERY SUPPORTIVE OF US. YOU SHOULD
6 PROBABLY SEE SOME OF THE LETTERS THAT THEY'VE WRITTEN IN THE
7 LAST FEW DAYS. THEY ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE RAMIFICATIONS OF
8 THIS ON THEIR POTENTIAL TO INCREASE WHAT THEY'RE DOING AND
9 IMPROVE WHAT THEY'RE DOING BECAUSE THE MORE VINEYARDS THAT ARE
10 OUT THERE, WITHIN REASON, THE MORE KNOWLEDGE THAT IS SHARED,
11 AND THE BETTER THE FARMING GETS IN TERMS OF HIGHER QUALITY AND
12 LOWER IMPACT ON THE ENVIRONMENT. THAT'S WHY I'M URGING YOU TO
13 VOTE NO ON THIS AND TO NOT EXTEND IT. IT'S AN UNNECESSARY BILL
14 AT THIS POINT UNDER THIS MEASURE.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
17 ANUSHKA GOKHALE AND KATHERINE PEASE? YES, SIR.

18

19 **GREG BARNETT:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS GREG BARNETT AND I LIVE
20 IN WOODLAND HILLS IN THE SAN FERNANDO VALLEY AND A LOCAL WINE
21 PRODUCER OF MALIBU COAST WINES SINCE 2012. I'VE GROWN UP WITH
22 THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS, ENJOYED THEM MY WHOLE LIFE AND NOW
23 I'M PROUD TO SAY THAT I'M PRODUCING WINE IN THE LOCAL WINE
24 COUNTRY. I UNDERSTAND THAT OUR PRIMARY CONCERN IS WATER USAGE,
25 BUT WE ALL NEED TO UNDERSTAND THAT OUR INDUSTRY IS THE MOST

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WATER CONSCIOUS OF ALL, AND VINES ARE VERY DROUGHT RESISTANT.
2 AND IT'S ACTUALLY BETTER FOR US TO STRESS THE VINE TO PRODUCE
3 BETTER FRUIT. ALL OUR WATERING HAPPENS, IF AT ALL, THROUGH
4 DRIP IRRIGATION. AND THERE IS NO RUNOFF. AND IT GOES DIRECTLY
5 INTO THE ROOTS. I AM ALSO CONCERNED THAT THE VINEYARDS WOULD
6 BE PLANTED EVERYWHERE, BUT THAT IS JUST NOT POSSIBLE WITH THE
7 TERRAIN THAT'S AVAILABLE TO US. AND MOST PEOPLE ARE PLANNING 1
8 TO 5 ACRES OR LESS, IF THAT, ON THEIR PROPERTY. I'M HERE TO
9 VOICE MY OPINION FOR YOU TO VOTE NO ON ITEM 4 REGARDING THE
10 BANNING OF VINEYARDS AND EXTENSION OF EXISTING NORTH SANTA
11 MONICA MOUNTAINS AND I WOULD ASK YOU TO ALLOW US TO CONTINUE
12 TO GROW RESPONSIBLY AND SUSTAINABLY AND PRODUCE AWARD-WINNING
13 WINES THAT WE ARE VERY PROUD OF IN THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY.
14 THANK YOU.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP BILL
17 HAYES. YES, SIR.

18

19 **JOHN KISH:** MY NAME IS JOHN KISH AND I'M A VINEYARD MANAGER FOR
20 THE LAST 10 YEARS AT A VINEYARD IN HIDDEN VALLEY, CALIFORNIA.
21 WHAT I'VE NOTICED THE LAST 10 YEARS WITH THE VINEYARD IS,
22 BARELY USE THAT MUCH WATER AT ALL. IT'S ALL DRIP IRRIGATION.
23 THERE IS NO RUNOFF. IT'S A GREAT FIRE BREAK. WHEN WE HAD THE
24 LAST FIRE COME THROUGH HIDDEN VALLEY, YOU KNOW, I BROUGHT ALL
25 MY STUFF UP TO THE VINEYARD BECAUSE I KNEW IT WAS GOING TO BE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SAFE THERE. I BROUGHT MY DOGS UP THERE. AND THE FIRE
2 DEPARTMENT, THEY HAD ME COME OUT AND CLEAR LIKE 100 FEET OF
3 ALL THE CHAPARRAL ON THE WHOLE PROPERTY, YOU KNOW. AND WHEN
4 THEY CAME UP AND THEY SAW THE VINEYARD, THEY LOVED THAT I
5 CLEARED ALL THAT LAND SO WE DIDN'T HAVE ALL THAT DRY, DRY
6 CHAPARRAL FOR THE FIRES. WE DON'T USE ANY PESTICIDES. I MEAN,
7 WHENEVER THE BIRDS AND THE INSECTS, THEY LOVE THE VINEYARD
8 BECAUSE THEY TAX ME EACH YEAR. SO WHEN THE BRICKS ARE UP THERE
9 AND THE SUGAR LEVELS ARE HIGH, YOU KNOW, THEY'RE ALL, THE BEES
10 LOVE THE VINEYARDS, THE BIRDS LOVE THE VINEYARDS. IF ANYTHING,
11 I'LL USE A NET JUST TO TRY TO KEEP THE BEES AND THE BIRDS OUT
12 OF THE VINEYARD. THAT'S WHEN I KNOW IT'S TIME TO PICK. SO I'M
13 HERE TO OPPOSE ON NUMBER 4. THANK YOU FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU.

16

17 **STEVE GILBARD:** GOOD AFTERNOON. GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS STEVE
18 GILBARD, AND MY FAMILY AND I HAVE LIVED ON TRIUNFO CANYON ROAD
19 FOR 24 YEARS. WE BOUGHT THE PROPERTY BECAUSE IT WAS ZONED
20 AGRICULTURAL. I'VE TESTIFIED HERE MANY TIMES BEFORE. I WAS A
21 SUPPORTER OF THE NORTH AREA PLAN OF THE HILLSIDE ORDINANCE
22 PLAN. THIS TIME I HAVE TO TELL YOU I IMPORE YOU TO PLEASE DO
23 NOT PASS THIS EXTENSION. THE EXTENSION BASICALLY IS
24 DISCRIMINATING AGAINST THE HOMEOWNERS AND THE FARMERS WITHOUT
25 SCIENTIFIC FACT AND TAKES RIGHTS AWAY FROM THE PROPERTY OWNERS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THAT HAVE BEEN GRANTED BY THE LAWS OF LOS ANGELES COUNTY FOR
2 MANY YEARS. WE'RE 100 PERCENT ORGANIC. WE HAVE WELLS ON THE
3 PROPERTY. WE DO NOT USE THEM FOR THE VINES. WE USE ONLY
4 MUNICIPAL WATER FOR THE VINES. I'VE HAD AN APPLICATION THAT
5 WAS SUBMITTED THIS YEAR, AND IT WAS STOPPED FROM BEING GRANTED
6 ON JUNE 11TH. I WAS NOTIFIED BY MAIL ON JUNE 11TH, ONE DAY
7 BEFORE THIS ORIGINAL URGENCY ORDINANCE WAS PRESENTED FOR THE
8 AGENDA. AND THEN A WEEK AFTERWARDS WHEN I SENT MY
9 REPRESENTATIVES DOWN, THEY WERE TOLD BY COUNTY DEPARTMENT OF
10 REGIONAL PLANNING STAFF THAT IN FACT THAT MY APPLICATION WAS
11 COMPLETE BUT THEY COULD DO NOTHING ABOUT IT, I WAS NOW
12 BLOCKED. MY FAMILY AND I SPENT OVER \$25,000 IN THE LAST YEAR
13 ALONE JUST TO GET THIS APPLICATION PERFECTED TO TAKE CARE OF
14 ALL OF THE PERMIT NEEDS, TO TAKE CARE OF ALL THE PAPERWORK
15 THAT'S REQUIRED TO DO THE STUDIES AND THE SURVEYS. WE'RE
16 ASKING TO ENLARGE OUR VINEYARD BY ABOUT 1.2 ACRES. I HAVE AN
17 8.25-ACRE PARCEL. MY TOTAL ACREAGE WOULD BE ABOUT 2 ACRES. AND
18 YET IF YOU LOOK ON THE LIST THAT WAS PRESENTED WHICH I'LL
19 SUBMIT LATER, AS A F.A.Q. SHEET FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF
20 REGIONAL PLANNING LAST THURSDAY, I BELIEVE, THEY SENT IT OUT
21 TO US, THERE IS NO 1.2 OR EVEN 2-ACRE. THE SMALLEST PROJECT IS
22 7.8. SO THEY'RE ACTUALLY COUNTING MY ENTIRE PROJECT IN THE
23 COUNT OF THIS 270 ACRES. WHAT WE HAVE GOING ON RIGHT NOW IS
24 THE NUMBERS ARE BEING MANIPULATED TO MAKE US LOOK LIKE WE'RE
25 TAKING OVER. I JUST BASICALLY TELL YOU THAT THIS IS A VERY BAD

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AND VERY ILL-DEFINED REGULATION. WHAT WE NEED TO DO IS WORK
2 WITH COUNTY STAFF TO MAKE A LONG-TERM, SUSTAINABLE PLAN FOR
3 THE REGION, BUT WE CAN'T DO IT BY THESE SORT OF MEASURES WHERE
4 THEY SIMPLY CUT US OFF. THANK YOU.

5

6 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
7 ISABEL KARST. YES, MA'AM.

8

9 **ANUSHKA GOKHALE:** HI, I'D LIKE TO GIVE MY TIME TO JOHN GOODEN,
10 PLEASE?

11

12 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** JOHN GOODEN? OKAY, JOHN. YOU CAN DO
13 THAT. JOHN, YOU CAN COME UP AND THE REST OF YOU WILL BE
14 SPEAKING, OKAY. THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

15

16 **KATHERINE PEASE:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS. MY NAME IS
17 KATHERINE PEASE AND I'M THE WATERSHED SCIENTIST AT HEAL THE
18 BAY. HEAL THE BAY IS AN A NONPROFIT ENVIRONMENTAL ORGANIZATION
19 FOCUSED ON PROTECTING AND IMPROVING SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA'S
20 OCEANS, RIVERS AND WATERSHEDS. I'M HERE TODAY TO OFFER HEAL
21 THE BAY SUPPORT FOR THE EXTENSION OF THE TEMPORARY PROHIBITION
22 ON THE ESTABLISHMENT AND EXPANSION OF VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA
23 MONICA MOUNTAINS NORTH AREA. WE ARE CONCERNED ABOUT THE
24 IMPACTS OF VINEYARDS ON WATER SUPPLY, WATER QUALITY AND
25 HABITAT. WE SUPPORT FOCUSED STUDIES DURING THE TEMPORARY BAN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THESE IMPACTS. THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS
2 ARE A UNIQUE AND BIODIVERSE NATURAL RESOURCE THAT DESERVE
3 PROTECTION FOR THE ENJOYMENT OF ALL. AS THE WORLD'S LARGEST
4 NATIONAL PARK, THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NATIONAL RECREATION
5 AREA PROVIDES SIGNIFICANT WILDLIFE HABITAT AS WELL AS BENEFITS
6 TO THE MILLIONS OF PEOPLE THAT UTILIZE THE AREA FOR RECREATION
7 AND ENJOYMENT. HOWEVER, ENCROACHING DEVELOPMENT AND POOR LAND
8 USE PRACTICES THREATEN THESE NATURAL RESOURCES. MANY OF THE
9 STREAMS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS ARE DEGRADED WITH HIGH
10 LEVELS OF BACTERIA, NUTRIENTS AND SEDIMENTS, THREATENING
11 HABITAT FOR WILDLIFE, RECREATIONAL ENJOYMENT OF THE AREA AND
12 PUBLIC HEALTH. THE INCREASE IN VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA
13 MOUNTAINS THREATENS TO FURTHER DEGRADE WILDLIFE HABITAT, WATER
14 QUALITY AND SUPPLY THROUGH THE DIRECT LOSS OF HABITAT,
15 INCREASED WATER USE AND RUNOFF, POTENTIALLY CONTAMINATED WITH
16 PESTICIDES, FERTILIZERS AND SEDIMENTS. AND RUNOFF, I WOULD
17 LIKE TO NOTE ISN'T ALWAYS FROM THE IRRIGATION BUT CAN COME
18 DURING RAIN STORMS, AS WELL. WE HAVE DOCUMENTED HIGH LEVELS OF
19 SEDIMENT AND NUTRIENTS DOWNSTREAM FROM AREAS WITH VINEYARDS,
20 SO WE FURTHER RECOMMEND DETAILED STUDIES ON IMPACTS TO BE
21 CONDUCTED AS WELL AS STUDIES ON WATER SUPPLY. WE RECOMMEND
22 THAT WATER USAGE BE MONITORED MORE CAREFULLY WITH THOROUGH
23 INVESTIGATION OF GROUND WATER AND MUNICIPAL WATER USE ALONG
24 WITH MANDATORY METERING OF WATER USE. FINALLY, WE RECOMMEND
25 THAT THE TEMPORARY BAN BE ACCOMPANIED BY A STUDY ON BEST

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MANAGEMENT PRACTICES FOR VITICULTURE SPECIFIC TO THE REGION SO
2 THAT ALL GROUPS ARE ON THE SAME PAGE. WE URGE A PRECAUTIONARY
3 APPROACH AND ASK YOU TO SUPPORT THE TEMPORARY BAN.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH. JAMES PALMER.
6 LAURA GILBARD? YES, SIR.

7

8 **BILL HAYES:** MY NAME IS BILL HAYES. I'M A CONSTITUENT. INASMUCH
9 AS I OWN PROPERTIES IN ALL FIVE SUPERVISORIAL DISTRICTS. IT
10 DOESN'T QUALIFY ME ANY MORE THAN THOSE WHO JUST HAVE ONE
11 DISTRICT. BUT I'M SPEAKING IN OPPOSITION TO THIS PROPOSED
12 LEGISLATION OR BAN. I THINK WE NEED TO FOCUS ON WHAT'S BEEN
13 SAID ALREADY. THE VINES ONLY TAKE WATER THREE MONTHS OUT OF
14 THE YEAR. WE USE A DRIP SYSTEM. THERE IS NO WATER RUNOFF. WE
15 GO STRAIGHT INTO THE GROUND BY DRIPPING. SWIMMING POOLS AT
16 20,000 GALLONS OF WATER AND THEY EVAPORATE AND THEY USE
17 THOUSANDS OF GALLONS EVERY MONTH TO REPLENISH THEM. I'VE SEEN
18 HOMES BUILT IN THE MALIBU AREA OVER THE PAST 50 YEARS. SO IF
19 WE WERE GOING TO BAN EVERYTHING THAT CHANGES, WE COULD START
20 WITH ALL THE HOMEOWNERS THAT ARE SO UPSET ABOUT THE VINEYARDS.
21 I URGE YOU TO VOTE AGAINST THIS PROPOSAL.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, BILL.

24

25 **BILL HAYES:** I GIVE MY REMAINING TIME TO JOHN.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **JOHN GOODEN:** WELL FIRST OF ALL, I'M FLATTERED THAT I HAVE SO
3 MUCH TIME TODAY. IT'S USUALLY NOT THE CASE. THE AMOUNT OF
4 ACREAGE OF EXISTING AND PROPOSED VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA
5 MOUNTAINS IS RELATIVELY INSIGNIFICANT AMOUNT OF ACREAGE. IT'S
6 KIND OF INTERESTING THAT WE CAN TAKE UP SO MUCH TIME ON THE
7 SUBJECT. HOWEVER, I THINK THE REAL WORK IS GOING TO BE DONE
8 NOT TODAY BUT IN THE FUTURE WHEN WE, ALONG WITH THE COUNTY,
9 WILL BE ABLE TO CRAFT A PLAN FOR GOING FORWARD. SOMETHING
10 THAT'S BALANCED. SOMETHING THAT REPS EVERYONE'S INTEREST.
11 THANK YOU.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. ALEXIS GILBARD, MICHAEL
14 GALLARDO. YES, SIR.

15

16 **JAMES PALMER:** YES. MY NAME IS JAMES PALMER. AND I WANTED TO
17 REMIND THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS ABOUT THE HISTORY OF WINE IN
18 LOS ANGELES. LOS ANGELES WAS BUILT ON VINEYARDS. IN 1840,
19 THERE WERE OVER 100 WINERIES IN LOS ANGELES. THERE WERE
20 THOUSANDS AND THOUSANDS OF ACRES AND MILLIONS OF GALLONS OF
21 WINE WERE PRODUCED. WHERE YOU'RE SITTING TODAY, YOU WOULD BE
22 LOOKING OUT OVER THE LOS ANGELES RIVER AND SEE VINEYARDS.
23 NAMES LIKE BOYLE, BOYLE HEIGHTS WERE VINEYARDS. YOU HAVE
24 STREETS NAMED HERE IN LOS ANGELES, MATEO STREET, NAMED AFTER
25 MATTHEW KELLER WHO HAD ONE OF THE LARGEST VINEYARDS IN LOS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ANGELES. OR L.A. RIVER ALAMEDA STREET ALL THE WAY TO UNION
2 STATION. UNION STATION WAS A VINEYARD BY JOHN LOUIS VIGNIER, A
3 FRENCH MAN WHO CAME IN HERE AND DEVELOPED THE WINE INDUSTRY.
4 ALL THE WINE THAT WAS PRODUCED IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA WAS
5 LOS ANGELES WINE. THE WINES WERE SENT TO SAN FRANCISCO DURING
6 THE GOLD RUSH. THEY WERE SHIPPED TO NEW YORK. THEY COMPETED
7 WITH EUROPEAN VINES AND WINES. LOS ANGELES WAS THE WORLD
8 CENTER OF WINE PRODUCTION FOR 60 YEARS. THE CUTTINGS THEN WERE
9 TRANSPORTED UP TO SONOMA WHICH CREATED THE WINE BUSINESS IN
10 THAT SECTION OF THE STATE. BECAUSE OF DEVELOPMENT, WE DON'T
11 HAVE VINEYARDS. WE HAVE ONE REMAINING WINERY, THE SAN ANTONIO
12 WINERY, WHICH IS A THREAD TO OUR PAST. WE HAVE CITIES AND
13 COMMUNITIES THAT WERE FOUNDED ON VINEYARDS. SO, PLEASE, DON'T
14 BE IGNORANT OF THE HISTORY OF LOS ANGELES. THE CITY OF LOS
15 ANGELES'S SEAL HAS A VINEYARD, HAS A VINE ON THE TOP OF THE
16 SEAL. SO WE HAVE A HISTORY THAT WE NEED TO PRESERVE. WE HAVE A
17 LEGACY AND A HERITAGE. PLEASE REMEMBER THAT AND VOTE NO. DO
18 NOT BAN VINEYARDS. THANK YOU.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP JUDIE
21 BELL AND STUART BYLES. JUDIE? KEVIN FOLEY? YES, SIR. DO YOU
22 WANT TO-- OR YES, MA'AM. OKAY. ONE OF YOU.

23

24 **LAURA GILBARD:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS LAURA GILBARD AND I'D
25 LIKE TO THANK THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FOR LISTENING TO OUR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 VIEWPOINTS TODAY. MY HUSBAND AND I OWN A SMALL FAMILY VINEYARD
2 IN AN AGRICULTURALLY ZONED AREA IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS.
3 WE USE NO PESTICIDES. AND ALL OF OUR DROUGHT-RESISTANT VINES
4 ARE ON A DRIP SYSTEM. AS WAS MENTIONED PREVIOUSLY, IT WAS
5 RECOMMENDED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING AT A
6 MEETING ON JUNE 12, 2014, THAT WE APPLY FOR ANY AND ALL
7 PERMITS AT ONCE. WE APPLIED TO EXTEND OUR VINEYARD TO A TOTAL
8 OF 2 ACRES, AND YET THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING SHOWS
9 OUR ENTIRE 8.25-ACRE PROPERTY PARCEL AS PROPOSED VINEYARDS. AS
10 YOU CAN IMAGINE, WE WERE QUITE SHOCKED WHEN THIS EMERGENCY
11 ORDINANCE WAS INSTITUTED AT THE EXACT TIME OUR PERMIT WAS TO
12 BE APPROVED OR DENIED. I STRONGLY OPPOSE THE EXTENSION OF THE
13 VINEYARD BAN, AND I THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME TODAY.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM.

16

17 **MICHAEL GALLARDO:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS MICHAEL GALLARDO
18 AND I'M HERE TO TELL YOU THAT I'M OPPOSING THE EXTENSION OF
19 THE BAN ON VINEYARD DEVELOPMENT IN SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS FOR
20 TWO REASONS. FIRST REASON BEING FIRE. MANY OF THE ORIGINAL
21 GRAPE GROWERS WITHIN MALIBU COAST A.D.A. PLANTED GRAPES
22 BECAUSE L.A. COUNTY FIRE RECOMMENDED THEM FOR USE AS FIRE
23 BREAKS. SECONDLY, THESE VINEYARDS OFFER THE PROTECTION OF
24 LIVES AND PROPERTIES THROUGHOUT THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS AS
25 A FIRE BREAK. THESE VINES OFFERED A DEFENDABLE SPACE FOR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 FIREFIGHTERS TO MANEUVERS IN FRONT OF A FIRE AND TO CUT THE
2 FIRE OFF. THESE VINES OFFER LESS FUEL THAN THE DRY, AS WE'VE
3 SEEN IT, THE VERY FIRE-PRONE CHAPARRAL. LASTLY, ON SITE WELLS
4 THAT MANY OF THESE PROPERTY OWNERS HAVE OFFER AN ADDITIONAL
5 RESOURCE FOR THE FIREFIGHTERS TO USE, WHILE THEY'RE UP IN
6 THESE MOUNTAINS. SECOND REASON IS BEING WATER. AS WE HAVE
7 HEARD MANY TIMES THIS MORNING, VINES ARE DROUGHT TOLERANT.
8 THEY'RE VERY DROUGHT RESISTANT. THEY USE LESS WATER THAN ANY
9 OTHER CROPS USE FOR AGRICULTURE IN THE AREA. AS STATED
10 EARLIER, THEY USE 70 PERCENT LESS WATER THAN AVOCADOS. THEY
11 ONLY UTILIZE IRRIGATION THREE MONTHS OUT OF THE YEAR. AND FOR
12 THOSE THREE MONTHS, MAYBE 1 TO 4 TIMES A MONTH. AND ALSO THE
13 TYPE OF IRRIGATION. THE DRIP IRRIGATION. WHICH THESE DRIP
14 LINES ONLY USE HALF TO ONE GALLON PER HOUR PER VINE. SO, ONCE
15 AGAIN, I'M SAYING THAT I'M OPPOSING THE EXTENSION ON THE BAN.
16 I PLEASE ASK THAT YOU VOTE NO.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. YES, SIR.

19

20 **STUART BYLES:** MY NAME IS STUART BYLES. I AM AN AUTHOR OF WINE
21 HISTORY. I HAVE A RECENTLY PUBLISHED BOOK ON THE HISTORY OF
22 LOS ANGELES WINE. MR. PALMER, TO HIS GREAT CREDIT, STOLE MUCH
23 OF MY THUNDER. BUT I JUST WANTED TO SAY THAT LOS ANGELES SINCE
24 THE BEGINNING.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** HE READ YOUR BOOK.

2

3 **STUART BYLES:** YOU READ MY BOOK? THEN I DON'T NEED TO SAY
4 ANOTHER WORD, THEN, DO I? I OPPOSE THIS. LOS ANGELES IS THE
5 BEGINNING OF THE WINE BUSINESS IN CALIFORNIA. AS JIM SAID,
6 THERE WAS OVER 100 VINEYARDS HERE WHEN THERE WAS MAYBE FOUR TO
7 SIX IN NORTHERN CALIFORNIA. NORTHERN CALIFORNIA WAS SUSTAINED
8 BY THE VINEYARDS AND THE WINERIES OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. AS
9 ANOTHER HISTORIAN HAS SAID, FOR MOST OF THE 19TH CENTURY, WHEN
10 YOU SAID CALIFORNIA WINE, YOU MEANT LOS ANGELES WINE. SO, THE
11 IMPORTANCE OF LOS ANGELES WINE AND ITS HISTORY IS PHENOMENAL.
12 YOU'VE LISTENED TO ALL THE OTHER VINEYARD OWNERS WHO SAY ABOUT
13 THE SUSTAINABILITY OF VINEYARDS AND WHAT THEY DO, THE LITTLE
14 AMOUNT OF WATER THAT THEY NEED, THE NIL TO NOTHING OF RUNOFF
15 THAT HAPPENS. AS SURELY AS DROUGHT FOLLOWS FLOOD AND FLOOD
16 FOLLOWS DROUGHT, WE WILL BE TALKING ABOUT RAINFALL IN THE HUGE
17 AMOUNTS AND YOU WILL BE HAPPY TO SEE VINEYARDS ON HILLSIDES
18 THAT ARE HOLDING THE HILLSIDES IN PLACE WHILE THE FLOODS RAGE
19 AROUND THEM. I URGE YOU TO VOTE NO ON THIS. AND WHILE YOU'RE
20 VOTING NO ON THIS, WHY DON'T YOU TAKE UP THAT ONEROUS AND
21 ANTI-VINEYARD LAW THAT YOU PASSED LAST YEAR AND DELETE THAT,
22 AS WELL. THANK YOU.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP CHRISTA
25 FOLEY. CHRISTA FOLEY. DON SCHMITZ. YES, SIR.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **KEVIN FOLEY:** MY NAME IS KEVIN FOLEY. I OWN A SMALL TWO-ACRE
3 VINEYARD IN LOBO CANYON. AND I'M URGING YOU TO VOTE NO ON THIS
4 MEASURE. A COUPLE OF THINGS I WOULD LIKE TO POINT OUT. ONE OF
5 THE THINGS THAT THE PROPONENTS OF THIS MEASURE HAVE SAID IS
6 THAT WE USE SO MUCH WATER WITH OUR VINEYARDS. WE RECENTLY
7 APPLIED FOR AND GOT APPROVED FOR THE GRASS REMOVAL FROM THE
8 WATER DISTRICT. AND WE'VE STOPPED WATERING OUR 3,000 SQUARE
9 FEET OF GRASS FOR ABOUT THREE WEEKS NOW. AND OUR WATER USAGE
10 HAS BEEN CUT IN HALF JUST BY THE 3,000 SQUARE FEET OF GRASS
11 BEING REMOVED. THAT, AS OPPOSED TO OUR 2-ACRE VINES, I THINK
12 THE GRASS ITSELF WAS USING MORE THAN THE 2 ACRES OF THE VINES.
13 SO I THINK THAT THAT IS NOT A VALID POINT. THE OTHER POINT
14 THAT EVERYONE KEEPS MAKING IS THAT THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS
15 NEED TO BE PRESERVED FOR THE HABITAT OF THE ANIMALS AND SUCH
16 AND THE INSECTS AND THE BIRDS. AND AGAIN I DON'T THINK THAT
17 WE'RE TAKING AWAY ANY HABITAT, THAT WE HAVE MANY ANIMALS THAT
18 RUN WILD THROUGH OUR VINEYARD ALL THE TIME. AND I WOULD ALSO
19 LIKE TO ASK WITH ALL THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS THAT ARE
20 PROTECTED THAT ARE NOT PERSONALLY OWNED, IS THAT NOT ENOUGH
21 HABITAT FOR THE ANIMALS? WHEN I BOUGHT MY PROPERTY, IT IS
22 AGRICULTURALLY ZONED. AND I WAS TOLD UNDER THE ZONING LAWS
23 THAT I WAS ABLE TO PLANT CROPS. NOW I COULD HAVE PLANTED
24 AVOCADOS. I COULD HAVE PLANTED ALMONDS. AND WE'D BE TALKING

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ABOUT MUCH, MUCH GREATER WATER USAGE. I URGE YOU TO VOTE NO ON
2 THIS MEASURE.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

5

6 **ALEXIS GILBARD:** HI THERE. MY NAME IS ALEXIS GILBARD. THANK
7 YOU, HONORABLE SUPERVISORS, FOR HEARING US ALL OUT. APPRECIATE
8 YOUR PATIENCE. AS YOU CAN SEE, THERE ARE MANY PEOPLE IN THIS
9 ROOM THAT ARE VERY PASSIONATE ABOUT THIS ISSUE. BACK IN JUNE
10 OF 2014, THE LOBO TRIUNFO ASSOCIATION ACTUALLY REQUESTED THE
11 DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING TO COME OUT AND HELP US MAKE A
12 LONG-TERM PLAN FOR OUR VINES. AT THAT MEETING, WE WERE
13 STRONGLY ENCOURAGED TO PUT OUR APPLICATIONS IN. AND THIS
14 PERCEIVED RUSH OF APPLICATIONS IS CLEARLY A DIRECT RESULT OF
15 THAT MEETING. AGAIN, OUR VINEYARD IS SMALL. IT'S UNDER 2
16 ACRES. WE WILL BE ELIGIBLE FOR ORGANIC CERTIFICATION IN THE
17 NEXT YEAR. IT'S DRIP IRRIGATED. WE USE VERY LITTLE WATER. AND
18 I JUST WANT TO REITERATE THE POINTS THAT WERE MADE BY SO MANY
19 OTHER PEOPLE WHO HAVE COME TO THIS MICROPHONE ABOUT VALUABLE
20 HILLSIDE PROTECTION, ROCK SLIDE RESISTANCE AND FIRE BREAKS,
21 WHICH ALL OF THESE THINGS ARE MAJOR ISSUES IN OUR AREA, IN
22 MALIBU AND IN THE TRIUNFO LOBO COMMUNITY. AND ALSO THERE HAVE
23 BEEN SOME STATEMENTS ABOUT THE BEAUTY OF THE AREA. I THINK
24 THAT'S SUBJECTIVE. BUT PERSONALLY, I FIND THE VINEYARDS TO BE
25 BEAUTIFUL IN THE BACKDROP OF OUR CANYON. I THINK THERE'S,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AGAIN, THAT'S A PERSONAL OPINION. ALSO, THE POINT ABOUT
2 PROPERTY VALUES. VINEYARDS ABSOLUTELY INCREASE PROPERTY
3 VALUES. AND FINALLY I'D LIKE TO SAY THAT THERE IS NO STRONG
4 EVIDENCE TO SUPPORT ANY OF THE ISSUES THAT WERE BROUGHT UP
5 THAT MIGHT OPPOSE VINEYARDS. AND THIS 45-DAY BAN, DURING THIS
6 BAN, AS FAR AS WE KNOW, THERE HAVE BEEN NO STUDIES DONE, NO
7 EFFORT TO ANSWER ANY OF THE ISSUES OR ANY OF THE CONCERNS OF
8 THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL PLANNING. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU.

11

12 **ALEXIS GILBARD:** AND I URGE YOU TO VOTE NO.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. ALSO CALL UP ELLIOT DOLIN.
15 YES, MA'AM.

16

17 **CHRISTA FOLEY:** HELLO, MY NAME IS CHRISTA FOLEY. I'D LIKE TO
18 GIVE MY TIME TO JOHN GOODEN.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. HE OUGHT TO RUN FOR CLASS
21 PRESIDENT. HE'S GOT THE VOTES. [LAUGHTER.] LUCAS, ROBERT
22 LUCAS. YES, SIR.

23

24 **DON SCHMITZ:** GOOD MORNING, SUPERVISORS. DON SCHMITZ. THIS IS
25 AN EXTENSION OF AN URGENCY ORDINANCE. THERE HAS TO BE VERY

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DEFINED CRITERIA FOR YOU TO MOVE IN AN URGENT FASHION. SO
2 WHAT'S THE URGENCY? HERE'S WHAT'S BEEN TESTIFIED AND PRESENTED
3 TO YOU. FIRST, HABITAT DISRUPTION. WE BELIEVE THAT THE ACREAGE
4 FIGURES THAT YOU'VE BEEN GIVEN ARE SIGNIFICANTLY INFLATED. BUT
5 EVEN USING THOSE ACREAGE FIGURES, IT'S 2 PERCENT OF THE TOTAL
6 AREA OF THE NORTH AREA PLAN, AND IT'S SPREAD OUT OVER AN AREA.
7 THERE'S NOT GOING TO BE SIGNIFICANT HABITAT DESTRUCTION. AND
8 60 PERCENT OF THE MOUNTAINS ARE OWNED BY THE PARKS ALREADY.
9 AESTHETICS OR LOSS OF PROPERTY VALUES? HAS THE MALIBU
10 ASSOCIATION OF REALTORS WEIGHED IN ON THIS? BECAUSE THEY
11 BELIEVE, THE EXPERTS, THAT VINEYARDS ADD TO PROPERTY VALUES.
12 AND AS A BOARD MEMBER AND A PAST CHAIR OF THE MALIBU CHAMBER
13 OF COMMERCE, I FIND IT LAUGHABLE, LAUGHABLE THAT PEOPLE SPEAK
14 OF VINEYARDS AS BEING SOME SORT OF AESTHETIC ASSAULT ON THE
15 GENERAL COMMUNITY. OUR MALIBU WINE TOUR BRINGS PEOPLE INTO THE
16 SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS NATIONAL RECREATION AREA FROM ALL OVER
17 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA. OUR NUMBERS SHOW THAT MORE PEOPLE COME TO
18 LOOK AT OUR VINES THAN GO HIKING IN THE PARKS. SO WHAT ARE THE
19 OTHER REASONS THEY'RE GIVING FOR THIS URGENT, URGENT
20 ORDINANCE? WATER DEPLETION. HAVE YOU BEEN GIVEN ANY DATA? NO.
21 YOU'VE HEARD SOME ANECDOTAL TESTIMONY TALKING ABOUT PEOPLE'S
22 WELLS GOING DOWN. I'VE LIVED IN THESE MOUNTAINS FOR 20 YEARS.
23 I HAVE NEIGHBORS THAT ARE NOT WITHIN MILES OF WELLS, OF
24 VINEYARDS AND THEIR WELLS HAVE GONE DOWN HUNDREDS OF FEET.
25 HERE'S THE FACT. OUT OF ANY LAND USE YOU CAN HAVE, THE SCIENCE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SHOWS VINEYARDS USE THE LEAST AMOUNT OF WATER, LESS THAN ANY
2 OTHER FORM OF AGRICULTURE AND MUCH, MUCH LESS THAN TRADITIONAL
3 OR EVEN DROUGHT-TOLERANT LANDSCAPING. THEIR TAP ROOT GOES DOWN
4 21 FEET. THEY HOLD THE HILLSIDES BETTER THAN THE NATIVE
5 CHAPARRAL AND THEY USE LESS WATER THAN ANY OTHER LAND USE.
6 PLEASE VOTE NO.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. AND LET ME ALSO, THE
9 LAST SPEAKER WOULD BE ARNOLD SACHS. YES, SIR.

10

11 **ELLIOT DOLIN:** HI, MY NAME IS ELLIOT DOLIN, AND I OWN A SMALL
12 VINEYARD IN MALIBU LESS THAN ONE ACRE WHICH WE PLANTED ALMOST
13 10 YEARS AGO. AND I THINK THE OPERATIVE WORD HERE IS "SMALL."
14 I THINK YOU CAN SEE FROM EVERYBODY THAT'S SPOKEN BEFORE WE
15 TODAY, THESE ARE NOT LARGE, COMMERCIAL VINEYARDS THAT ARE
16 PROLIFERATING AND SPREADING THROUGHOUT THE SANTA MONICA
17 MOUNTAINS. BASICALLY WE USE PORTIONS OF OUR PROPERTY. WE'RE
18 NOT DEVELOPERS. WE'VE HEARD ACCUSATIONS OF GRADING. FRANKLY, I
19 PERSONALLY DON'T KNOW ONE VINEYARD OWNER WHO HAS HAD TO GRADE
20 HIS PROPERTY TO INSTALL HIS VINEYARD. SO I THINK MANY OF THESE
21 THINGS HAVE SORT OF BEEN BLOWN OUT OF PROPORTION. WE ALL SHARE
22 THE SENTIMENT OF THE HEAL THE BAY REPRESENTATIVE. WE'RE ALL
23 CONCERNED ABOUT RUNOFF. WE'RE ALL CONCERNED ABOUT POLLUTION.
24 BUT WHY ARE WE SINGLING OUT VINEYARDS? BEFORE THE LOCAL
25 COASTAL PLAN WAS APPROVED, IT WAS LANGUAGE THAT ADDRESSED

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 EQUESTRIAN USES. THERE WAS LANGUAGE THAT ADDRESSED ALL FORMS
2 OF AGRICULTURE. AND SOMEHOW THAT GOT BOILED DOWN TO MAKE IT
3 ALL ABOUT VINEYARDS. AND I URGE YOU TO VOTE NO. I THINK THAT
4 OBVIOUSLY THE CONCERNS SHOULD BE WIDESPREAD, NOT JUST AIMED AT
5 VINEYARDS. EQUESTRIAN USES, OBVIOUSLY, WE'RE TALKING ABOUT
6 MEASURING THINGS IN THE STREAM, DOWNSTREAM, IT'S UNDENIABLE
7 THAT EQUESTRIAN USES ARE A LARGE CONTRIBUTOR TO THIS AND FAR
8 MORE EXTENSIVE IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS THAN VINEYARDS
9 ARE. SO PLEASE, LET'S IN THE DISCRIMINATE AGAINST VINEYARDS.
10 LET'S LOOK AT THIS RATIONALLY. LET'S LOOK AT THE BIG PICTURE.
11 AND I URGE YOU TO VOTE NO ON THIS PROPOSITION 4.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. JOHN. AND THEN MR. LUCAS WILL
14 FOLLOW. YES, SIR.

15

16 **JOHN GOODEN:** I'M BACK.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YOU'RE BACK.

19

20 **JOHN GOODEN:** I'VE NOW, SUCCESSFULLY, OCCUPIED ALL THREE SEATS
21 THIS MORNING. I THINK ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT THINGS FOR ME
22 PERSONALLY BECAUSE I'M NOT REALLY AFFECTED OR IMPACTED BY THE
23 OUTCOME OF THIS PARTICULAR VOTE IS THAT THERE ARE MANY
24 FAMILIES THAT ARE. ALL OF THESE FARMS IN THE SANTA MONICA
25 MOUNTAINS ARE FAMILY OWNED. THERE ARE NO BIG BUSINESS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DEVELOPERS OR FARMERS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. THE
2 TOPOGRAPHY DOES NOT PERMIT FOR IT. THEY ARE ALL HAND TENDED.
3 THOSE VINEYARDS CREATE JOBS FOR VINEYARD WORKERS. AND AS HAS
4 BEEN POINTED OUT, IT CREATES REVENUE FOR THE COUNTY. THERE'S A
5 BIG SPILLOVER EFFECT IN THE HOTELS FOR PEOPLE WHO COME ON THE
6 WEEKEND AND VISIT THE TASTING ROOMS. THERE'S A SPILLOVER TO
7 THE RESTAURANTS THAT PEOPLE OCCUPY WHEN THEY COME TO VISIT THE
8 VINEYARDS IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS. AND THESE ARE ALL
9 POSITIVE THINGS FOR THE COUNTY. AND I'D REALLY LIKE TO SEE US
10 GET ON WITH FINDING A PATH TO PROMOTE VINEYARDS IN MODERATION
11 IN THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS SO THAT WE CAN ALL ENJOY THEM.
12 THANK YOU.

13

14 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** NEXT WITNESS?

15

16 **ROBERT LUCAS:** GOOD AFTERNOON, SUPERVISORS. I CAN ONLY GIVE THE
17 EXPERIENCE THAT I'VE HAD, BUT I'VE LISTENED. I'VE HEARD WORDS
18 LIKE INSTITUTION. DROUGHT RESISTANT. NO IMPACT. STRENGTHENING
19 THE EARTH. BACK IN THE LATE 1970S, I WAS FORTUNATE ENOUGH TO
20 SPEND SOME TIME ON A RANCH THAT BELONGED TO JACK KLUGMAN OUT
21 IN RANCHO, CALIFORNIA. I HAD HANDS-ON PLANTING VINES. I KNOW
22 WHAT IT TAKES. WHEN THEY SAY DRIP LINES, OKAY, THAT'S ALL WELL
23 AND GOOD, BUT THERE ARE MANY, MANY, MANY MITIGATING FACTORS
24 HERE. THE DIAMETER OF THE DRIP LINE. THE FOOTAGE OF THE DRIP
25 LINE. HOW FAR IT RUNS THROUGHOUT THE ACREAGE. IT CAN BE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MINIMAL. IT CAN ALSO BE EXTENSIVE. THE FACT OF THE MATTER IS
2 WE'RE LIKE 5 TO 7 YEARS OF A DROUGHT HERE. I DON'T KNOW
3 EXACTLY WHAT DROUGHT-RESISTANT MEANS. AND I HEARD SOMEBODY SAY
4 THEY DON'T USE ANY WATER. WELL, I DON'T KNOW ABOUT YOU, BUT
5 NOTHING GROWS WITHOUT WATER. NOTHING. YOU SAY IT HAS A MINIMAL
6 IMPACT ON THE HILLSIDE? WELL I CAN TELL YOU FROM PERSONAL
7 EXPERIENCE WHEN YOU'RE GALLOPING ON A HORSE THROUGH AN OPEN
8 RANGE ON A HILLSIDE AND YOU HAPPEN TO RUN THROUGH SOME VINES,
9 IT'S NOT VERY MUCH FUN. THE FACT IS I LOVE FRUIT JUST LIKE
10 ANYBODY ELSE. IN FACT, I CHERISH ALL OF THE PRODUCE THAT COMES
11 FROM NORTHERN CALIFORNIA. IF YOU TAKE A HIKE THROUGH THE SANTA
12 MONICA MOUNTAINS AND CONSIDER ALL THE PETITIONS THAT SOMEBODY
13 BROUGHT UP THAT WAS SIGNED, HOW MANY PEOPLE HAVE A VESTED
14 INTEREST THAT ALREADY HAVE VINEYARDS DOWN THERE? COME ON.
15 WE'RE TALKING ABOUT 10 MONTHS HERE. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT 7
16 YEARS OF DROUGHT. I TAKE THREE SHOWERS A WEEK BECAUSE I DON'T
17 WANT TO WASTE WATER. YOU WANT ME TO LET MY WATER GO TO YOUR
18 VINEYARDS SO YOU CAN MAKE WINE? COME ON.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** I'D TAKE A COUPLE EXTRA SHOWERS IF I
21 WERE YOU. [LAUGHTER.] MR. LUCAS-- OR MR. SACHS.

22

23 **ARNOLD SACHS:** YES. THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING. ARNOLD SACHS.
24 ACTUALLY, THE ONE PERSON WHO SPOKE MADE REFERENCE TO THE
25 ORDINANCE THAT WAS PASSED LAST YEAR IN JUNE WHEN SUPERVISOR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 YAROSLAVSKY PRODUCED THOSE ONE-OF-A-KIND PICTURES THAT SHOWED
2 HILLSIDES TOTALLY LEVELED IN THE DEFENSE OF ELIMINATING THE
3 VINEYARDS. WE NEVER DID FIND OUT WHERE THOSE HILLSIDES WERE,
4 BUT WE NEVER DID FIND OUT WHERE SUPERVISOR YAROSLAVSKY WAS,
5 EITHER. THE QUESTION IS: WHILE THIS ORDINANCE HAS BEEN IN
6 EFFECT OR WHILE THESE VINEYARDS HAVE BEEN IN USAGE, HOW MUCH
7 MORE INFORMATION DOES THE COUNTY NEED TO ACTUALLY HAVE? AND
8 WHAT ARE THE PARAMETERS THAT THE COUNTY'S LOOKING AT AS FAR AS
9 THE SOLUTION TO THIS QUESTION OF VINEYARDS OR NO VINEYARDS? IS
10 IT GOING TO BE ELIMINATED TOTALLY? IS IT GOING TO BE A MINIMAL
11 AMOUNT? WHAT POINTS DO THESE PEOPLE-- WE HAVE EXTREME QUESTION
12 HERE OF WE WANT VINEYARDS, WE DON'T WANT VINEYARDS. THERE'S
13 GOT TO BE A HAPPY MEDIUM IN HERE. WHAT ARE THOSE SOLUTIONS
14 THAT THE COUNTY'S CONSIDERING? WE'VE HEARD PEOPLE SAY THERE IS
15 AN AQUIFER. THERE IS NO AQUIFER. THIS ISN'T BRAIN SURGERY.
16 THIS IS SOMETHING YOU SHOULD KNOW. I MEAN, YOU HAVE EXPERTS
17 THAT YOU HAVE ON THESE PROBLEMS. THE PEOPLE THAT ARE
18 TESTIFYING COULD BE GIVING THEIR POINT OF VIEW. BUT THEY COULD
19 BE EXPERTS BECAUSE IT'S THEIR PROPERTY, AND THEY MADE THAT
20 VESTED INTEREST IN DEVELOPING THEIR PROPERTY THAT WAY. I THINK
21 IT'S ABOUT TIME THE COUNTY STOOD UP AND ACTED INSTEAD OF
22 PUTTING THIS OFF AND PUTTING THIS OFF AND PUTTING THIS OFF.
23 COME UP WITH A RESOLUTION. THIS IS BIG TIME. THIS IS THE MAJOR
24 LEAGUES HERE. ACT LIKE YOU'RE PROFESSIONALS FOR CRYING OUT
25 LOUD.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL.

3

4 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. FIRST OF ALL, I'D
5 LIKE TO THANK EVERYONE WHO TESTIFIED. ALL MY CONSTITUENTS AND
6 EVEN THOSE WHO LIVE IN ALL FIVE DISTRICTS, OR OWN PROPERTY. I
7 HAVE BEEN LISTENING AND I HAVE BEEN LISTENING OVER THE PAST
8 FEW WEEKS. AND I WANTED TO INDICATE A FEW THINGS. FIRST OF
9 ALL, TESTIMONY IS VERY THOUGHTFUL, BUT IT MUST TAKE INTO
10 ACCOUNT WHAT LED TO THIS MOTION TO BEGIN WITH, AND THAT IS, I
11 DID NOT HAVE APPLICATIONS IN THE MALIBU AREA FOR 28 NEW
12 PERMITS FOR AVOCADO GROVES. I DID NOT HAVE APPLICATIONS FOR 43
13 NEW PERMITS FOR ANY OTHER KIND OF AGRICULTURE. THIS WAS AN
14 UNPRECEDENTED NUMBER OF APPLICATIONS, AND IT WAS ALL FOR
15 VINEYARDS. 43 APPLICATIONS. AND MANY HAVE TESTIFIED WELL, THEY
16 COUNTED ALL THE 8 ACRES IN MY PROPERTY, BUT I'M ONLY GROWING
17 ON 2. WELL, IT'S VERY DIFFICULT FOR PLANNING TO KNOW OR TO
18 READ YOUR MIND BECAUSE THE APPLICATION WOULD HAVE PERMITTED
19 VINEYARDS ON ALL OF THE ACREAGE FOR WHICH IT WAS APPLIED. THAT
20 SAID, I BELIEVE NO ONE AND EVERYONE WILL BE PLEASED WITH THE
21 FOLLOWING COMPROMISE. BECAUSE I WANT TO TAKE INTO ACCOUNT
22 ALTHOUGH SIMPLY PUTTING IN AN APPLICATION FOR SOMETHING DOES
23 NOT NECESSARILY LEAD TO A RIGHT EITHER UNDER THE CONSTITUTION
24 OF THE UNITED STATES OR THE CONSTITUTION OF CALIFORNIA. IT
25 DOES LEAD TO A KIND OF EXPECTATION. AND, IN A WAY, A KIND OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HOPE. AND I DO UNDERSTAND THE MANY VINTNERS WHO HAVE TESTIFIED
2 TO US ABOUT THEIR CARE IN PRACTICE. WHEN WE TALK ABOUT WATER,
3 THERE HAS BEEN SOME CONVERSATION AND TESTIMONY ABOUT HOW
4 LITTLE WATER IS USED IN THE GROWTH IN VINEYARDS. IT WAS THE
5 AGGREGATE AMOUNT THAT I WAS CONCERNED WITH. IT WAS AN APPLAUSE
6 LINE. THERE IS NO AQUIFER UNDER THE SANTA MONICA MOUNTAINS AND
7 THE VINTNERS APPLAUDED. I DON'T KNOW IF THAT'S A GOOD THING.
8 IT WOULD BE BETTER IF THERE WAS NO WATER. BUT THAT DOESN'T
9 MEAN THERE'S NO WATER. BECAUSE EVERY TIME YOU DIG A WELL, I
10 SUPPOSE YOU EXPECT THERE WILL BE WATER AT THE BOTTOM OF THAT
11 WELL EVEN IF IT ISN'T AN AQUIFER. AND IN THE SANTA MONICA
12 MOUNTAINS THAT IS SUB- SURFACE WATER. IT IS NOT JUST A LITTLE
13 POOL OF WATER WITH CONCRETE AROUND IT UNDER YOUR HOUSE. WHEN
14 YOU DRAW WATER, GREAT OR SMALL, YOU'RE DRAWING FROM A FLOWING
15 STREAM THAT IS ALSO SOMEONE ELSE'S. SO I ASSUME FROM YOUR
16 TESTIMONY THAT YOU'RE PAYING ATTENTION TO YOUR RESPONSIBILITY
17 TO YOUR NEIGHBORS, BECAUSE OBVIOUSLY IF YOU PLANT SO MANY
18 VINEYARDS AND DRAW WATER, NO MATTER WHAT YOU'VE SAID, IN 15
19 YEARS YOU MAY FIND THAT YOU'VE IMPACTED EACH OTHER IN A WAY
20 THAT YOU DIDN'T EXPECT HERE. BUT TO RESOLVE THIS ISSUE TODAY,
21 I'D LIKE TO BRING A MOTION TO THE BOARD. THE FIRST PART OF THE
22 MOTION, DON'T GROAN BECAUSE IT DOESN'T APPLY TO YOU. I
23 THEREFORE MOVE THAT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS APPROVE EXTENDING
24 INTERIM ORDINANCE 2015-002 U FOR FOUR MONTHS. THAT SIMPLY WILL
25 GIVE OUR PLANNING DEPARTMENT THE ABILITY TO WRITE AN ORDINANCE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RELATED TO THESE ISSUES FOR THOSE WHO HAVE NOT YET APPLIED.
2 THE SECOND PART OF THE MOTION, I FURTHER MOVE THAT THE BOARD
3 AMEND INTERIM ORDINANCE 2015-0022U TO ALLOW THE 28 PENDING
4 VINEYARD APPLICATIONS TO MOVE FORWARD WITH A DIRECTOR'S
5 REVIEW. WE CHOSE A DIRECTOR'S REVIEW RATHER THAN A MORE
6 STRINGENT REQUIREMENT BECAUSE IT WILL NOT REQUIRE AN
7 INVESTMENT OF ANY MORE MONEY ON YOUR PART. A DIRECTOR'S REVIEW
8 SUBJECT TO THE FOLLOWING REQUIREMENTS: "1) THAT WATER SERVICE
9 IS PROVIDED BY A MUNICIPAL WATER DISTRICT. 2) SOME PROOF OF
10 LEGAL ACCESS. 3) NO VINEYARD PLANTING ON SLOPES OF 50 PERCENT
11 OR GREATER. 4) A PEST-MANAGEMENT PLAN APPROVED BY THE
12 DEPARTMENTS OF PUBLIC HEALTH AND AGRICULTURAL- WEIGHTS AND
13 MEASURES. 5) A BIOSWALE PLAN APPROVED BY THE DEPARTMENT OF
14 PUBLIC WORKS. 6) AN EROSION CONTROL PLAN APPROVED BY THE
15 DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS. AND 7) ALL VINEYARD PLANTING MAY
16 ONLY USE DRIP IRRIGATION." THESE HAVE BEEN ISSUES WE PULLED
17 FROM YOUR WRITING TO US, YOUR TESTIMONY TO US AND YOUR
18 PRESENTATIONS TO US. SO, MR. MAYOR AND COLLEAGUES, I MAKE THAT
19 MOTION.

20
21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WE HAVE A MOTION AND A SECOND.

22
23 **SUP. KNABE:** I JUST WANTED TO ADD I SUPPORT THE MOTION AT THIS
24 PARTICULAR POINT. AS YOU KNOW, I APPRECIATE YOUR WILLINGNESS
25 TO-- MY BIG ISSUE WAS THE EXISTING APPLICATIONS AND NOT BEING

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ALLOWED TO MOVE FORWARD. AND UNDER THIS, THEY ARE. AND SO I
2 APPRECIATE THE SPIRIT OF COOPERATION ON THIS AND WILL SUPPORT
3 THE MOTION AS PRESENTED.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO
6 ORDERED. THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR. OKAY. WE HAVE PEOPLE WHO HAVE
7 TO CATCH A FERRY. SO DO 16. WE DON'T WANT YOU TO MISS THE
8 FERRY BECAUSE IT'S A LONG SWIM TO CATALINA. SO LET ME CALL UP
9 THE DEPARTMENT'S GOING TO DO A RESPONSE OKAY. YOU'RE READY,
10 THE DEPARTMENT. ITEM 16.

11

12 **GAIL FARBER:** GREAT. THANK YOU, MAYOR, MEMBERS OF THE BOARD.
13 SUPERVISORS. GAIL FARBER, DIRECTOR OF PUBLIC WORKS. AS
14 DIRECTED BY THE BOARD, PUBLIC WORKS PROVIDED A REPORT THAT'S
15 BEFORE YOU RESPONDING TO QUESTIONS THE BOARD RAISED REGARDING
16 POTENTIAL FOR COUNTY PARTICIPATION WITH THE CITY OF AVALON AND
17 SOUTHERN CAL EDISON IN THE DESALINIZATION TREATMENT PROJECT ON
18 CATALINA ISLAND AND PROVIDE AN ASSESSMENT OF THE ISLAND'S
19 WATER SUPPLY SYSTEM AND NEEDS. AND AS YOU KNOW, CALIFORNIA'S
20 IN ITS FOURTH YEAR OF A RECORD DROUGHT, WHICH IS HAVING SOME
21 MAJOR CONSEQUENCES THROUGHOUT THE STATE. AND WATER AGENCIES
22 THROUGHOUT SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA ARE WORKING TOGETHER TO REDUCE
23 WATER USAGE WHILE LOOKING AT WAYS TO REDUCE SUSTAINABILITY OF
24 LOCAL AND, AS WELL, REGIONAL WATER SUPPLIES. MORE EFFICIENT
25 USE OF WATER BY CUSTOMERS FROM INCREASING STORM WATER CAPTURE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO USING RECYCLED WATER AND THE USE OF DESALINIZATION ARE ALL
2 AVAILABLE APPROACHES BEING CONSIDERED BY MANY AGENCIES. THOUGH
3 MORE COSTLY THAN SOME OF THE PROJECTS, DESALINIZATION IS A
4 VIABLE OPTION AND A PRUDENT OPTION WHEN OTHER APPROACHES ARE
5 NOT READILY AVAILABLE. SO THE DROUGHT SITUATION ON CATALINA
6 ISLAND IS PARTICULARLY SEVERE DUE TO LIMITED SOURCES AND THE
7 CRITICALLY LOW GROUND WATER LEVELS. AND AS A RESULT, SOUTHERN
8 CALIFORNIA EDISON, THE WATER SYSTEM OPERATOR FOR CATALINA
9 ISLAND HAS IMPLEMENTED MANDATORY WATER CONSERVATION FOR THE
10 ISLAND RESIDENTS BACK BEGINNING IN JUNE OF 2013. HOWEVER, THE
11 DROUGHT CONTINUES. EDISON AND THE CITY OF AVALON HAVE
12 PARTNERED TO INCREASE THE LOCAL WATER SUPPLY FOR THE CITY BY
13 INVESTING AND EXPANDING THE EXISTING DESALINIZATION TREATMENT
14 PLANT. AND WITH LIMITED OPTIONS AVAILABLE, THIS IS A PRUDENT
15 COURSE OF ACTION GIVEN THE CIRCUMSTANCES ON THE ISLAND. AND WE
16 ACKNOWLEDGE THE MAJOR EFFORTS BEING TAKEN BY EDISON AND THE
17 CITY TO INCREASE THEIR WATER SUPPLY AND HAVE PARTNERED WITH
18 THEM TO ADDRESS THE SUPPLY AND THE SUSTAINABILITY OF THEIR
19 WATER SUPPLY. AS DIRECTED, THE REPORT, WE'VE IDENTIFIED THE
20 VARIOUS GRANT OPPORTUNITIES AND LOW INTEREST LOANS, SUCH AS
21 PROPOSITIONS 1, 50, 84, THERE'S THE SAFE WATER DRINKING ACT,
22 SAFE WATER DRINKING WATER STATE REVOLVING FUND THAT MAY BE
23 AVAILABLE TO THE CITY AND EDISON. THE COUNTY CAN ALSO SUPPORT-
24 - CONTINUE TO SUPPORT AND PARTNER WITH THE CITY AND EDISON IN
25 ITS IMPORTANT EFFORTS IN APPLYING FOR THESE GRANT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OPPORTUNITIES EITHER THROUGH WHATEVER TYPE OF FUNDING
2 AGREEMENT OR M.O.U. OR PARTNERSHIP AGREEMENT THAT WE CAN.
3 WE'VE EVALUATED THE WATER SYSTEM BY REVIEWING THE TECHNICAL
4 REPORTS PROVIDED BY EDISON, SOUTHERN CAL EDISON AND WE ALSO
5 HAD STAFF DO A FULL-DAY TOUR OF THEIR WATER FACILITIES. AND
6 OUR WATER SYSTEM ENGINEERS HAVE REVIEWED THE IMPLEMENTATION
7 PLAN BY EDISON AND CONSIDER THEM APPROPRIATE MEASURES FOR THE
8 CURRENT STATE OF CONDITIONS ON THE ISLAND. WITH THAT, I HAVE
9 STAFF HERE THAT WE CAN ANSWER AND ADDRESS ANY QUESTIONS THAT
10 YOU MAY HAVE IN THE REPORT OR HOW YOU'D LIKE TO PROCEED MOVING
11 FORWARD.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** ANY QUESTIONS? WE HAVE TWO SPEAKERS.
14 SUPERVISOR KNABE?

15

16 **SUP. KNABE:** WELL, WHO ARE THE SPEAKERS? DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL
17 AND MR. ARNOLD SACHS.

18

19 **SUP. KNABE:** ALL RIGHT. THEN I'LL ASK MY QUESTIONS FIRST. FIRST
20 OF ALL, I WANT TO THANK THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS AND
21 OTHERS FOR THE EFFORT TO GO OUT THERE AND PHYSICALLY TOUR
22 THEIR WATER FACILITIES AND SEE THE ISSUES THAT THEY ARE
23 DEALING WITH. OBVIOUSLY, IT'S AN ISLAND. IT'S A VERY UNIQUE
24 SITUATION. I HAD ONE QUESTION TO BOTH THE CITY AND EDISON. HAS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THAT M.O.U. BEEN SIGNED BETWEEN THE CITY AND EDISON YET?

2 SOMEBODY WANTS TO COME FORWARD ON THAT?

3

4 **JEFF LAWRENCE:** JEFF LAWRENCE WITH SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON.

5 THE M.O.U. HAS BEEN SIGNED BY OUR VICE PRESIDENT AT SOUTHERN

6 CALIFORNIA EDISON AND LATER THIS WEEK WILL BE DELIVERED FOR

7 SIGNATURE WITH THE CITY OF AVALON.

8

9 **SUP. KNABE:** SO IT'S IN PROCESS TO BE DELIVERED TO THE CITY OF
10 AVALON, IS THAT CORRECT?

11

12 **JEFF LAWRENCE:** CORRECT.

13

14 **SUP. KNABE:** ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU.

15

16 **JEFF LAWRENCE:** SURE.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. DR. CLAVREUL? MR. SACHS? YES.

19

20 **DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL:** GOOD MORNING. DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL.

21 I AM IN FAVOR TO LOOK AT THIS PROJECT. I THINK IT CANNOT HURT.

22 AND IF WE CAN OBTAIN SOME SUPPORT TO DO IT, I THINK WE SHOULD

23 TRY TO DO IT. SO I AM TOTALLY OPEN TO THAT. THANK YOU.

24

25 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, DOCTOR.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **ARNOLD SACHS:** THANK YOU. ARNOLD SACHS. AND JUST OUT OF
3 CURIOSITY WITH THE MEMBERS, WHO WAS CATCHING THE FERRY THAT
4 YOU HAD TO HOLD THIS ITEM?

5

6 **SUP. KNABE:** AVALON IS AN ISLAND JUST IN CASE YOU'RE
7 INTERESTED.

8

9 **ARNOLD SACHS:** THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR KNABE. I'M THINKING THOSE
10 PEOPLE WHO WOULD HAVE CAUGHT A FERRY WOULD HAVE WANTED TO COME
11 OVER HERE AND SPEAK? AND YET NOBODY IS SPEAKING. SO THAT'S THE
12 QUESTION.

13

14 **SUP. KNABE:** YOU'RE NOT DONE YET, ARE YOU?

15

16 **ARNOLD SACHS:** I'M NOT DONE YET, NO, I'M NOT. ACTUALLY, I JUST
17 PICKED UP THIS ARTICLE. I'VE HELD ONTO IT. IT'S FROM JULY 15,
18 2012 FROM THE L.A. TIMES AND IT MENTIONS RESIDENTS OPPOSE
19 WATER RATE INCREASE. IT'S ABOUT AVALON AND EDISON. IT MENTIONS
20 IN THIS ARTICLE THAT EDISON HAS SPENT 2.6 MILLION ON
21 IMPROVEMENTS FROM 1985 TO THE YEAR 2000, BUT OVER THE NEXT
22 DECADE, IMPROVEMENTS COST \$18.8 MILLION. RALPH-- THIS IS AND
23 I'M GOING TO QUOTE, "ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE RALPH ROBERT
24 BARNETT, HE SAID SINCE SPENDING IS EITHER A RESULT OF
25 NEGLIGENCE OF THE SYSTEM IN PRIOR YEARS IN AN ATTEMPT TO MAKE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE UTILITY MORE SALEABLE OR BOTH," BARNETT SAID. SO IT'S THIS
2 KIND OF INFORMATION THAT MAKES ME WONDER WHAT BOAT YOU'RE ON,
3 SUPERVISOR KNABE? IN GETTING TO DEAL WITH EDISON, BECAUSE THIS
4 ARTICLE ALSO MENTIONS EDISON ACQUIRED THE ISLAND'S WATER, GAS
5 AND ELECTRIC UTILITY IN 1962. AND THAT WOULD HAVE BEEN
6 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON. "THE" SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON.
7 IN DEALING WITH SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON, I'M NOT REAL-- YOU
8 REALLY HAVE TO WEAR A COUPLE OF PAIRS OF GLOVES BECAUSE WHEN
9 THEY DID THE ENERGY DEREGULATION ROUTINE--

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. SUPERVISOR KNABE?

12

13 **SUP. KNABE:** I JUST ASK THE GENTLEMAN FROM AVALON IF HE'D COME
14 FORWARD AND A MEMBER OF EDISON AGAIN. JUST HAVE A COUPLE OF
15 QUESTIONS. ONE EACH IS FINE. I JUST WANTED TO GIVE YOU THE
16 OPPORTUNITY FIRST OF ALL TO THE EDISON FOLKS, THANK YOU FOR
17 ARRANGING AND TO THE CITY FOR ALLOWING OUR TROOPS TO GET OVER
18 THERE AND TAKE A TOUR AND SEE EXACTLY WHAT WE'RE DEALING WITH
19 AND UNIQUENESS OF THE ISLAND. AND I WOULD JUST ASK YOU: IS
20 THERE ANY COMMENTS YOU WANT THE MAKE ON BEHALF OF THE CITY AS
21 YOU WORK TOWARDS THIS SOLUTION?

22

23 **SPEAKER:** WELL, THANK YOU, SUPERVISOR. AS YOU KNOW, THE
24 SITUATION OVER THERE IS REAL BAD. YOUR DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC
25 WORKS HAS BEEN VERY HELPFUL AND WE'RE LEARNING AS WE GO AHEAD.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DESALINATION PROCESS ISN'T THAT FAMILIAR WITH EVERYBODY IN THE
2 CITY, AND WE'RE LEARNING AS WE GO ALONG. YOUR HELP HAS BEEN
3 FANTASTIC. IF WE ENTER STAGE 3 DROUGHT, IT'S GOING TO CRIPPLE
4 THE SITUATION ON THE ISLAND. THE VISITOR COUNT IS WHAT WE
5 SURVIVE ON. AND SO THIS NEW ADDITION OF THE DESALINATION PLANT
6 AND EDISON'S COOPERATION WITH THE CITY HAS BEEN FANTASTIC. AND
7 WE CERTAINLY COULD USE AS MUCH HELP AS WE CAN RECEIVE.

8

9 **SUP. KNABE:** THANK YOU. TO THE EDISON FOLKS, AGAIN THANK YOU
10 FOR YOUR EFFORTS. THE QUESTION I HAVE IS: AS IT RELATES TO--
11 AS I UNDERSTAND IT, THERE IS STILL DISCUSSIONS OF A PENDING
12 SALE OF THE WATER RIGHTS TO ANOTHER COMPANY, IS THAT CORRECT?

13

14 **RON HYDE:** YES.

15

16 **SUP. KNABE:** WOULD THERE BE ANY IMPACT IN THIS DESALINIZATION
17 PROGRAM SHOULD THAT SALE TAKE PLACE?

18

19 **RON HYDE:** NO. BY THE WAY, I'M RON HYDE, I'M THE DISTRICT
20 MANAGER FOR SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA EDISON ON CATALINA ISLAND
21 RESPONSIBLE FOR ALL THE OPERATIONS THERE. NO, EVERYTHING WOULD
22 BE TRANSFERRED TO THE NEW OWNER AS IT STANDS WITH EDISON TODAY
23 HAVE THE BUT THAT TRANSACTION IS A COUPLE OF YEARS OUT. THE
24 PROCESS TO GO THROUGH THAT TRANSACTION WILL TAKE APPROXIMATELY
25 AT LEAST 18 MONTHS.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. KNABE:** THAT WOULDN'T BE ANY IMPACT ON THE EXISTING M.O.U.
3 AS SIGNED BY EDISON AND THE CITY, IS THAT CORRECT?

4

5 **RON HYDE:** NO IMPACT.

6

7 **SUP. KNABE:** ALL RIGHT. I DON'T HAVE ANY FURTHER QUESTIONS.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MR. FORD. YOU DID VERY
10 WELL. LOOKING WELL.

11

12 **SUP. KNABE:** GREAT REPORT, MR. FORD.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** KEEP IT UP. IT'S PLEASURE TO ALWAYS
15 WORK WITH YOU.

16

17 **SUP. KNABE:** THANK YOU AGAIN.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. MOTION BY SUPERVISOR KNABE.
20 SECOND. WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED. THANK YOU TO THE STAFF.
21 ALL RIGHT. SET ITEM S-1? OKAY. GIVE YOUR NAME FOR THE RECORD.

22

23 **HERNAN VERA:** GOOD MORNING. MY NAME IS HERNAN VERA AND I HAVE
24 HAD THE HONOR OF SERVING ON THE WORKING GROUP FOR THE CIVILIAN
25 OVERSIGHT COMMISSION ON BEHALF OR APPOINTED BY SUPERVISOR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SOLIS. I HAVE WITH ME A GENTLEMAN THAT YOU KNOW WELL,
2 INSPECTOR GENERAL MAX HUNTSMAN AND NEIL TYLER FROM THE L.A.
3 SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, AS WELL, BOTH WORKING GROUP MEMBERS WITH
4 ME ALONG WITH VINCENT HARRIS THAT I SAW OVER THERE AND OUR
5 OTHER MEMBERS, LES ROBBINS, BRENT RUN AND OUR CHAIR, DEAN
6 HANSEL, WHO SENDS HIS REGRETS BUT IS OUT OF TOWN AND WASN'T
7 ABLE TO JOIN US TODAY. SO THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO
8 ADDRESS YOU ON AN ISSUE THAT WE'VE BEEN WORKING HARD ON FOR
9 THE LAST SIX MONTHS. AND BEFORE I REALLY JUMP IN, I ALSO
10 WANTED THE GIVE OUR THANKS TO THE OFFICE OF COUNTY COUNSEL AND
11 THE COMMISSION SERVICES FROM THE C.E.O.'S OFFICE THAT REALLY
12 MADE THIS ALL POSSIBLE BECAUSE WE GATHERED INPUT AND THEY WERE
13 THERE EVERY STEP OF THE WAY. SO LET ME SET THE STAGE A LITTLE
14 BIT. ON DECEMBER 9, 2014, THIS BOARD VOTED UNANIMOUSLY TO
15 CREATE THE WORKING GROUP FOR THE CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT
16 COMMISSION. AND WE WERE CHARGED WITH MAKING RECOMMENDATIONS ON
17 THE MISSION, THE AUTHORITY, THE SIZE, THE STRUCTURE AND THE
18 RELATIONSHIP TO THE OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL AND THE
19 SHERIFF. AND THAT'S EXACTLY WHAT WE TRIED TO DO. WE SET OUT TO
20 GATHER INPUT FROM THE PUBLIC. AND TO DO THAT, WE HELD 13
21 PUBLIC MEETINGS IN 9 TOWN HALLS ACROSS THE COUNTY. WE REVIEWED
22 LITERATURE FROM EXPERTS. WE SPOKE WITH EXPERTS AND ADVOCATES
23 FROM ALL SIDES. AND WE ANALYZED. WE ASKED QUESTIONS AND WE
24 STARTED WITH AN OPEN MIND. AND I HOPE YOU'LL AGREE WITH ME
25 THAT THE REPORTS THAT WE SUBMITTED TO YOU REALLY WAS A PRODUCT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OF CONSENSUS. WE HEARD THE FEEDBACK FROM THE COMMUNITY. BUT I
2 THINK ALL OF US WHO WORKED ON THIS-- AND I HAVE NEIL SITTING
3 NEXT TO ME-- WERE CRITICIZED FOR WORDSMITHING THE REPORT TO
4 DEATH. BUT WE DID THAT BECAUSE WE REALLY TRIED TO FIND
5 LANGUAGE THAT WE COULD ALL BE COMFORTABLE WITH. AND SO WE WENT
6 THROUGH THIS PROCESS STARTING FROM SQUARE ONE, AND I'M HAPPY
7 TO REPORT THAT EXCEPT FOR TWO ISSUES THAT I'LL ADDRESS,
8 EVERYTHING ELSE, THE DOZENS AND HUNDREDS OF WORD CHOICES AND
9 RECOMMENDATIONS WERE ALL CONSENSUS ITEMS. AND SO WE'RE PROUD
10 OF THAT. AND I THINK IT REALLY DOES REFLECT THE SPIRIT OF
11 COMPROMISE THAT WE WERE CHARGED WITH AND I HOPE WE SUCCEEDED
12 IN. SO LET ME TODAY JUST BRIEFLY GIVE SOME COLOR COMMENTARY ON
13 THE REPORT THAT YOU HAVE HAD FOR A FEW WEEKS AND TO COVER SOME
14 OF THE MAJOR THEMATIC POINTS OF THAT REPORT. FIRST OF ALL, ON
15 THE RESPONSIBILITIES, I THINK FOR US THE KEY WAS THE TERM
16 OVERSIGHT IN THE BODY THAT YOU CREATED, THE CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT
17 COMMISSION. WHAT DOES OVERSIGHT MEAN? WE LOOKED AT OTHER
18 CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARDS AROUND THE COUNTRY AND WHAT JUMPED OUT
19 AT US WAS REALLY THREE BROAD POWERS, BROADLY DEFINED POWERS.
20 ONE IS TO LOOK AT SYSTEMIC ISSUES, TO REVIEW, TO INVESTIGATE,
21 TO ANALYZE AND MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS ON OPERATIONAL POLICIES
22 AND PROCEDURES AFFECTING CIVIL RIGHTS ISSUES, AFFECTING
23 DETENTION CONDITION ISSUES AND OTHER ISSUES THAT ARE IMPORTANT
24 TO THE COMMUNITY. SO THAT'S ONE. TWO IS TO LOOK AT INDIVIDUAL
25 INSTANCES OF ALLEGED EXCESSIVE FORCE, ISSUES AGAIN RELATING TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE DETENTION CONDITIONS AND CIVIL RIGHTS ISSUES. ON THAT, WE
2 RECEIVED COMMUNITY INPUT AND MAKE RECOMMENDATIONS WHERE
3 APPROPRIATE WITHOUT INTERFERING WITH THE SCOPE OF OTHER
4 INVESTIGATIONS, AND WE WERE VERY CAREFUL ABOUT THAT. AND THE
5 THIRD PART OF THE RESPONSIBILITIES IS A ROLE AND THIS IS
6 SOMETHING THAT MY FRIEND NEIL TYLER EMPHASIZED A LOT, THE ROLE
7 OF SERVING AS A BRIDGE TO THE COMMUNITY TO PROVIDING MORE
8 TRANSPARENCY, TO CREATING A TWO-WAY DIALOGUE, TWO-WAY DIALOGUE
9 TO RECEIVE INFORMATION AND TO BE ABLE TO PROVIDE INFORMATION
10 BACK TO THE COMMUNITY. SO THOSE WERE THE THREE BROADLY DEFINED
11 RESPONSIBILITIES. AND WE TRIED OUR BEST TO CRAFT THE LANGUAGE
12 CAREFULLY TO GIVE-- TO RECOMMEND THOSE POWERS. NEXT WE LOOKED
13 AT THE SIZE AND COMPOSITION, AND WE QUICKLY CAME TO THE
14 RECOMMENDATION OF HAVING 9 MEMBERS, EACH SUPERVISOR SELECTING
15 ONE AND THEN HAVING THE REMAINING FOUR SELECTED BY MAJORITY
16 VOTE. AND WE INCLUDED FOR THE COMPLETENESS OF THE RECORD ALL
17 THE OTHER OPTIONS THAT WERE RECOMMENDED BY DIFFERENT COMMUNITY
18 GROUPS OR WORKING GROUP MEMBERS. THEY'RE ALL IN THERE. BUT
19 WHEN WE TOOK A VOTE, THE ONE THAT GATHERED THE MOST SUPPORT
20 WAS OPTION ONE. AND TO PROVIDE A LITTLE MORE FEEDBACK ON THAT,
21 INITIALLY WE THOUGHT WE'LL HAVE APPOINTED MEMBERS AND
22 COMMUNITY MEMBERS. AND AS WE STARTED HEARING INPUT AND WE
23 STARTED THINKING MORE ABOUT IT, WE THOUGHT: THERE SHOULDN'T BE
24 TWO CLASSES OF COMMISSIONERS. EVERYONE'S WORKING FOR THE
25 COMMUNITY. EVERYONE'S A PUBLIC MEMBER. SO WE THOUGHT THERE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SHOULD BE A PUBLIC APPLICATION PROCESS THE WAY THAT MOST OF
2 THE BOARDS ARE NOW. AND THEN THE SELECTION WOULD BE RUN FROM
3 THOSE MEMBERS OR FROM THOSE COMMUNITY MEMBERS THAT APPLY,
4 ALONG THE LINES THAT I DESCRIBED. SO THERE WOULDN'T BE TWO
5 TIERS IN THAT SENSE AND EVERYONE, IN THAT SENSE, REPRESENTS
6 THE PUBLIC. WE ALSO ON THIS POINT HAD SOME DIVISION ABOUT THE
7 PARTICIPATION OF LAW ENFORCEMENT. AND THE MAJORITY-- NOT
8 MAJORITY OPINION, BUT THE MAJORITY VIEW IN THE REPORT WAS TO
9 PROHIBIT CURRENT LAW ENFORCEMENT FROM ANYWHERE AND THEN
10 CURRENT AND FORMER LAW ENFORCEMENT FROM THE L.A. SHERIFF'S
11 DEPARTMENT. AND IN THE VIEW OF THE MAJORITY, IT WAS REALLY TO
12 AVOID THE PERCEPTION, THE APPEARANCE OF ANY CONFLICT OF
13 INTEREST. WE UNDERSTAND AND RESPECT AND THAT OBVIOUSLY THE
14 CONTRIBUTIONS THAT THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, THAT EVERY DEPUTY
15 PUTS IN, WE RESPECT THAT. WE GET IT. THAT'S WHY WE'RE
16 VOLUNTEERING OUR TIME. BUT AT LEAST IN THE VIEW OF THE
17 MAJORITY, WE WANTED TO MAKE SURE THAT THIS GAINED PUBLIC TRUST
18 AND CONFIDENCE TO THE MAXIMUM EXTENT. AND SO THAT'S WHY THAT
19 PARTICULAR RECOMMENDATION WAS MADE. AND YOU HAVE THE VIEWS OF
20 THE MINORITY SAYING LET'S OPEN IT UP TO CURRENT OR AT LEAST
21 FORMER SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT EMPLOYEES, AS WELL. SO I WANTED TO
22 HIGHLIGHT THAT SPLIT ON THAT ISSUE. IN TERMS OF THE
23 RELATIONSHIP WITH THE OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL, WE SET
24 OUT TO TRY TO AVOID CREATING DUPLICATE SYSTEMS, TO HAVE TWO
25 SORT OF COMPETING ORGANIZATIONS, IF YOU WILL, THAT ARE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 STEPPING ON EACH OTHER'S TOES AND OVERLAPLING. WE DIDN'T WANT
2 TO CREATE A COMMISSION THAT DIDN'T WORK WELL WITH THE GREAT
3 WORK THAT MAX HUNTSMAN'S DOING WITH THE OFFICE OF INSPECTOR
4 GENERAL. SO WE HAD LOTS OF DISCUSSIONS ON THAT. AND MAX CAME
5 TO US AND SAID, LOOK, WE CAN MAKE THIS A JOINT EFFORT. AND SO
6 AFTER HEARING THE INPUT AND HAVING THESE DISCUSSIONS, OUR
7 RECOMMENDATION IS THAT THE OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL, IN
8 ESSENCE, REPORTS TO THIS COMMISSION; BUT THE COMMISSION WOULD
9 RELY ON, IN LARGE PART, NOT EXCLUSIVELY, BUT IN LARGE PART,
10 RELY ON THE RESOURCES OF THE OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL
11 TO GO OUT AND DO MUCH OF THE GROUNDWORK, OF THE LEG WORK FOR
12 THE INVESTIGATIONS. SO FOR THAT REASON, WE HAD TO AMEND THE
13 STATUTE THAT PROVIDES THE POWERS FOR THE OFFICE OF INSPECTOR
14 GENERAL, TO MAKE SURE THAT THE LANGUAGE WAS CONSISTENT. AND
15 WE'RE HAPPY WITH HOW THAT TURNED OUT. SO LET ME ADDRESS ONE OF
16 THE ELEPHANTS IN THE ROOM AND THE ISSUE OF SUBPOENA POWER
17 WHICH WAS RECOMMENDED ON A 4-3 VOTE. AGAIN IN THE REPORT
18 YOU'LL FIND THE MAJORITY VIEW AND THE MINORITY VIEW ON THAT. I
19 THINK THOSE OF US WHO SUPPORTED IT STARTED THE PROCESS WITH AN
20 OPEN MIND ANYTHING: LET'S SEE HOW WHAT THE ARGUMENTS PRO AND
21 CON ARE ON THAT ISSUE. AND FOR MYSELF AND THE OTHERS WHO VOTED
22 FOR IT, WE WERE PERSUADED FOR THREE MAIN REASONS THAT SUBPOENA
23 POWERS IS THE WAY TO GO. AND THAT, I THINK, IS REFLECTED IN
24 THE REPORT. FIRST, WE BELIEVE AT THE END OF THIS PROCESS THAT
25 THIS COMMISSION WOULDN'T ENJOY THE FULL TRUST AND CONFIDENCE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OF THE PUBLIC WITHOUT THAT POWER. AND THAT WAS MADE CLEAR TO
2 US. SO MUCH OF THE PUBLIC TESTIMONY CENTERED ON THIS ISSUE. WE
3 LISTENED AND WE TRIED TO KEEP THAT IN MIND. SECOND, IN THE
4 MAJORITY WHO VOTED FOR THIS BELIEVED THAT THIS COMMISSION
5 WOULDN'T BE ABLE TO DO ITS JOB AS EFFECTIVELY WITHOUT ITS
6 POWER. AND WE CAME TO THAT CONCLUSION BECAUSE WE HAVE
7 INCREDIBLE RESPECT FOR THE CURRENT SHERIFF, BUT WE WANTED TO
8 SET UP THIS COMMISSION FOR THE LONG-TERM, AND WE WANTED TO
9 MAKE SURE THAT THAT POWER, IF ONLY UTILIZED RARELY, WAS ABLE
10 TO AT LEAST BE USED WHEN NECESSARY TO EFFECTUATE THE GOALS OF
11 THE COMMISSION. AND FINALLY WE WERE PERSUADED THAT THE
12 COMMISSION ITSELF WOULDN'T BE SEEN AS TRULY INDEPENDENT
13 WITHOUT THIS POWER BECAUSE EVERYTHING WOULD HAVE TO BE
14 NEGOTIATED, AND THE COMMISSION, BOTTOM LINE, WOULD BE
15 DEPENDENT ON THE GENEROSITY OR GOOD WILL OF THE SHERIFF'S
16 DEPARTMENT TO GET THE RECORDS THAT IT NEEDS. AND I THINK THAT
17 THERE ARE LOTS OF WAYS TO BREAK OUT SUBPOENA POWER IN TERMS OF
18 CONFIDENTIALITY, IN TERMS OF WHO SEES THE DOCUMENTS, IN TERMS
19 OF MAX'S INVESTIGATORS, SEEING THE CONFIDENTIAL PERSONNEL
20 RECORDS AND ISSUING A HIGHER LEVEL REPORT TO THE COMMISSION.
21 THAT'S ALL POSSIBLE. I WON'T GET INTO THE DETAILS OF ALL OF
22 THAT NOW. I KNOW THAT THERE ARE A LOT OF DISCUSSIONS ABOUT AN
23 M.O.A. BUT IN THE VIEW OF THE MAJORITY, AT LEAST, THIS WOULD
24 BE IMPORTANT FOR THOSE THREE REASONS. AND I'LL END THAT PART
25 OF THE DISCUSSION TO SAY IN 2000, THE U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RIGHTS DID A STUDY. AND IT CONCLUDED NATIONALLY THAT ALL
2 CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARDS SHOULD HAVE THIS POWER. AND IF YOU LOOK
3 AT IT NOW, NEW YORK, CHICAGO-- [APPLAUSE.] -- PHILADELPHIA,
4 SAN FRANCISCO, SAN DIEGO, THEY ALL HAVE IT. AND IT'S NOT
5 ALWAYS USED. BUT WE'VE SEEN INSTANCES, LIKE ATLANTA, WHERE
6 CITIES THAT DIDN'T HAVE IT, REALLY COULDN'T GET THEIR WORK
7 DONE AND EVENTUALLY HAD TO MOVE TOWARDS A SUBPOENA POWER
8 SYSTEM. SO, AGAIN, ON THAT ISSUE, I'M NOT SPEAKING FOR THE
9 WHOLE WORKGROUP, BUT IT IS ONE THAT IS REPRESENTED ON BOTH
10 SIDES THERE FOR YOUR CONSIDERATION. SO I'LL CLOSE VERY QUICKLY
11 WITH A PERSONAL OBSERVATION. AS A FORMER C.E.O. OF PUBLIC
12 COUNSEL, I'VE HAD MANY OPPORTUNITIES TO BE ON THE OTHER SIDE
13 OF THE COUNSEL TABLE ON PIECES FROM THE SECTION 8, RAIDS IN
14 LANCASTER TO CAMP CHALLENGER, TO LOTS OF ISSUES, BUT I'VE
15 ALWAYS HAD THE UTMOST RESPECT FOR THIS AGENCY FOR BEING A
16 CHANGE AGENT. AND I WANT ALL OF YOU TO KNOW THAT WHAT YOU DID
17 LAST YEAR AND WHAT WE'RE ALL CONTINUING TO DO, THIS IS
18 HISTORIC. THIS IS HUGE. THIS IS SOMETHING THAT I CAN SAY THAT
19 THE CIVIL RIGHTS COMMUNITY HAS ASKED FOR, HAS YEARNED FOR A
20 LONG TIME. AND WE HAVE TO DO IT RIGHT. IT'S BEEN A PLEASURE
21 FOR ME TO WORK ON YOUR BEHALF TO TRY TO TAKE THOSE BABY STEPS.
22 BUT WE HAVE A LOT MORE WORK TO DO. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH. AND
23 WE'RE HAPPY, ALL THREE OF US, TO ANSWER QUESTIONS.
24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME ASK COUNTY COUNSEL. IS THE
2 PROCESS FOR A CHARTER AMENDMENT FOR SUBPOENA POWER REQUIRE
3 FORMALLY ESTABLISHING THE COMMISSION AND THE OFFICE OF THE
4 I.G. IN THE CHARTER? OUR STAFFS HAD PREVIOUSLY BEEN TOLD THAT
5 THEY HAD TO BE ESTABLISHED BY CHARTER AND THEN GIVEN SUBPOENA
6 POWER. CAN YOU EXPLAIN THAT?

7

8 **MARY WICKHAM, COUNSEL:** YES, SUPERVISOR. THAT'S A GOOD
9 QUESTION. SOME CASE LAW SUGGESTS THAT IT WOULD BE REQUIRED IN
10 THE CHARTER TO ESTABLISH THE I.G. AND THE COMMISSION. BUT
11 THERE'S OTHER LAWS TO SUGGEST THAT, IN FACT, THAT WOULD NOT BE
12 REQUIRED AND THAT THOSE ENTITIES COULD BE SET UP PURSUANT TO
13 ORDINANCE. SO WE'RE STILL LOOKING AT IT.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** IF THE BOARD CHOOSES TO MAKE CHANGES
16 TO THE COMMISSION OR THE I.G.'S OFFICE, CAN THOSE CHANGES BE
17 DONE BY ORDINANCE OR CAN IT DONE BY A VOTE OF THE PEOPLE?

18

19 **MARY WICKHAM, COUNSEL:** WELL IF OUR ANALYSIS CONCLUDES THAT
20 THOSE ENTITIES COULD BE ESTABLISHED BY ORDINANCE, THEN WE
21 COULD MAKE CHANGES VIA AMENDING THE ORDINANCE AND WOULD NOT BE
22 REQUIRED TO GO BACK TO THE CHARTER TO CHANGE THAT.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MY CONCERN CONTINUES TO BE THE ISSUE
25 OF THE OFFICER BILL OF RIGHTS AND THE PROTECTIONS RELATIVE TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PERSONNEL FILES BEING ABRIDGED. HOW COULD WE ENSURE THAT
2 ACCESS BY THE INSPECTOR GENERAL OR THE COMMISSION NOT VIOLATE
3 THE PEACE OFFICERS' BILL OF RIGHTS OR COMPROMISE THE PRIVACY
4 RIGHTS OF OUR SWORN PERSONNEL?

5

6 **MARY WICKHAM, COUNSEL:** ANOTHER VALID CONCERN. CONFIDENTIALITY
7 IS OF UTMOST IMPORTANCE WE'RE DEALING WITH PEACE OFFICER
8 PERSONNEL RECORDS. WE WOULD HAVE TO ENSURE THAT ANYONE WHO HAS
9 ACCESS TO THOSE RECORDS IS AWARE OF THE NEED TO KEEP THEM
10 CONFIDENTIAL. WE'RE EXPLORING OPTIONS TO ADDRESS THAT ISSUE.
11 WE COULD HAVE CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENTS DRAFTED. AND THERE
12 COULD BE PENALTIES ASSOCIATED WITH VIOLATION OF THOSE
13 AGREEMENTS. UNDER THE LAW, THERE'S ALSO THE PEACE OFFICER BILL
14 OF RIGHTS RECOGNIZES THAT IF YOU VIOLATE IT AND BREACH
15 CONFIDENTIALITY, THAT THERE COULD BE CONSEQUENCES, EVEN
16 MISDEMEANOR CONSEQUENCES. SO WE WOULD HAVE TO JUST EDUCATE THE
17 INDIVIDUALS THAT HAVE ACCESS TO THE CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION
18 OF THESE ISSUES AND THEN HOLD THEM ACCOUNTABLE TO IT.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MR. VERA, THE O.I.G. SERVES AS THE
21 INVESTIGATIVE ARM FOR THE COMMISSION, SO WHY WOULD YOU BE
22 RECOMMENDING THAT BOTH THE COMMISSION AND THE O.I.G. HAVE
23 SUBPOENA POWER?

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **HERNAN VERA:** WELL, BECAUSE I THINK WITH WITHOUT IT, THERE MAY
2 BE SOME LEGAL QUESTIONS ABOUT WHAT TYPE OF EVEN HIGH LEVEL
3 ACCESS THAT COMMISSIONERS WOULD BE ABLE TO HAVE. AND I THINK
4 IF THE-- IF WE NEED TO GO TO THE BALLOT BOX, ANYWAY, FOR
5 SUBPOENA POWER, WE CAN SET UP, AS COUNTY COUNSEL IS SAYING,
6 MECHANISMS FOR PROTECTING CONFIDENTIALITY. SO I THINK THAT
7 THAT'S-- THE MAIN ISSUE IS HAVING THAT POWER, THEN HOW WE
8 PROTECT IS, I THINK, A VERY IMPORTANT BUT VERY DOABLE NEXT
9 STEP.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NEXT FOR THE FOLLOW, THEY SAY THIS
12 FINAL REPORT CONTEMPLATES SUBPOENA POWER PLUS A MEMORANDUM OF
13 AGREEMENT BETWEEN THE SHERIFF AND THE O.I.G. AND ULTIMATELY
14 THE COMMISSION. IT SPELLS OUT THE ISSUES OF ACCESS. I BELIEVE
15 YOU ARE CURRENTLY WORKING ON SUCH AN M.O.A. WITH THE SHERIFF
16 WHICH WOULD BE IN LIEU OF SUBPOENA POWER NOT IN ADDITION TO
17 SUBPOENA POWER. ALSO INDICATING THAT GIVEN THE MEMORANDUM OF
18 AGREEMENT, YOU WOULD NOT HAVE VOTED IN FAVOR OF THE SUBPOENA
19 POWER IF THE WORKING GROUP CONTINUED MEETING. CLARIFY THE
20 POSITION ON THAT, WHY IT HAS CHANGED.

21

22 **MAX HUNTSMAN:** THE SHERIFF HAS BEEN ALWAYS VERY STRONGLY
23 OPPOSED TO SUBPOENA POWER FOR CONCERNS AND MR. TYLER COULD
24 ADDRESS THEM MORE DIRECTLY IF THE BOARD WANTED. BUT THAT'S
25 BEEN A VERY STRONG CONCERN OF THE SHERIFFS. AND IN ORDER TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ACCOMPLISH THE GOALS OF THIS BOARD, I THINK WHAT'S IMPORTANT
2 IS COMPLETE ACCESS. UNDER GOVERNMENT CODE 25303 THIS BOARD
3 NEEDS TO HAVE ACCESS THROUGH SOME MECHANISM IN ORDER TO
4 SUPERVISE AS REQUIRED BY LAW. AND AT THE TIME WE TOOK THAT
5 VOTE, THERE WAS NO M.O.A. ON THE TABLE. WE STILL DO NOT HAVE
6 AN M.O.A. IN PLACE. I'VE BEEN HERE FOR A YEAR AND A HALF AND
7 HAVEN'T BEEN ABLE TO GET AN M.O.A. IN THAT CONTEXT, AS I
8 STATED, IN THE WORKING GROUP, WE HAD NO OPTION BUT TO PURSUE
9 SOMETHING ELSE THAT WOULD ALLOW US TO IMPLEMENT THAT GOAL. BUT
10 IT'S IMPORTANT TO REMEMBER THE ULTIMATE GOAL IS ACCESS. AND
11 THE ABILITY OF THE BOARD OR WHATEVER, A GROUP OF FUNCTIONING
12 BODIES THE GROUP CREATES TO EXERCISE OVERSIGHT TO MONITOR
13 WHAT'S GOING ON AT THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT. MR. VERA
14 MENTIONED A REPORT AT A NATIONAL LEVEL RECOMMENDING SUBPOENA
15 POWER. WELL WE HERE IN CALIFORNIA OPERATE UNDER A SET OF LAWS
16 THAT LIMIT OUR OPTIONS, AND WHICH ULTIMATELY THE LEGAL
17 THEORIES I'VE PRESENTED SINCE THE TIME WE BEGAN WILL BE TESTED
18 IN COURT. AND I THINK IT'S MOST IMPORTANT FOR THE BOARD AND
19 THE SHERIFF TO COME TO AN AGREEMENT AS TO HOW TO IMPLEMENT THE
20 GOVERNMENT CODE 25303, TO BEGIN IMPLEMENTING IT AND THEN FOR
21 THAT, IF IT IS LITIGATED, TO BE LITIGATED IN THAT CONTEXT. AND
22 I THINK THAT'S WHAT'S IMPORTANT IN ORDER TO ACCOMPLISH THIS
23 BOARD'S GOALS. SUBPOENA POWER BY ITSELF DOES NOT GET US ACCESS
24 TO THE KIND OF DETAILED INTERNAL INFORMATION THAT I THINK IS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ABSOLUTELY CRITICAL IN ORDER TO ACCOMPLISH THE GOALS OF THIS
2 BOARD.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THERE WAS A LOT OF DISCUSSION ON THE
5 ISSUE OF CURRENT OR PAST MEMBERS OF THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT
6 TO BE ABLE TO BE CONSIDERED FOR APPOINTMENT. MR. VERA, WHAT
7 WOULD THOSE FACTORS BE? AND WHY WOULD THOSE FACTORS NOT BE
8 CONSIDERED WHEN THEY MAY ACTUALLY POSSESS TREMENDOUS INSIGHT,
9 JUST AS WE SAW WITH SHERIFF JOHN SCOTT, WHO LEFT THE
10 DEPARTMENT BECAUSE HE DID NOT LIKE THE DIRECTION THE
11 DEPARTMENT WAS HEADING.

12

13 **HERNAN VERA:** YEAH. WE THOUGHT ABOUT THE DIFFERENT PERMUTATIONS
14 AND WE THOUGHT ABOUT CERTAIN EXAMPLES. A POLICE CAPTAIN FROM
15 SAN JOSE WHO IS NOW RETIRED BUT HAS INCREDIBLE EXPERIENCE THAT
16 WANTS TO SERVE, TERRIFIC. WE WOULD DEFINITELY VALUE THAT
17 EXPERIENCE. THERE WOULD BE NOTHING DISQUALIFYING HIM OR HER
18 FROM SERVING. HOWEVER, OR ON THE OTHER HAND, LET'S SAY YOU
19 HAVE A SHERIFF'S DEPUTY WHO JUST RETIRED TWO YEARS AGO, NOW ON
20 THE COMMISSION, OVERSEEING CASES AND POLICIES AND PRACTICES
21 AND PERSONNEL THAT HE OR SHE WORKED WITH FOR 30 YEARS. IN OUR
22 VIEW, THAT WOULD PRESENT AT LEAST AN APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT
23 BECAUSE WE'D BE MAKING RECOMMENDATIONS-- OR THAT COMMISSIONER
24 WOULD BE MAKING, ARE RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PEOPLE THAT HE OR SHE
25 REALLY KNEW WELL. AND SO THAT'S HOW WE TRIED TO FIND A

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BALANCE, TO SAY FOR SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT PERSONNEL, EVEN IF
2 YOU ARE RETIRED, THERE IS A LIKELIHOOD THAT YOU WOULD BE
3 OVERSEEING PEOPLE THAT YOU KNOW. WHEREAS IF YOU'RE TALKING
4 ABOUT OTHERS, LAW ENFORCEMENT FROM ANOTHER JURISDICTION, THEN
5 IF YOU'RE RETIRED, THERE SHOULDN'T BE ANY PROBLEM WITH HAVING
6 YOU SERVE. AND I SHOULD NOTE THAT THAT WAS A COMPROMISED VIEW.
7 A LOT OF THE TESTIMONY THAT WE HEARD AND WE WERE ASKED TO
8 ADOPT WAS ABSOLUTELY NO LAW ENFORCEMENT AT ALL. THIS IS
9 CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT. AND SO WE TRIED TO FIND A MIDDLE GROUND
10 THROUGH THAT. [APPLAUSE]

11

12 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** PLEASE, PLEASE. AGAIN, JOHN SCOTT CAME
13 IN, HAD KNOWLEDGE AND PROVIDED NEEDED LEADERSHIP AND
14 DIRECTION. AND THE DEPARTMENT IS BETTER BECAUSE OF THAT
15 INSTITUTIONAL KNOWLEDGE HE HAD BEING A FORMER MEMBER OF THE
16 DEPARTMENT AND NOW UNDERSHERIFF IN ORANGE COUNTY. SO AGAIN YOU
17 WOULD PRECLUDE SOMEBODY LIKE A JOHN SCOTT WITH THAT
18 INSTITUTIONAL KNOWLEDGE TO MAKE APPROPRIATE DECISIONS. SO,
19 AGAIN, A BLANKET EXEMPTION WOULD PRECLUDE THOSE TYPES OF
20 INDIVIDUALS COMING FORWARD AND WANTING TO SERVE. THAT'S MY
21 CONCERN. AND THE ISSUE OF THE COMPOSITION, THE REPORT
22 RECOMMENDS GIVING CONSIDERATIONS FOR PROTECTED CLASSES
23 RELATIVE TO DIVERSITY. DOES THAT MEAN IF TWO PEOPLE ARE
24 EQUALLY QUALIFIED TO SERVE ON THE COMMISSION, ONE IS IN THE
25 COUNTRY ILLEGALLY, THE OTHER IS EITHER A U.S. CITIZEN OR A

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 LEGAL IMMIGRANT WHO IS HERE LEGALLY, THE APPOINTMENT GOES TO
2 THE PERSON WHO ENTERED THE COUNTRY ILLEGALLY?

3

4 **HERNAN VERA:** WELL, IN TERMS OF DIVERSITY FACTORS, I BELIEVE
5 ALL FIVE THOUGHT IT WAS IMPORTANT TO TAKE THOSE FACTORS INTO
6 ACCOUNT. WE'RE NOT SAYING QUOTAS. WE'RE NOT CREATING ANY KIND
7 OF POINTS SYSTEM. WE'RE JUST SAYING MAKE THAT A PRIORITY TO
8 GIVE THOSE FACTORS SOME WEIGHT. AND IN TERMS OF IMMIGRATION
9 STATUS, YOU KNOW, AS SUPERVISOR SOLIS KNOWS, IMMIGRATION
10 STATUS DOESN'T AFFECT YOUR RIGHT TO EARN A MINIMUM WAGE OR
11 HAVE THE LAWS APPLY EQUALLY AND FAIRLY TO YOU. SO WE THOUGHT
12 IMMIGRATION STATUS IS IMPORTANT. THIS IS A VERY DIVERSE
13 COUNTY. AND WE WANT TO ENCOURAGE PEOPLE OF DIFFERENT
14 IMMIGRATION STATUSES TO SAY: ME TOO. I WANT TO BETTER MY
15 COMMUNITY BY SERVING ON THIS. I DON'T THINK THIS REQUIRES
16 ANYBODY TO DO ANY KIND OF CHECKS OR TO ASK ANY PROBING
17 QUESTIONS LIKE THAT. WE SIMPLY WANTED TO ENCOURAGE DIVERSE
18 CANDIDATES TO APPLY.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THE REPORT RECOMMENDS OPTION 1 OF 5
21 WHICH PLACES THE SELECTION OF ALL APPOINTEES UP TO THE BOARD,
22 ONE BY EACH SUPERVISOR AND FOUR BY THE MAJORITY OF THE BOARD:
23 OPTION 3 ALLOWING THE FOUR TO BE SELECTED BY THE FIVE
24 APPOINTED BY EACH SUPERVISOR WHICH WAS A PROCESS USED BY THE
25 CITIZENS COMMISSION ON JAIL VIOLENCE WHICH WORKED VERY WELL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AND HAD FULL SUPPORT OF OUR BOARD. WHAT WERE THE PROS AND CONS
2 OF THAT OPTION?

3

4 **HERNAN VERA:** IF I REMEMBER CORRECTLY, OPTION 3 WAS LEAVING THE
5 FOUR TO THE COMMISSIONERS THAT ARE ORIGINALLY SELECTED. IT IN
6 A SENSE ELEVATES THEM TO A SLIGHTLY HIGHER STATUS BY SAYING
7 YOU WERE PICKED FIRST AND THEN YOU PICKED THE OTHERS. WE
8 WANTED A LEVEL PLAYING FIELD TO SAY EVERYONE GETS TO APPLY.
9 EVERYONE IS ON THE SAME TERMS. EVERYONE SUBMITS AN
10 APPLICATION. AND THEN THE SELECTIONS ARE MADE. I MEAN, I THINK
11 ON THAT YOU REALLY CAN'T GO WRONG. WE'RE NOT SAYING THE
12 COMMISSION SELECTED IN A DIFFERENT WAY WOULDN'T WORK; IT'S
13 JUST WE WERE-- I'LL BE A LITTLE BLUNT HERE. WE WERE LOUDLY
14 CRITICIZED FOR LAYING OUT TOO MANY OPTIONS. SO WE SELECTED
15 ONE. AND WE THOUGHT THAT LEAVING IT IN YOUR GOOD HANDS WOULD
16 BE THE BEST ONE.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NEIL. YOU SPENT A CAREER WITH THE
19 DEPARTMENT, WE APPRECIATE YOUR LEADERSHIP, CONSTRUCTIVE
20 LEADERSHIP, BOTH THROUGH THE BAD AND GOOD TIMES. WE REALLY
21 LOOK UPON YOU FOR YOUR INSTITUTIONAL KNOWLEDGE AND YOUR
22 PERSONAL CHARACTER AND INTEGRITY AND LEADERSHIP. COULD YOU
23 GIVE US SOME COMMENTS? BECAUSE YOU HAD VOTED IN THE MINORITY.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **NEIL TYLER:** WELL, I WANT TO EMPHASIZE FIRST THAT I'M
2 REPRESENTING SHERIFF JIM MCDONNELL WHO VERY MUCH FAVORS AN
3 OVERSIGHT COMMISSION AND I KNOW THAT EACH INDIVIDUAL
4 SUPERVISOR'S HEARD THIS BEFORE SO I APOLOGIZE FOR THE
5 REDUNDANCY. BUT FOR THE MEMBERS OF THE AUDIENCE THAT HAVEN'T
6 HEARD THIS, HE FAVORS CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT. YOU SHOULD HAVE
7 HEARD THAT BECAUSE HE'S BEEN TALKING ABOUT IT SINCE HE RAN FOR
8 OFFICE. HE'S LOOKING FORWARD TO THE OPPORTUNITY TO WORK WITH
9 THIS COMMISSION. HE ASKED ME TO REPRESENT HIM ON THE WORKING
10 GROUP BOARD. SO I DID THAT AND TRIED TO CONVEY HIS INPUT AS
11 BEST I COULD. HAS HERNAN SAID, WE DID A REALLY GOOD JOB OF--
12 SOMETIMES THIS WORD IS NEGATIVE INTERPRETATION, BUT I THINK
13 COMPROMISE HAS A NOBLE SIDE TO IT AND WE DID DO THAT, TRYING
14 TO, AS HE SAID, WORD IT JUST EXACTLY RIGHT SO OUR
15 COMMUNICATIONS WERE AS CLEAR AS POSSIBLE. THE RESULT WAS THAT
16 A REPORT THAT THE SHERIFF'S VERY PROUD OF AND STANDS BEHIND
17 ALMOST ALL OF. AND IT DOES NOTE, AS HERNAN MENTIONED, WHERE
18 THE SHERIFF GAVE SOME OF THE RECOMMENDATIONS, GIVE HIM PAUSE
19 AND HE HAS CONCERNS ABOUT THEM OR HE DISAGREES WITH IT. THE
20 THREE PRIMARY AREAS BEING SUBPOENA AUTHORITY FOR THE
21 COMMISSION WHICH HE FEELS IS UNNECESSARY AND HAS SOME
22 DRAWBACKS, THE COMMISSION COMPOSITION. HE DID NOT PREFER THE
23 OPTION THAT'S LISTED AS THE PRIMARY ONE, THE WORKING GROUP
24 RECOMMENDED TO THE BOARD. HE DID HAVE A CONCERN ABOUT WHAT YOU
25 HAD MENTIONED, SUPERVISOR ANTONOVICH, CONCERNING IMMIGRATION

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 STATUS. HE UNDERSTOOD THE REASONS FOR IT. THE REASON THAT I
2 WENT AHEAD AND SAID OKAY, I'LL STAND DOWN MY INPUT ON IT IS
3 BECAUSE WE RESPECT ALL IMMIGRANTS IN THIS COUNTRY, BOTH THE
4 KINDS THAT ARE REGISTERED AND THE KINDS THAT HAVEN'T YET FOR
5 THE THINGS THEY CONTRIBUTED, AS WELL AS MILITARY SERVICE AND
6 EVERYTHING ELSE THAT THEY DO FOR US. BUT THE CONCERN ABOUT THE
7 TECHNICAL LEGALITY IS SOMETHING THAT THE SHERIFF WOULD NOTICE
8 AND WONDER ABOUT, WHETHER THAT CIRCUMSTANCE YOU BROUGHT
9 FORWARD WOULD CAUSE PROBLEMS FOR THE COMMISSION OR FOR THE
10 COUNTY AND CAUSE A DIVIDE. SO THOSE ARE HIS THREE MAIN
11 CONCERNS. AND THE REPORT DID A VERY NICE JOB OF EXPRESSING HIS
12 INPUT ON EACH TOPIC. SO RATHER THAN MY EXPRESSING HIS CONCERN
13 ABOUT SUBPOENA AUTHORITY AND TAKING TOO MUCH TIME, I'LL LEAVE
14 IT AT THAT AND REFER YOU TO THE REPORT UNLESS YOU HAVE
15 SPECIFIC QUESTIONS ABOUT ASPECTS OF HIS INPUT.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** BESIDES THAT, DO YOU HAVE ANY COMMENTS
18 TO MAKE?

19

20 **NEIL TYLER:** NO, SIR.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS?

23

24 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. MAYOR AND
25 COLLEAGUES. LET ME BEGIN BY ACKNOWLEDGING THE COMMITMENT AND

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE WORK OF THE OVERSIGHT COMMISSION WORKING GROUP. I THINK
2 YOU HAVE PUT YOURSELF IN GOOD STEAD AND CAUSED US TO HAVE A
3 DOCUMENT WITH WHICH WE CAN WORK AND A PROCESS THAT IS WORTHY
4 OF OUR ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND PRAISE. AND SO I DO WANT TO EXPRESS
5 ON BEHALF OF THE CONSTITUENTS THAT I REPRESENT MY GRATITUDE. I
6 THINK IT'S WELL-ESTABLISHED THAT THE CALIFORNIA STATE
7 CONSTITUTION IS PRESCRIPTIVE WITH RESPECT TO THE BOARD'S SCOPE
8 OF AUTHORITY VIS-A-VIS THE SHERIFF OF THE COUNTY OF LOS
9 ANGELES IS EQUALLY PRESCRIPTIVE WITH RESPECT TO THE SHERIFF'S
10 SCOPE OF AUTHORITY OVER THE DEPARTMENT WITH RESPECT TO
11 OPERATIONS AND PERSONNEL. IT SEEMS TO ME THAT THE AUTHORITY
12 THAT'S VESTED IN THE RESPECTIVE ENTITIES IS CLEAR ENOUGH FOR
13 US TO BE ABLE TO MOVE FORWARD WITH THE ESTABLISHMENT OF AN
14 OVERSIGHT BODY THAT'S INDEPENDENT IN ITS COMPOSITION, REVIEW
15 AND STUDY AND REPORT AND MAKE THE APPROPRIATE RECOMMENDATIONS
16 TO THE SHERIFF WITH RESPECT TO OPERATIONAL ISSUES. THERE'S A
17 DEBATE AS TO WHETHER OR NOT THAT IS BINDING. THERE IS NO
18 DEBATE AS TO WHETHER OR NOT THE BODY CAN BE DULY CONSTITUTED
19 AND MAKE SUCH RECOMMENDATIONS. AND WE TAKE THE SPIRIT OF WHAT
20 SHERIFF MCDONNELL HAS PUBLICLY ASSERTED IN TERMS OF HIS
21 COMMITMENT TO THE ISSUE OF AN OVERSIGHT ENTITY AND TAKE HIM AT
22 HIS WORD. HE DIDN'T HAVE TO DO IT AND YET HE CHOSE TO DO IT.
23 AND THAT HAS TO BE ACKNOWLEDGED. BUT I THINK THE ISSUE OF
24 REFORM ITSELF HAS A BASIS IN WHAT I WOULD LIKE TO CHARACTERIZE
25 AS A MORAL IMPERATIVE. AND THAT IS TO ENSURE THAT THERE IS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 CONSTITUTIONAL POLICING, 21ST CENTURY POLICING IN THE
2 COUNTIES, COMMUNITIES, ALL COMMUNITIES OF THE COUNTY OF LOS
3 ANGELES. AND THAT OBVIOUSLY, THEN, EXTENDS TO WHAT HAPPENS IN
4 THE JAILS OF THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES. AND SO WHEN WE THINK
5 ABOUT THE ISSUE OF STRUCTURAL REFORMS AND ACCOUNTABILITY
6 MECHANISMS, I THINK ABOUT CHANGE, THE CULTURE OF THE SHERIFF'S
7 DEPARTMENT, THIS THEN BECOMES A FEATURE BECAUSE TRANSPARENCY,
8 COMMUNITY INPUT AND THE LIKE BECOMES RATHER FUNDAMENTAL. I
9 MAINTAINED THAT POSITION FROM THE VERY BEGINNING. IT IS NOT AS
10 IF WE ARE ENGAGED IN ANY REVOLUTIONARY ACT HERE WITH RESPECT
11 TO THE ESTABLISHMENT OF AN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION. MIGHT I SAY
12 IT IN THESE TERMS, WE ARE RATHER LATE TO THE PARTY. OVERSIGHT
13 COMMISSIONS EXIST ALL OVER THE LENGTH AND BREADTH OF THIS
14 COUNTRY, AND IT'S ABOUT TIME THAT LOS ANGELES COUNTY GOT WITH
15 THE PROGRAM. SO WE ARE HERE. BUT WHAT'S FUNDAMENTALLY AT
16 STAKE, I BELIEVE, IS THE RESTORATION OF PUBLIC CONFIDENCE,
17 PUBLIC TRUST. LAW ENFORCEMENT CAN'T DO ITS WORK WELL UNLESS IT
18 HAS A PUBLIC THAT RESPECTS IT AND IS PREPARED TO SUPPORT IT.
19 AND THAT OBVIOUSLY EXTENDS ITSELF TO THE ROLE AND
20 RESPONSIBILITY OF EACH OF US AS MEMBERS OF THE BOARD OF
21 SUPERVISORS. AND THIS IS A MOMENT THAT HAS BEEN CHALLENGING,
22 TO PUT IT MILDLY. IT IS NOT A NEW MOMENT. IT IS ESSENTIALLY
23 THE MOMENT THAT WE HAVE INTENTIONALLY FOCUSED ON THE PROBLEMS
24 THAT ARE SYSTEMIC IN NATURE, STRUCTURAL IN NATURE. AND THE
25 HOPE IS WITH MORE SUNSHINE, CALL IT DISINFECTANT, THAT WE CAN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DEAL WITH SOME OF THESE LONG-STANDING PROBLEMS. SO I'M ALL IN
2 WITH RESPECT TO THE BUSINESS OF OVERSIGHT, INDEPENDENT
3 OVERSIGHT, CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT. I SEE NOTHING BUT AN UPSIDE
4 THAT ATTACHES TO SUCH AN ENTITY. PROPERLY DONE. PROPERLY
5 COMPOSED, CONSTRUCTED, THOUGHTFULLY PURSUED. I THINK THE LOS
6 ANGELES COUNTY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT WILL BE BETTER FOR IT. AND
7 THAT'S ESSENTIALLY WHY IN DECEMBER OF LAST YEAR WE IMPANELED
8 THE WORKING GROUP PURSUANT TO HAVING ADOPTED THE MOTION TO
9 MOVE FORWARD WITH AN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION. AND I WANT TO SAY
10 AGAIN THAT THE WORKING GROUP HAS HONORED, FROM MY POINT OF
11 VIEW, THE BOARD'S INSTRUCTIONS, DIRECTION, TO BRING US BACK A
12 PRODUCT WITH WHICH WE CAN WORK. AND I BELIEVE THAT WE ARE AT
13 THIS POINT IN TIME IN A DELIBERATIVE PROCESS LISTENING VERY
14 CAREFULLY, HAVING PAID ATTENTION TO THE SERIES OF HEARINGS AND
15 THE LIKE THAT HAVE TAKEN PLACE. AND THERE'S NOTHING WRONG WITH
16 A HEALTHY DISCUSSION AND/OR DEBATE AROUND THE ISSUES AT HAND.
17 THE TWO OUTSTANDING ISSUES OF CONSEQUENCES, WE'VE ALREADY
18 LISTED THEM, SPEAK TO THE QUESTION OF FORMER SWORN PERSONNEL
19 BEING A MEMBER OF THE COMMISSION AND THE QUESTION OF SUBPOENA
20 POWER. TWO ISSUES THAT HAVE YET TO BE SETTLED AND WORKED OUT
21 AND I BELIEVE THEY WILL BE. MY OBJECTIVE IS TO CAUSE THE
22 COMMISSION TO BE EFFECTIVE. AND MY RESPONSE AND THE WAY I
23 ULTIMATELY DECIDE-- THE WAY I WILL ULTIMATELY DECIDE ON THESE
24 MATTERS IS RELATED TO WHETHER THEY SERVICE THE EFFECTIVENESS
25 OF THE COMMISSION AND IF THEY HONOR WHAT WE FUNDAMENTALLY WANT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO GET TO, WHICH IS THE RESTORATION OF PUBLIC CONFIDENCE,
2 PUBLIC TRUST. IT IS NOT AT ALL UNCOMMON OR UNREASONABLE TO
3 EXPECT THAT THERE WILL BE DIFFERENCES OF OPINION IN TERMS OF
4 HOW THESE TWO OTHER THINGS ARE DISPOSED OF, BUT IN THE FINAL
5 ANALYSIS, I THINK THIS HAS BEEN A WORTHY PROCESS. AND WE'RE
6 NOT YET DONE. BUT I AM FULLY PREPARED TO ENGAGE IT WITH A KIND
7 OF INTENSITY AND CREDIBILITY THAT IT DESERVES. MR. MAYOR,
8 THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO BE HEARD ON THE MATTER. AND
9 ONCE AGAIN THANKS TO WORKING GROUP.

10

11 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** MR. MAYOR?

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR SOLIS?

14

15 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** THANK YOU. I ALSO WANT TO COMPLIMENT THE
16 BOARD FOR HAVING THE FORESIGHT TO MOVE THIS LAST ITEM EARLIER
17 THIS YEAR. BUT I'M REALLY STRUCK BY THE HARD WORK OF THE
18 COMMISSION. I WANT TO THANK THE COMMISSIONERS. AND I WANT TO
19 THANK THE STAFF AND ALL THE PUBLIC THAT CAME OUT TO THE
20 MEETINGS. AND WHILE I HEARD VARIOUS VERSIONS OF WHAT WAS SAID
21 AND THAT THERE WERE CAPTIVE GROUP THAT WOULD REPEATEDLY COME
22 UP WITH THE SAME KINDS OF MESSAGING OR WHATEVER, I STILL THINK
23 IT'S IMPORTANT THAT THE PROCESS HAPPEN BECAUSE OF THE
24 POLITICAL AND THE ENVIRONMENT THAT WE FIND OURSELVES HERE
25 TODAY. I'M STILL CONCERNED ABOUT THE EFFECT OF REALLY HAVING

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TRANSPARENCY AND WHAT THAT MEANS WHEN WE HEARD FROM SEVERAL
2 WITNESSES THAT CAME TO THE PUBLIC HEARINGS AND TESTIFIED AND
3 SAID THAT THEY WERE SUPPORTIVE OF SUBPOENA POWER. CAN YOU WALK
4 US THROUGH WHAT THE PROS AND CONS ARE OF THAT? AND I'D LIKE TO
5 HEAR IF THERE'S VARIATION THERE, IF WE COULD DELINEATE THAT.
6 SO THAT'S MY FIRST QUESTION.

7

8 **HERNAN VERA:** SHOULD I ADDRESS IT FIRST? SO, I THINK THE-- WHAT
9 WE HEARD FROM CITIES LIKE SAN DIEGO, I ALSO SPOKE WITH FOLKS
10 IN ATLANTA IS THAT THE MERE FACT OF HAVING SUBPOENA POWER
11 FACILITATES BROADER ACCESS AND A MORE EFFECTIVE COMMISSION
12 BECAUSE BECAUSE 95, 99 PERCENT OF THE TIME, IT'S NOT NEEDED.
13 IT'S DONE THROUGH THE M.O.A. BUT THE FACT THAT IT EXISTS JUST
14 CREATES MORE OF AN INCENTIVE TO COMPLY AND TO MAKE THE
15 COMMISSION-- ALLOW THE COMMISSION TO HAVE ACCESS TO THE
16 RECORDS THAT IT NEEDS. THAT'S THE BIGGEST, YOU KNOW, PRO. THE
17 JURISDICTIONS THAT HAVEN'T HAD THAT HAVE HAD TO WORK OUT A WAY
18 OF NEGOTIATING FOR RECORDS. AND THEN WHEN THE SHERIFF'S
19 DEPARTMENT SAYS NO, THE CONVERSATION ENDS THERE. THERE'S NO
20 OTHER WAY OF SAYING "WELL, RESPECTFULLY WE DISAGREE. THIS IS
21 CRITICALLY IMPORTANT TO THE COMMUNITY. WE APPRECIATE YOUR
22 VIEWPOINT," BUT HOW TO ADVANCE THAT COMMUNICATION THERE IS NO
23 NEXT STEP. SO I THINK IT MAKES IT MORE EFFECTIVE. I THINK
24 THAT'S WHAT THE U.S. COMMISSION ON CIVIL RIGHTS FOUND AS WELL.
25 IT INCREASES THE PUBLIC TRUST AND CONFIDENCE IN A BODY THAT IS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 GOING TO BE MORE INDEPENDENT BECAUSE NOW IT HAS THE POWER TO
2 SAY TO THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT, "LET'S WORK THIS OUT. BUT WE
3 NEED THOSE RECORDS. WE NEED TO LOOK AT THIS PATTERN AND
4 PRACTICE. WE'VE SEEN THIS 20 TIMES BEFORE. AND MAYBE PRIOR
5 ADMINISTRATIONS, BUT WE NEED TO GET TO THE BOTTOM OF THIS."
6 AND WE NEED TO SEE THOSE RECORDS TO DO THAT AND TO MAKE THAT
7 BROAD SYSTEMIC CHANGE. SO THOSE, I THINK, ARE THE REASONS WHY
8 THE PUBLIC AND EXPERTS HAVE AGREED ON THAT. AND CLEARLY
9 BECAUSE WE DO NOT WANT TO IN ANY WAY SET BACK THE GREAT
10 RELATIONSHIP THAT I THINK THE NEW SHERIFF JIM MCDONNELL'S HAD
11 WITH THIS BOARD, WITH OTHERS, IN TERMS OF REALLY SAYING YES TO
12 ACCOUNTABILITY, YES TO OVERSIGHT AND YES TO THE VAST MAJORITY
13 OF THE POINTS THAT WE'VE RAISED. SO WE DON'T WANT TO TAKE A
14 STEP BACK ON THAT, BUT AT LEAST THOSE IN THE MAJORITY VIEW
15 FELT THAT TO CONSTRUCT A COMMISSION THAT'S EFFECTIVE LONG
16 TERM, THAT WILL BE RESPECTED, THAT WILL HAVE THE CONFIDENCE OF
17 THE COMMUNITY, WE SHOULD GIVE THAT POWER. AND THAT'S SOMETHING
18 THAT THE COMMUNITY WILL NEED TO VOTE ON. IF THE COMMUNITY
19 DOESN'T VALUE THAT, IF THE CITIZENS WHO VOTE DON'T CARE ABOUT
20 THAT, THEN THEY'LL VOTE NO. AND IT WILL BE A COMMUNITY
21 DECISION ABOUT WHAT LEVEL OF OVERSIGHT TO HAVE.

22

23 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** COULD YOU TOUCH ON WHAT THE TIMEFRAME WOULD
24 BE, SAY WE DO NOT LOOK AT SUBPOENA POWER AT THIS TIME? BUT WE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WERE TO CONSIDER IT. WE STILL HAVE THE POTENTIAL OR
2 OPPORTUNITY, I BELIEVE.

3

4 **HERNAN VERA:** I WOULD DEFER THAT TO COUNTY COUNSEL IN TERMS OF
5 TIMELINES FOR PUTTING SOMETHING ON THE BALLOT. THE EARLIEST
6 WOULD BE IN 2016, ANYWAY. BUT I DON'T KNOW OFFHAND WHAT THE
7 TIMELINES WOULD BE IN TERMS OF PLACING THAT ON THE BALLOT, HOW
8 MUCH LEAD TIME WOULD BE NECESSARY. I'M SURE WE COULD FIND THAT
9 OUT.

10

11 **MARY WICKHAM, COUNSEL:** WE LOOKED AT IT YESTERDAY, SUPERVISOR.
12 AND WE THINK WE MAY EVEN BE ABLE TO GO PUT IT ON A JUNE 2016
13 BALLOT. AND THEN BACKING OUT FROM THERE, I THINK MARCH 2016 WE
14 WOULD NEED TO FILE SOME PAPERWORK OR INITIATE THE PROCESS.

15

16 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** MAX?

17

18 **MAX HUNSTMAN:** YES, SUPERVISOR, I'D LIKE TO GIVE A PLAIN
19 ANALOGY THAT I THINK EVERYBODY WILL UNDERSTAND. AND THIS WAS
20 GIVEN TO ME BY PASTOR CUE WHO IS IN THE AUDIENCE TODAY. HE
21 ASKED ME, WHEN WE WERE TALKING ABOUT THIS ISSUE, WHAT ABOUT
22 WHEN YOU HAVE TWO MARRIED PEOPLE AND ONE OF THEM CHEATS ON THE
23 OTHER? BECAUSE HIS POINT WAS: HE WANTED TO SEE A COMMISSION
24 THAT CAN LOOK AT THE POLICE DEPARTMENT AND REALLY LOOK CLOSELY
25 AT THEM AND REALLY KNOW THE TRUTH OF WHETHER OR NOT THEY'RE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 GETTING EVERYTHING. AND MY RESPONSE TO THAT WAS OKAY, IMAGINE
2 YOU WERE IN SUCH A SITUATION AND ONE PERSON DIDN'T TRUST THE
3 OTHER, WANTED TO KNOW WHETHER OR NOT THEY WERE CHEATING ON
4 THEM, THEY MIGHT WANT TO LOOK AT THE CELL PHONES AND SEE THE
5 TEXTS. SUBPOENA POWER ALLOWS YOU TO INSIST THAT THAT PERSON
6 TAKE THE CELL PHONE AND PUT IT ON THE TABLE. BUT THEY GET IT
7 TO PUT IT FACE DOWN. YOU DON'T GET TO SEE ANYTHING. AND THAT'S
8 BECAUSE THE SUPREME COURT HAS TOLD US THAT THE SUBPOENA POWER
9 DOESN'T GET YOU PAST PRIVILEGES, CONFIDENTIALITY AND 832.7 OF
10 THE PENAL CODE BY ITSELF. SO IT DOESN'T REALLY GIVE YOU THE
11 IMPORTANT INFORMATION THAT WE NEED. ON THE OTHER HAND, AN
12 M.O.A., IF WE HAVE A COOPERATIVE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE
13 SHERIFF AND THE BOARD, IS LIKE ASKING, NOT DEMANDING, THAT
14 THAT CELL PHONE BE PLACED ON THE TABLE. BUT NOW IT CAN BE
15 PLACED FACE UP BECAUSE UNDER THE LEGAL THEORY THAT I'VE SET
16 BEFORE THE BOARD, UNDER GOVERNMENT CODE 25.303, I BELIEVE WE
17 HAVE THE RIGHT TO SEE ALL THE DETAILS. THIS BOARD HAS THE
18 RIGHT TO SUPERVISE. AND THAT INCLUDES THE RIGHT TO LOOK AT
19 PERSONNEL RECORDS AND OTHER SENSITIVE INFORMATION IN THE
20 DEPARTMENT. AND IF WE HAVE AN AGREEMENT, THEN, YES, WE CAN GET
21 ACCESS TO THAT INFORMATION. AND THEN ULTIMATELY IT WILL HAVE
22 TO BE TESTED IN COURT. I THINK THAT'S THE MOST IMPORTANT
23 DISTINCTION. IT'S NOT THAT EITHER OF THEM COULDN'T GET US TO
24 THE PLACE WE WANT TO BE AND BOTH SUBPOENA POWER AND AN M.O.A.
25 APPROACH, WHICH ARE NOT NECESSARILY MUTUALLY EXCLUSIVE, EACH

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HAS A DRAWBACK. THE SUBPOENA POWER, YES, YOU CAN FORCE IT. BUT
2 IT DOESN'T NECESSARILY GET YOU ALL THE INFORMATION YOU WANT.
3 THE M.O.A. IS NOT TECHNICALLY ENFORCEABLE. IT HAS TO BE
4 COOPERATIVE. BUT IT GETS US MORE INFORMATION. IN THE LONG RUN,
5 YES, THE NATIONAL ANALYSIS IS ABSOLUTELY RIGHT. YOU WANT TO
6 HAVE A COMMISSION 10 YEARS OUT THAT HAS A FIXED ROLE, THAT HAS
7 A RIGHT TO INSIST UPON CERTAIN INFORMATION AND A MECHANISM FOR
8 GETTING IT. BUT THE PATH TO GET THERE, I THINK THE PATH THAT
9 THIS BOARD CHOOSES, IF INDEED YOU HAVE A CHOICE IN FRONT OF
10 YOU. WHEN I TALK ABOUT AN M.O.A., THERE STILL IS NO M.O.A.
11 BETWEEN THE INSPECTOR GENERAL AND THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT
12 REGARDING THIS ISSUE, AND WE DON'T HAVE COMPLETE ACCESS. BUT
13 IF WE GET THAT ON THE TABLE, THEN WE HAVE A CHANCE TO HAVE A
14 COOPERATIVE APPROACH THAT WILL SET THE STAGE FOR AN ULTIMATE
15 COMMISSION, WHICH WOULD HAVE AUTHORITY, WOULD HAVE A PERMANENT
16 ROLE IN L.A. COUNTY.

17

18 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** SO THAT'S A SEGUE TO WHERE THE SHERIFF IS ON
19 SUBPOENA AND M.O.A.

20

21 **NEIL TYLER:** THE SHERIFF'S POSITION ON SUBPOENA AUTHORITY STEMS
22 FROM A COUPLE OF POINTS OF VIEW. FIRST OF ALL, HE WANTS TO GET
23 STARTED. THIS NEW SHERIFF WHO HAS BEEN IN OFFICE EIGHT MONTHS
24 AND WHO'S LEARNED THE DETAILS OF WHAT WE'VE BEEN THROUGH THE
25 PAST YEAR AND A HALF WITH MR. HUNTSMAN AND THE O.I.G. AND THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 NEW BOARD, THE NEW COMMISSION BEING SET UP AT THE SAME TIME
2 THAT HE WAS ELECTED IS READY TO GO. AND THAT'S WHY WE'VE BEEN
3 WORKING SO HARD ON THIS MEMORANDUM OF AGREEMENT THAT WOULD BE
4 EITHER BETWEEN OR AMONG THE O.I.G., THE SHERIFF AND THE BOARD
5 ITSELF TO ENSURE THE KIND OF COMPLETE ACCESS TO PERSONNEL
6 RECORDS AND TO CONFIDENTIAL ASPECTS OF IN-PROGRESS
7 INVESTIGATIONS THAT MAX HUNTSMAN WOULD NEED TO DO A THOROUGH
8 JOB OF ASSESSING US, AND HE IS INTERESTED IN DOING THAT. ONE
9 OF THE REASONS HE'S NOT INTERESTED IN THE SUBPOENA POWER
10 BALLOT PROPOSITION IS BECAUSE HE BELIEVES IT VERY WELL COULD
11 DELAY THE ABILITY TO FINALIZE THE M.O.A., IN PART BECAUSE THE
12 COMMISSION HASN'T BEEN COMPOSED YET. THE SHERIFF DOESN'T KNOW
13 EXACTLY WHICH SORTS OF PEOPLE ARE GOING TO BE SELECTED FOR
14 MEMBERSHIP ON THIS NINE-MEMBER BODY THAT ULTIMATELY COULD
15 CONCEIVABLY END UP WITH SUBPOENA POWER. HIS LACK OF KNOWLEDGE
16 ABOUT HOW THEY WILL BE PICKED, WHO THEY WILL BE, WHETHER
17 THEY'LL BE DRIVEN BY STATESMANSHIP OR BY A PRECONCEIVED
18 AGENDA, IS SOMETHING HE HAS TO CONSIDER TO BE RESPONSIBLE TO
19 ALL THE VOTERS AND THOSE THAT APPEARED AT OUR TOWN HALL
20 MEETINGS AS WELL AS THOSE THAT DIDN'T. AND HE IS CONCERNED
21 ABOUT FINALIZING THE M.O.A. UNTIL HE KNOWS FOR SURE WHETHER OR
22 NOT SUBPOENA POWER WILL BE SOMETHING ON THE HORIZON. HE ALSO
23 HAS TO DEAL WITH, AMONG A GROUP OF NINE PEOPLE WHO HE DOESN'T
24 EVEN KNOW YET. THE SHERIFF HASN'T SAID THAT IF SUBPOENA POWER
25 WERE TO BE THE CASE ALL BETS ARE OFF AND IT'S LIKELY HIS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 COOPERATION WOULD FIZZLE. HE HASN'T SAID ANY SUCH THING. WHAT
2 HE'S ASKED THE BOARD TO CONSIDER IS FORESTALLING THE URGENCY
3 ABOUT A COMMISSION AND ALLOWING HIM TO FINALIZE THIS
4 MEMORANDUM OF AGREEMENT WITH BOTH MAX HUNTSMAN AND WITH THE
5 NEW COMMISSION ONCE IT'S ESTABLISHED SO THAT HE CAN
6 CONFIDENTLY PROVIDE WHAT'S LEGAL IN HIS MIND AND WHAT THE
7 COUNTY COUNSEL AND OTHER ATTORNEYS SAY IS LEGAL FOR HIM TO
8 PROVIDE IN THE FACE OF GOVERNMENT CODE REGULATIONS AND PENAL
9 CODE REGULATIONS AND DO SO COOPERATIVELY. THE OTHER POINT THAT
10 THE SHERIFF'S AWARE OF IS THAT HISTORICALLY OUR DEPARTMENT,
11 DESPITE SOME OF THE RECENT PUBLICITY ABOUT US AND OUR NOW
12 FUNCTIONS AND MISHAPS HAS BEEN 100 PERCENT COOPERATIVE WITH
13 EVERY OVERSIGHT ENTITY THAT THE BOARD HAS PROVIDED US,
14 BEGINNING WITH MERRICK BOBB IN 1993 WHO HAD ACCESS TO
15 PERSONNEL RECORDS AND CONFIDENTIAL MEETINGS FOR A PERIOD OF
16 OVER 20 YEARS. AND THEN WITH THE NEW ENTITY ESTABLISHED IN
17 2000, THE OFFICE OF INDEPENDENT REVIEW, WHO HAD FULL ACCESS TO
18 PERSONNEL RECORDS AND TO CONFIDENTIAL ASPECTS OF IN PROGRESS
19 INVESTIGATIONS. BOTH OF THEM WERE CONCEIVED IN A DIFFERENT WAY
20 THAN THIS CURRENT OFFICE OF THE INSPECTOR GENERAL, WHICH IS
21 ONE OF THE PRIMARY GLITCHES THAT HAS CAUSED US TO NOT BE ABLE
22 TO COMPLY WITH THE ORDINANCE AS IT'S WRITTEN EVEN YET THERE IS
23 SOME DEGREE OF CONTROVERSY ABOUT IT THAT WE WORKED OURSELVES
24 THROUGH WITH THE HELP OF THE COUNTY COUNSEL'S OFFICE, AND
25 THAT'S WHY THE SHERIFF IS POISED TO BE READY TO SHARE WITH MAX

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE DEEPER ACCESS THAT HE'S REQUESTING AND THAT WE BELIEVE
2 MAKES SENSE FOR HIM TO HAVE. IN THE MIDST OF FINALIZING THAT,
3 WHICH COULD BE WEEKS AWAY, NOT MONTHS OR YEARS, THE SHERIFF'S
4 HOPING THAT WE WON'T BE ALSO INVOLVED WITH ANY DISTRACTING,
5 POSSIBLY PROLONGED, POSSIBLY VERY VITRIOLIC PUBLIC DISCUSSION
6 ABOUT PUBLIC TRUST IN LAW ENFORCEMENT IN GENERAL AND THE
7 SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT IN PARTICULAR BY VIRTUE OF A BALLOT
8 PROPOSITION ABOUT SUBPOENA POWER. AND AS MAX SAID, THAT IS
9 ABOUT TRUST, WITHOUT QUESTION. HE FEELS THAT HE'S EXPRESSED
10 HIMSELF IN A WAY BOTH THROUGH HIS CAMPAIGN AND SINCE HE'S BEEN
11 IN OFFICE THAT YOUR TRUST LEVEL IN HIM SHOULD BE VERY HIGH. SO
12 SHOULD THE PUBLIC'S. AND MAX'S WILL BE AS SOON AS WE GET THIS
13 M.O.A. SIGNED. THEN WE'LL WORK WITH THE COMMISSION AND
14 ESTABLISH TRUST WITH THEM. AND THEN IT TURNS OUT IF WE FAILED
15 FOR THE FIRST TIME IN ACCORDING TO PROPER ACCESS TO AN
16 OVERSIGHT ENTITY SINCE 1993, WELL HE'LL UNDERSTAND WHY YOU'RE
17 DISAPPOINTED ENOUGH TO VOTE IN FAVOR OF A BALLOT PROPOSITION
18 THAT PUTS SUBPOENA POWER IN FRONT OF THE VOTERS. UNTIL HE HAS
19 HIS CHANCE AS A NEWLY ELECTED SHERIFF WHO HAS BEEN IN FAVOR OF
20 THIS GENERAL IDEA SINCE THE VERY BEGINNING, HE'D PREFER NOT TO
21 SEE THAT BALLOT PROPOSITION TAKE PLACE.

22

23 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** MR. MAYOR, IF I MAY. JUST A QUICK
24 QUESTION. MY UNREADINESS ABOUT THAT LINE OF THINKING IS
25 SPECIFICALLY RELATED TO PERSONALIZING THIS. THIS IS NOT ABOUT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 A GIVEN SHERIFF OR WHEN HE OR SHE, FOR THAT MATTER, WOULD BE
2 ELECTED. AND IF WE WOULD DEPERSONALIZE THIS AND LOOK AT THE
3 STRUCTURAL, THE SYSTEMIC, THE CULTURAL FACTORS THAT DRIVE THE
4 NEED FOR REFORM, I SUSPECT WE WOULD DO A LOT BETTER. I WANT TO
5 BE VERY CLEAR ABOUT THE FACT THAT THERE IS NO REASON FOR ME TO
6 BE ANYTHING LESS THAN RESPECTFUL AND INDEED, TO THE EXTENT AND
7 WAYS, APPROPRIATE SUPPORTIVE OF OUR NEW SHERIFF. BUT AS FOR
8 THIS ONE BOARD MEMBER, MY DAYS OF DEFERRING TO A SHERIFF,
9 ELECTED OR NOT, A CHIEF, APPOINTED OR NOT, ARE OVER.

10 [APPLAUSE.] PLEASE, PLEASE. [GAVEL.]

11

12 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** NO, NO APPLAUSE, PLEASE.

13

14 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** AND I SAY THAT STANDING ON A
15 CONSTITUTIONALLY-SITUATED CLAIM. I READ IT EARLIER. COUNTY
16 COUNSEL HAS REPEATED IT TO US IN TERMS OF THE SCOPE OF
17 AUTHORITY OF THIS BOARD. AND THIS BOARD CANNOT ABDICATE ITS
18 RESPONSIBILITY. I THINK WHAT YOU SEE US ESSENTIALLY SEEKING TO
19 DO AND GRAPPLING VERY DELIBERATE-- IN A VERY DELIBERATIVE
20 MANNER AND NOT A RUSH TO JUDGMENT ABOUT THE TWO OUTSTANDING
21 ISSUES OR ANY OF THE OTHER ISSUES, BUT THERE HAS TO BE MORE
22 ENGAGEMENT. AFTER ALL, PUBLIC TRUST DOESN'T DEFINE ITSELF IN
23 THE CONTEXT OF LAW ENFORCEMENT ALONE; IT EXTENDS TO OUR OATH,
24 AS WELL. TO THE EXTENT THAT THAT IS THE CASE, I THINK SOME OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 US ARE PREPARED TO TAKE THAT QUITE SERIOUSLY AND CONDUCT
2 OURSELVES ACCORDINGLY. THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL?

5

6 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** SUPERVISOR SOLIS, WERE YOU FINISHED?

7

8 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** I JUST HAD ONE COMMENT.

9

10 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** I THOUGHT IT WAS A COMMENT ON THE QUESTION
11 BUT I WOULD LIKE TO SPEAK WHEN YOU'RE FINISHED. THANK YOU.

12

13 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** I JUST HAD ONE COMMENT. I KNOW I HAD ASKED
14 COUNTY COUNSEL REGARDING THEIR OPINION ABOUT APPOINTMENTS TO
15 COMMISSIONS. AND TECHNICALLY, I GUESS, THERE'S A GRAY AREA, SO
16 TO SPEAK WHERE IT SAYS "NEITHER STATE LAW NOR COUNTY CODE
17 REQUIRES THAT APPOINTEES TO COMMISSIONS BE CITIZENS OF THE
18 UNITED STATES. HOWEVER, ALL APPOINTEES MUST HAVE A CRIMINAL
19 BACKGROUND CHECK, WHICH MAY LIMIT APPOINTMENTS TO CERTAIN
20 SENSITIVE POSITIONS." SO, I BELIEVE THAT IN ALL FAIRNESS IT IS
21 GOOD THAT WE ARE LOOKING TO PROVIDE MORE OPENNESS AND HEAR
22 THOSE VOICES THAT WE ALL REPRESENT BECAUSE THIS COUNTY DOES
23 PROVIDE SERVICES TO ALL 10 MILLION PEOPLE, NOT ALL OF WHOM CAN
24 VOTE OR VOTED EVEN FOR ME. SO I THINK THAT'S A VERY IMPORTANT
25 NOTE TO TAKE. SO I THANK YOU, MR. VERA, FOR PUSHING THAT ISSUE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AND KEEPING US INFORMED ABOUT OPENNESS AND TRANSPARENCY.

2 THAT'S ALL.

3

4 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR AND COLLEAGUES. SIMPLY
5 TO ADD MY PRAISE, FIRST OF ALL, TO YOU MR. VERA AND MORE MR.
6 HANSEL WHO CHAIRED THE WORKGROUP, SOMEWHAT ENERGETICALLY FROM
7 WHAT I COULD SEE, AND THE REST OF THE MEMBERS OF THE GROUP.
8 SUPERVISOR SOLIS AND I HAD ONLY ACTUALLY BEEN IN THESE CHAIRS-
9 - ACTUALLY THEY WERE BIGGER-- [LAUGHTER.] FOR SEVEN DAYS WHEN
10 WE WERE GIVEN ACTUALLY THE PRIVILEGE OF PARTICIPATING IN
11 SAYING "WELL LET'S INITIATE THIS." AND I SEE IT AS A
12 PRIVILEGE. AND AS BOTH MY COLLEAGUES HAVE SAID, ACTUALLY ALL
13 OF THEM, THIS RESPONSIBILITY ULTIMATELY RESTS WITH US. AND WE
14 TAKE IT VERY, VERY SERIOUSLY. I PERSONALLY WANT THE COMMISSION
15 TO BE VERY STRONG, AS STRONG AS POSSIBLE, NOT ONLY TO RESTORE
16 THE CONFIDENCE OF THE PUBLIC IN GOVERNMENT AND THE SHERIFF'S
17 DEPARTMENT, BUT TO DO THE WORK. BECAUSE WE ARE TALKING ABOUT A
18 LOT MORE THAN SIMPLY BEHAVIOR IN A JAIL. WE'RE TALKING ABOUT A
19 CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM THAT IS IN THE MIDDLE OF A TECTONIC
20 CHANGE WHERE REHABILITATION, WHERE SECOND CHANCE, WHERE ALL OF
21 THESE NOTIONS ARE RISING EVEN MORE. AND WE, I THINK, ARE A
22 PART OF THAT, ALL FIVE OF US, BECAUSE EACH HAS SPOKEN IN THEIR
23 OWN WAY ABOUT THE IDEA OF SECOND CHANCE AND ABOUT HOW
24 ABHORRENT WE FIND VIOLENCE BY A PERSON WITH POWER AGAINST A
25 PERSON WITHOUT POWER. THAT SAID, I THINK THERE ARE SERIOUS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 CONSIDERATIONS ABOUT LIMITATIONS IN ALL OF THE ARENAS. AND WE
2 WILL WANT TO UNDERSTAND FURTHER. WHEN I WAS A PRACTICING
3 ATTORNEY, I REMEMBER THERE WAS A MOTION CALLED "A MOTION TO
4 QUASH." AND THE MOTION TO QUASH WAS: YOU SERVED A SUBPOENA ON
5 ME. NOW I'M GOING TO ASK THE COURT TO DECIDE WHAT YOU HAVE A
6 RIGHT TO KNOW. AND AS MR. HUNTSMAN HAS INDICATED VERY
7 GRAPHICALLY WITH THE PHONE FACE DOWN AND THE PHONE FACE UP,
8 THERE OFTEN ARE LIMITATIONS. AND IN THE PEACE OFFICERS' BILL
9 OF RIGHTS, SOME VERY SPECIFIC LIMITATIONS ABOUT WHAT YOU CAN
10 GET, ALLEGEDLY, WITH A SUBPOENA OR NOT. SO WE'RE GOING TO WANT
11 TO LOOK AT THAT VERY SERIOUSLY AND UNDERSTAND HOW STRONG THE
12 PROPOSED M.O.A. MIGHT BE. I THINK THAT'S PART OF OUR DUTY
13 ALONG WITH TALKING WITH EACH OTHER EXTENSIVELY ABOUT WHO WE--
14 NOT WHO BY NAME, BUT BY ROLE, WE THINK SHOULD BE ON THE
15 COMMISSION IN THE BROADEST POSSIBLE SENSE, WHETHER HAVING A
16 FORMER SHERIFF'S DEPUTY BE ABLE TO SERVE OR NOT GIVES THE
17 APPEARANCE OF A CONFLICT OR IS A CONFLICT. I MEAN, WE WON'T
18 HAVE TO TALK ABOUT THIS. AND I THINK I WOULD SUSPECT EACH OF
19 US HAS OUR OWN IDEAS, HAVING READ YOUR REPORT ALREADY. LET ME
20 CLOSE BY SAYING THAT I FEEL THAT MANY OF THE PEOPLE WHO ARE
21 GOING TO TESTIFY AND WHO CAME TO TESTIFY AND WHO SIT IN YOUR
22 SEATS AND IN THESE SEATS, VERY PRIVILEGED TO BE ENGAGED IN ONE
23 OF THE MOST IMPORTANT QUESTIONS OF THE TIME: CRIME AND
24 PUNISHMENT AND JUSTICE. SO THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR YOUR WORK.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THAT'S REALLY MY MAIN MESSAGE. EXCELLENT WORK, THE WORK YOU'VE
2 DONE TOGETHER AND THE WORK YOU WILL DO. THANK YOU VERY MUCH.

3

4 **SUP. KNABE:** I WOULD JUST ADD MY THANK YOU TO EVERYONE FOR
5 BRINGING IT TO THIS POINT. OBVIOUSLY THERE'S STILL SIGNIFICANT
6 DISCUSSION TO TAKE PLACE AND IRONING OUT THE REFINEMENTS AND
7 DETAILS OF WHAT ACTUALLY IS GOING TO HAPPEN. I CONTINUE TO
8 HAVE CONCERNS ABOUT THE MAKEUP AND HOW THAT MIGHT BE. AND
9 WHETHER IT'S DONE BY THE MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION OR WHETHER
10 THERE'S AN OPPORTUNITY MAYBE FOR THE D.A. TO HAVE AN
11 APPOINTMENT, THE PUBLIC DEFENDER, ALL OF THEM PUBLIC DEFENDER,
12 PRESIDING JUDGE. I THINK THERE'S OTHER OPTIONS THAN THOSE
13 PRESENTED. AND I KNOW YOU WERE VERY ARTICULATE ABOUT YOU
14 FINALLY HAD TO COME UP WITH ONE AND THAT'S WHAT YOU PRESENTED.
15 BUT THOSE ARE ISSUES TO BE DEALT WITH BUT AGAIN A VERY FINE
16 AND DETAILED REPORT. THANK YOU.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** AGAIN, WE WANT TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR
19 PARTICIPATING IN THIS AS WE'LL MOVE FORWARD IN THE PROCESS. WE
20 HAVE APPROXIMATELY 60 PEOPLE SIGNED UP TO SPEAK ON THIS ITEM.
21 BECAUSE OF TIME RESTRAINTS THAT WE ARE GOING TO LIMIT THEM TO
22 ONE MINUTE EACH AND I'LL FIRST CALL UP DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL,
23 ROBERT LUCAS, DR. TIMOTHY MURPHY, JAMES MARSHALL.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL:** GOOD AFTERNOON, BOARD OF SUPERVISORS,
2 DR. GENEVIEVE CLAVREUL. I CANNOT BELIEVE YOU GIVE ONLY ONE
3 MINUTE. IT'S TOTALLY ASININE. BUT I CANNOT BELIEVE THAT A
4 FORMER SHERIFF NOT BE ALLOWED TO PARTICIPATE. IT DOESN'T MAKE
5 NO SENSE WHATSOEVER. YOU HAVE AN UPSIDE DOWN COMMISSION,
6 PERIOD. YOU HAVE MOST OF THE PEOPLE INVOLVED ARE PRO-PRISONER
7 AND PRO-JAILING INDIVIDUALS. NOT FAIR, NOT FAIR AT ALL. AND AT
8 THE LEAST YOU CAN DO, MANY OF THE PEOPLE FROM DIGNITY, POWER
9 NOW, HAVE TESTIFIED IN THIS PLACE MANY TIMES, AND THEY ARE
10 VERY ANTI-SHERIFF, ANTI-POLICE. I THINK YOU REALLY NEED TO
11 LOOK AT THAT, BECAUSE APPARENTLY THEY HAVE A VERY POWERFUL
12 PLACE IN THAT COMMISSION IS ABSURD.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, DOCTOR. ALSO CALL UP ALEX
15 ALVAREZ. EITHER ONE, DOESN'T MATTER.

16

17 **TIMOTHY MURPHY:** HELLO, I'M TIMOTHY MURPHY OF PROGRESSIVE
18 CHRISTIANS UNITED. WE'VE BEEN INVOLVED FOR THE PAST SIX MONTHS
19 IN PARTICIPATION IN WORKING GROUP AND GIVING COMMENTS. REALLY
20 THERE'S NOT MUCH I CAN SAY THAT I HAVEN'T ALREADY SAID THERE
21 IN A NUMBER OF THOSE MEETINGS. OVERALL, THE REPORT HAS SOME
22 VERY GOOD RECOMMENDATIONS. IT'S NOT PERFECT. FRANKLY, WE'D
23 LIKE TO SEE MORE COMMUNITY INPUT IN THE COMMISSION'S
24 COMPOSITION. BUT IN PARTICULAR WHAT WE DON'T NEED IS WHAT IN
25 THE CHURCH SOME WOULD CALL BACKSLIDING. AND SO PLAYING OFF AN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 M.O.A. VERSUS SUBPOENA POWER I THINK REALLY ISN'T VERY HELPFUL
2 AT ALL. IT'S REALLY A BOTH AND SOLUTION THERE. JESUS SAID THAT
3 "THE TRUTH WILL SET YOU FREE." AND SO I BELIEVE THAT
4 STRUCTURES FOR TRANSPARENCY WILL HELP MAKE THIS A REALITY. SO
5 I REALLY ENCOURAGE THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS TO PLEASE SUPPORT
6 STRONG CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT WITH TEETH, SUNLIGHT AND
7 DISINFECTANT. THANK YOU.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME CALL UP SADE
10 RUIZ. MR. LUCAS?

11

12 **ROBERT LUCAS:** GOOD AFTERNOON ONCE AGAIN. I BELIEVE YOU
13 MENTIONED JOHN SCOTT. YOU KNOW MY HISTORY WITH LAW ENFORCEMENT
14 AND INCARCERATION. I CAN TELL YOU THIS. I'VE MET SOME
15 EXTREMELY COMPASSIONATE INDIVIDUALS THAT HAD ON THE COLORS
16 THAT ARRESTED ME. IN FACT, THEY HELPED GUIDE ME AND GAVE ME
17 SOME UNDERSTANDING THROUGH SOME VERY TOUGH TIMES. THE FACT IS:
18 IN STUDYING THIS OPTION 1, THERE'S A FEW THINGS. ONE, I'M
19 GOING TO APPLY WITH EVERY OUNCE OF MY BEING. THE OTHER IS, YOU
20 MENTIONED THE OFFICERS' BILL OF RIGHTS. THE SHERIFF'S BEEN IN
21 OFFICE FOR EIGHT MONTHS AND HE CAN'T IMPLEMENT SOME OF THE
22 DISCLOSURE. WHY CAN'T WE DO BOTH? WHY CAN'T YOU DO THE M.O.A.
23 AND ALSO FILE FOR THE SUBPOENA POWER? I DON'T CARE HOW MUCH
24 YOU TRUST SOMEBODY, IT'S ALWAYS NICE TO HAVE A BIRD IN THE
25 HAND.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP STEVEN,
3 ROGERS. CARLA GONZALEZ. PASTOR CUE JEAN MARIE. YES, SIR.

4

5 **JAMES MARSHALL:** MEMBERS OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS. MY NAME
6 IS JAMES MARSHALL, MEMBER OF THE STEERING COMMITTEE OF THE
7 BLACK COMMUNITY CLERGY AND LABOR ALLIANCE. B.C.C. IS HERE TO
8 ADD SUPPORT TO THE STRONG AND URGENT CALL FOR THE CIVIL
9 OVERSIGHT COMMISSION TO HAVE THE SUBPOENA POWER. THE POWER TO
10 COMPEL THE SHERIFF AND THE DEPARTMENT TO PROVIDE INFORMATION,
11 DOCUMENTATION AND TESTIMONY IN A COMPLETE AND TIMELY MANNER.
12 THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT HAS A POOR HISTORY OF TRANSPARENCY,
13 ACCOUNTABILITY AND OPENNESS. ITS PATTERN IS BEEN TO CLOSE
14 RANKS, STONEWALL AND ENGAGE IN DENIAL AND TO COVER UP ABUSES.
15 THE CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION-- HAVING OVERSIGHT
16 COMMISSION WITH SUBPOENA POWERS WOULD SEND A SIGNAL TO THE
17 SHERIFF AND HIS DEPUTIES THAT RELEVANT INFORMATION CAN AND
18 WILL BE SUBPOENAED AND, THUS, TEND TO MAKE THEM LESS LIKELY TO
19 ACT ABUSIVELY OR TO ATTEMPT TO COVER UP MISCONDUCT AND ABUSE.
20 THANK YOU.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
23 JAMES LELLIS AND LEWIS RAY. YES, SIR.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **STEVEN ROGERES:** STEVE ROGERS, DIGNITY AND POWER NOW. I WOULD
2 LIKE TO THANK YOU GUYS FOR THE WORK THAT YOU PUT IN ON THIS
3 ISSUE, ESPECIALLY THE TWO NEW SUPERVISORS WHO HAVE COME IN AND
4 GOT RIGHT TO WORK ON SOME OF THE TOUGHER ISSUES. YOU KNOW, YOU
5 GUYS HAVE ACCOMPLISHED QUITE A BIT SINCE YOU GOT IN OFFICE.
6 AND WE KNOW THIS IS ONE OF THE MOST DELICATE ISSUES. I DON'T
7 ENVY THE FIVE OF YOU ON THE DECISION YOU HAVE TO MAKE ON THIS.
8 THERE'S GOING TO BE PEOPLE UPSET NO MATTER WHAT YOU DECIDE,
9 YOU KNOW, WITH THE PRIVACY, LAW ENFORCEMENT WHO UNDERSTAND
10 THAT THERE'S A DELICATE YOU THERE AND THE SAFETY OF THE
11 PUBLIC. THEY HAVE BEEN TO MANY OF THE WORKING GROUP MEETINGS,
12 THE TOWN HALLS, DOZENS OF GATHERINGS TO HEAR THE WILL OF THE
13 PEOPLE. AND THE PEOPLE ARE AFRAID A LOT OF TIMES OF LAW
14 ENFORCEMENT. THERE'S SO MUCH ON THE INTERNET. THERE'S SO MUCH
15 GOING ON THAT IS ONLY SEEN BECAUSE PEOPLE CAPTURED IT. AND WE
16 BELIEVE IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE FULL ACCESS TO WHAT'S
17 GOING ON SO THAT THE COMMISSION CAN MAKE A GOOD RECOMMENDATION
18 TO THE BOARD.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR.

21

22 **STEVEN ROGERS:** THANK YOU.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME ALSO CALL UP LEWIS RAY AND
25 CLAUDIA BAUTISTA. YES, SIR.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **PASTOR JNMARIECUE:** I'M PASTOR CUE WITH THE BLACK JEWISH
3 JUSTICE ALLIANCE COLLABORATION, CLUE L.A. AND THE SOUTHERN
4 CHRISTIAN LEADERSHIP CONFERENCE. TO US IT DOESN'T MATTER
5 WHETHER WE TRUST THE NEW SHERIFF OR NOT. WE DON'T TRUST THE
6 SHERIFF DEPARTMENT. AND HISTORY IS OUR BEST TEACHER. WITHOUT
7 SUBPOENA POWER, WE WILL NEVER TRUST THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT.
8 WE WANT SUBPOENA POWER AND AN M.O.A. WE WANT TO SEE THE PHONE
9 ON THE TABLE AND WE ALSO WANT TO SEE THE INFORMATION. WE'VE
10 BEEN WAITING FOR DECADES FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT TO BE TRANSPARENT
11 ON ITS OWN. IT HASN'T HAPPENED YET. AND WE'RE NOT HOLDING OUR
12 BREATH. THEREFORE, WE WANT EFFECTIVE OVERSIGHT. I WANT TO
13 THANK THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS FOR VOTING AND IMPLEMENTING THE
14 WORKING GROUP. AND I WANT TO THANK MR. NEIL AND MR. HUNTSMAN
15 AND MR. VERA AND THE REST OF THE WORKING GROUP FOR YOUR WORK.
16 THANK YOU.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
19 DIANA ZUNIGA STEPHON BECKAM. EDILBERTO FLORES. YES, SIR.

20

21 **RAY LEWIS:** GREETINGS. MY NAME IS RAY LEWIS WITH DIGNITY AND
22 POWER NOW. I BELIEVE IT'S SAFE TO SAY THAT THE PEOPLE OF LOS
23 ANGELES IS TIRED OF LIVING IN FEAR. RIGHT NOW WE KNOW THAT
24 FEAR PARALYZES AND STAGNATES AND STOPS PEOPLE'S CREATIVITY AND
25 THIS IS WHAT WE NEED IN THIS TIME, CREATIVITY, AND FEAR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PARALYZES THAT. WE DO NEED A CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARD OR
2 OVERSIGHT COMMISSION WITH TEETH TO BITE THE WAYWARD POLICEMEN
3 THAT'S TAKING THE LAWS IN HIS OWN HANDS, GIVE HIM SOMETHING TO
4 THINK ABOUT BEFORE HE PULL OUT HIS GUN OR TARGET SOMEONE.
5 RIGHT NOW WE'RE LIVING IN A REACTIVE STATE, YOU'RE JUST DOING
6 THINGS. YOU PUSH US, WE REACT. THE CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT
7 COMMISSION WILL BE A PROACTIVE ACCOMPLISHMENT BECAUSE ANYONE
8 WHO WOULD DO SOMETHING UP ON YOU ALL DOING, THEY WOULD HAVE TO
9 SEE THESE CIVILIANS TO CORRECT THEMSELVES. THANK YOU.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
12 SHEILA PINKEL SAMANTHA ARREDONDO. YES, SIR.

13

14 **STEPHON BECKAM:** MY NAME IS STEPHON BECKAM. AND I HEARD MARK
15 THOMAS SPEAK ABOUT NOT MAKING IT PERSONALIZED, TRANSPARENCY,
16 RESTORING THE TRUST AND CONFIDENCE WITH THE COMMUNITY. I HAVE
17 CALLED ON TO THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT TO HELP ME ABOUT MY KIDS
18 BEING KIDNAPPED. I HAVE NOT RECEIVED NO HELP. I HADN'T
19 RECEIVED NO HELP FROM THIS BOARD. I HAVE CALLED.MY CHILDREN
20 ARE BEING ABUSED. BUT THEY WANT TRANSPARENCY? I NEED
21 TRANSPARENCY WITH THE SHERIFF'S HELPING ME TO REGAIN MY
22 CHILDREN THAT IS BEING ABUSED BY THE D.C.F.S. THAT MARK THOMAS
23 IS IN CHARGE OF. THERE AIN'T NO ONE HELPING ME IN THIS WHOLE
24 CITY. MY CHILDREN ARE BEING ABUSED, DRUGGED. MY CHILD HAS HAD
25 HIS EYE SPLIT OPEN. MY DAUGHTER IS COMING TO VISITS WITH HER

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 VAGINA DIRTY. MY DAUGHTER, 10-YEAR-OLD IS TRYING TO KILL
2 HERSELF. AND I STILL HAVEN'T HAD NO HELP.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

5

6 **DIANA ZUNIGA:** MY NAME IS DIANA ZUNIGA. AND I'M WITH CALIFORNIA
7 UNITED FOR A RESPONSIBLE BUDGET. FIRST, THANK YOU TO THE
8 WORKGROUP AND ALL MY COLLEAGUES AND THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
9 FOR MAKING THIS CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION A REALITY. WE
10 HAVE HEARD THAT SHERIFF MCDONNELL IS COMMITTED TO THE
11 COMMISSION, BUT HE HAS ALSO COMMITTED TO BUILDING MORE JAILS.
12 AND WE CONTINUE TO HEAR OF VIOLENCE WHICH IS PROBABLY WHY THE
13 PUBLIC STILL DOES NOT TRUST THE DEPARTMENT. IT IS TRUE THAT
14 CLEAR OVERSIGHT NEEDS TO HAPPEN. SUBPOENA POWER AND AN M.O.A.
15 IS NECESSARY. THE O.I.G. EVEN SAID THAT IN A YEAR AND A HALF,
16 AN M.O.A. HAS NOT BEEN CREATED, SO IT DOESN'T SEEM SUBPOENA
17 POWER IS HOLDING IT UP RIGHT NOW BUT POSSIBLY A LACK OF TRUE
18 COOPERATION FROM THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT. THE O.I.G. SEEMS TO
19 BE TRYING BUT ALSO SEEMS TO GET LIMITED INFO AND COOPERATION
20 FROM THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE THE ULTIMATE
21 GOALS OF TRANSPARENCY, TRUST, ACCESS AND TO SUPPORT THE
22 HEALING OF PEOPLE IMPACTED BY POLICE VIOLENCE, SUBPOENA POWER
23 AND AN M.O.A. ARE BOTH NECESSARY. WE ARE LATE IN CREATING
24 THIS. LET'S NOT BE LATE IN ANSWERING THE CONTINUED DEMANDS OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OUR COMMUNITIES THAT ARE IMPACTED BY CREATING A COMMISSION
2 WITH REAL INFLUENCE AND POWER.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. DID I CALL MARK ANTHONY
5 JOHNSON? MARK ANTHONY JOHNSON? YES, SIR.

6

7 **EDILBERTO FLORES:** MY NAME IS EDILBERTO FLORES AND I GO AHEAD
8 AND I SUPPORT SUBPOENA POWER AND I GIVE THE REST OF MY TIME TO
9 JOSE GALLEGOS.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YES, MA'AM.

12

13 **SHEILA PINKEL:** MY NAME IS SHEILA PINKEL AND I'M WITH C.U.R.B.
14 AS YOU KNOW, NEW YORK CITY HAS A VIABLE REVIEW BOARD. IN 2012,
15 THE REVIEW BOARD AND N.Y.P.D. SIGNED A MEMORANDUM OF
16 UNDERSTANDING, M.O.U., UNDER WHICH PROSECUTORIAL AUTHORITY FOR
17 SUBSTANTIATED MISCONDUCT CASES AGAINST POLICE OFFICERS WAS
18 TRANSFERRED FROM N.Y.P.D. TO THE CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARD. UNDER
19 THE TERMS OF THE M.O.U., THE CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARD ATTORNEYS,
20 RATHER THAN POLICE DEPT. LAWYERS, PROSECUTE OFFICERS AND
21 ADMINISTRATIVE TRIALS WHEN THE BOARD HAS RECOMMENDED CHARGES
22 FOR SUBSTANTIATED MISCONDUCT. I'M HOPEFUL THAT L.A. COUNTY
23 BOARD OF SUPERVISORS WILL IMPLEMENT A FUNCTIONAL CIVILIAN
24 POLICE REVIEW BOARD WITH ITS OWN INDEPENDENT PROSECUTORIAL
25 ABILITY.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
3 SAMANTHA ARREDONDO, JOSEPH HAMILTON. KARREN LANE. SHANNON
4 SOPER. GUADALUPE CHAVEZ. CANEK PENA VARGAS. YES, MA'AM.

5

6 **SAMANTHA ARREDONDO:** HELLO MY NAME IS SAMANTHA ARREDONDO I'M
7 HERE ON BEHALF OF CALO YOUTHBUILD. YESTERDAY I TOOK A PICTURE
8 OF A SHERIFF TALKING ON HIS PHONE WHILE DRIVING. HE FOLLOWED
9 OUR CAR AFTER TAKING THE PICTURE AS IF HE WAS TRYING TO SEE
10 WHAT HE CAN CATCH ME DOING. FOR EXAMPLE, TO HOLD THIS
11 PARTICULAR SHERIFF ACCOUNTABLE, WE WOULD NEED THE SUBPOENA
12 POWER TO CHECK THE PHONE RECORDS. THIS MIGHT BE A SMALL ISSUE,
13 BUT IT REFLECTS A LARGE CULTURE OF DISREGARD FOR LAW AND
14 ACCOUNTABILITY. WE NEED SUBPOENA POWER TO ENFORCE THE LAW
15 EFFECTIVELY AND FAIRLY.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, SIR.

18

19 **MARK ANTHONY JOHNSON:** GOOD AFTERNOON, SUPERVISORS, MARK
20 ANTHONY JOHNSON WITH THE COALITION TO END SHERIFF VIOLENCE AND
21 DIGNITY AND POWER NOW. I THINK IT'S VERY TELLING WE ARE AT
22 THIS POINT. IT HAS TAKEN US THREE YEARS TO GET TO THE POINT
23 WHERE THE RUBBER IS MEETING THE ROAD. I WANT TO SAY THANK YOU
24 TO SUPERVISOR RIDLEY-THOMAS FOR BEING WITH US FROM THE
25 BEGINNING. THANK YOU TO HILDA SOLIS AND SHEILA KUEHL FOR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 STEPPING UP AND STEPPING INTO THESE SHOES AND BUILDING
2 MOMENTUM FOR THIS PARTICULAR OVERSIGHT COMMISSION. I REALLY
3 WANT TO SPEAK TO SOME CONCERNS AROUND THE IDEA OF RELYING
4 SOLELY ON COOPERATION AROUND GETTING INFORMATION. SHERIFF BACA
5 TOUTED HIMSELF AS A COOPERATIVE SHERIFF. WE ALSO KNOW THAT
6 COOPERATION WITH MERRICK BOBB AND OFFICE OF INDEPENDENT REVIEW
7 DID NOT DETER JAIL CONDITIONS WHERE 57 PERCENT OF USE OF FORCE
8 INCIDENTS WERE INITIATED BY SHERIFFS. SO THE IDEA THAT RELYING
9 JUST ON AN M.O.A. IS NOT GOING TO GET THE TRUST OF THE
10 COMMUNITY. WE CANNOT ASK PEOPLE, GIVEN THE LAST YEAR OF LAW
11 ENFORCEMENT VIOLENCE THAT WE'VE SEEN, WE CANNOT ASK ANYBODY
12 THAT HAS LOVED ONES INSIDE THE JAIL TO REST ON COOPERATION AS
13 THE ANSWER TO TRANSPARENCY.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. YES, MA'AM.

16

17 **SHANNON SOPER:** HI, I'M SHANNON SOPER WITH DIGNITY AND POWER
18 NOW. AND CIVILIANS MUST HAVE A SAY IN THE OVERSIGHT
19 COMMISSION, CIVILIANS LIKE ME, LIKE THE PEOPLE OUT HERE, LIKE
20 THE PEOPLE FROM THE 20 ORGANIZATIONS FROM THE A.C.L.U. TO THE
21 YOUTH JUSTICE COALITION THAT MAKE UP THE COALITION TO END
22 SHERIFF VIOLENCE. WE'RE THE PEOPLE THAT PUT THIS ISSUE ON THE
23 MAP. WE'RE THE PEOPLE THAT SHOWED UP BY THE HUNDREDS TO GET
24 THIS ISSUE VOTED ON. WE'RE THE PEOPLE THAT ATTENDED ALL 13
25 WORKING GROUP MEETINGS AND 9 TOWN HALLS. I'M NOT TALKING ABOUT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 PEOPLE LIKE CERTAIN WORKING GROUP MEMBERS LIKE LES ROBBINS, A
2 30-YEAR L.A.S.D. VETERAN, OR NEIL TYLER THE CURRENT
3 UNDERSHERIFF OR MAX HUNTSMAN, THE CURRENT INSPECTOR GENERAL,
4 PEOPLE WHO CHOSE TO ATTEND PRIVATE SHERIFF UNION MEETINGS
5 INSTEAD OF THE PUBLIC WORKING GROUP MEETINGS. PEOPLE WHOSE
6 INTERESTS LIES IN A CODE AND PROTECTING THE L.A.S.D. RATHER
7 THAN PROTECTING THE HUMAN RIGHTS OF THE PEOPLE OF LOS ANGELES.
8 THE WORKING GROUP SYSTEM IS A PERFECT PRESENTATION OF A SYSTEM
9 WE DON'T WANT. A SYSTEM WHERE THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY SHERIFF'S
10 DEPARTMENT CONTROLS, ABUSES AND MANIPULATES.

11

12 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. ALSO JOSE GALLEGOS?
13 YES, MA'AM.

14

15 **GUADALUPE CHAVEZ:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS GUADALUPE CHAVEZ.
16 I'M FROM DIGNITY AND POWER NOW. I'M A MOTHER AND AN ALLY TO
17 ALL BLACK AND BROWN FOLKS WHO HAVE SURVIVED AND BEEN VICTIMS
18 OF SHERIFF'S VIOLENCE. FIRST OF ALL I NEED TO ACKNOWLEDGE ALL
19 THE ANCESTORS THAT BROUGHT US HERE TOGETHER, CROSSED PATHS SO
20 THAT WE CAN FIGURE IT OUT. IT'S ABOUT TIME AND YOU KNOW IT. SO
21 NUMBER ONE, WE NEED A CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION THAT HAS
22 SUBPOENA POWER, THAT THE M.O.A. CAN BE INCLUDED BUT IT CAN'T
23 JUST BE THAT. THAT'S NOT ENOUGH. DON'T BE FOOLED. ABSOLUTELY
24 NO LAW ENFORCEMENT SHOULD BE A PART OF THIS COMMISSION. AND
25 JUST TO CLARIFY. D.P.N. IS AN ORGANIZATION THAT IS REBUILDING

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 BROWN AND BLACK COMMUNITIES. IT'S NOT AGAINST-- IT'S AGAINST
2 VIOLENCE. THAT'S WHAT IT'S AGAINST. AND, THIRDLY, I URGE YOU
3 TO MAKE SURE THAT ANY PREREQUISITES FOR THIS APPLICATION
4 PROCESS THAT WAS PROPOSED IT'S NOT EXCLUSIONARY TO OUR
5 COMMUNITIES, THE COMMUNITIES YOU REPRESENT, BLACK, BROWN,
6 INCARCERATED, NOT INCARCERATED, AND UNDOCUMENTED. THANK YOU.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP KIM
9 MCGILL. KIM MCGILL. MARITZA GALVEZ. YES, SIR.

10

11 **CANEK PENA VARGAS:** MY NAME IS CANEK PENA VARGAS. I REPRESENT
12 CALO YOUTHBUILD. FIRST OF ALL, I WANT THE THANK SUPERVISOR
13 SOLIS FOR LISTENING TO OUR VOICES IN DISTRICT 1. AND I JUST
14 WANT TO STRESS THE IMPORTANCE OF SUBPOENA POWER. I FEEL THAT
15 THIS OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE NEEDS SUBPOENA POWER AND AN M.O.A. WE
16 NEED A LONG-TERM SOLUTION THAT CAN ACCOUNT FOR ANY KIND OF
17 RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN CIVIL SOCIETY AND THE SHERIFFS. IF THERE
18 ARE CASES OF CORRUPTION OR NEGLIGENCE THAT THREATEN THE SAFETY
19 OF OUR RESIDENTS, WE NEED TO FEEL CONFIDENT THAT THE REVIEW
20 BOARD HAVE THE POWER TO UNCOVER THE TRUTH AND UPHOLD THE LAW
21 IN SERVICE OF OUR PEOPLE. WHETHER THAT IS DONE THROUGH A
22 POLITE REQUEST OR A FORMAL MANDATE, WE NEED BOTH OPTIONS ON
23 THE TABLE BECAUSE IT IS TOO OFTEN A MATTER OF LIFE AND DEATH.
24 IN ADDITION, I FEEL THAT NOT MANY FOLKS HAVE MENTIONED IT SO
25 FAR BUT I THINK IT IS DEFINITELY NECESSARY FOR THIS COMMISSION

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO HAVE ACCESS TO INDEPENDENT LEGAL COUNSEL BECAUSE NOT DOING
2 SO, I THINK, LAYS A FOUNDATION THAT'S RIPE FOR A CONFLICT OF
3 INTEREST. AND I ALSO FEEL VERY STRONGLY THAT THE COMMUNITY
4 SHOULD HAVE AN OPPORTUNITY TO VOTE AND ELECT SOME OF THE
5 MEMBERS OF THIS COMMITTEE AS IT WILL HELP TO RESTORE PUBLIC
6 TRUST AND REFLECT VOICES OF OUR COMMUNITY. THANK YOU.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. YES, MA'AM.

9

10 **KARREN LANE:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS KARREN LANE. I'M AN
11 ORGANIZER AND MEMBER OF COMMUNITY COALITION OF SOUTH LOS
12 ANGELES. FOR THE LAST 25 YEARS WE'VE ORGANIZED RESIDENTS TO
13 DEVELOP AND IMPLEMENT COMMUNITY-BASED SOLUTIONS TO VIOLENCE
14 AND CRIME IN SOUTH LOS ANGELES. HISTORY HAS TAUGHT US THAT LAW
15 ENFORCEMENT ALONE CANNOT ACT TO ADDRESS NEIGHBORHOOD SAFETY.
16 COOPERATION BETWEEN LAW ENFORCEMENT AND RESIDENTS REQUIRES
17 TRANSPARENCY, MEANINGFUL ENGAGEMENT AND HONESTY. IT WILL BE
18 DISHONEST TO ASSERT THAT THERE ARE NOT SIGNIFICANT DEEP ROOTED
19 PROBLEMS IN THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT THAT DISPROPORTIONATELY
20 IMPACT COMMUNITIES OF COLOR AND POOR AND WORKING COMMUNITIES
21 LIKE SOUTH LOS ANGELES. L.A. COUNTY CANNOT REBUILD THE TRUST
22 OF COMMUNITIES WHERE THERE HAVE BEEN PATTERNS OF SHERIFFS
23 ABUSE AND MISCONDUCT WHILE SIMULTANEOUSLY DENYING THOSE VERY
24 RESIDENTS ACCESS TO INFORMATION ABOUT POLICING IN THEIR OWN
25 COMMUNITIES, POLICING WHICH IS A PUBLIC FUNCTION. A COMMITMENT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO BUILDING A CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARD BUT ONLY IF IT'S POLICED
2 AND CONTROLLED BY LAW ENFORCEMENT IS NOT A TRUE COMMITMENT TO
3 A CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARD. THEREFORE WE ASK YOU ALL TO APPROVE A
4 CIVILIAN COMMISSION THAT HAS SUBPOENA POWER AND IS COMPOSED OF
5 CIVILIANS INDEPENDENT OF LAW ENFORCEMENT.

6

7 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM OR YES, SIR.

8

9 **JOSE GALLEGOS:** BEFORE I BEGIN, I WOULD LIKE, HE GAVE ME HIS
10 TIME. ALL RIGHT. THANK YOU. GOOD MORNING, BOARD. MY NAME IS
11 JOSE GALLEGOS. BORN AND RAISED IN THE NINTH DISTRICT OF LOS
12 ANGELES AND AN EXPERIENCED INDIVIDUAL WITH THE L.A. COUNTY
13 JAIL SYSTEM. I START OFF BY SAYING, FORMER INCARCERATED PERSON
14 BECAUSE APRIL 2009 WAS THE LAST TIME I HAD SEEN THE INSIDE OF
15 THE BELLY OF THE BEAST ALSO KNOWN AS THE L.A. COUNTY JAIL. I
16 DISCHARGED PROBATION IN 2012 AND HAVE NOT GOTTEN IN TROUBLE OR
17 CAME IN CONTACT WITH LAW ENFORCEMENT SINCE THAT TIME. WHEN I
18 GOT RELEASED, I TOLD MYSELF THAT I WOULD NEVER RETURN TO SUCH
19 A DEHUMANIZING ENVIRONMENT. I WAS WRONG. LAST MONTH, ON JUNE
20 20TH, THE DAY BEFORE FATHER'S DAY BETWEEN THE HOURS OF 2 AND 3
21 O'CLOCK P.M., I DECIDED TO USE PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION TO GO
22 DELIVER SOME FLOWERS TO MY BROTHER'S GRAVESITE WHO HAD BEEN
23 MURDERED NINE MONTHS AGO. AS I EXITED ONE OF THE TRAINS TO
24 TRANSFER TO THE NEXT ONE I IMMEDIATELY WAS APPROACHED AND
25 SINGLED OUT BY A PERSON WITH THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT AND

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ASKED FOR MY T.A.P. CARD. I DIDN'T REPLY. I JUST STARTED TO
2 DIG IN MY POCKETS TO RETRIEVE MY T.A.P. CARD AND SHOW PROOF OF
3 VALIDATION OF THE TRAIN FARE. AS I SEARCHED FOR MY T.A.P.
4 CARD, THE OFFICER STATED, "IF YOU DON'T HAVE YOUR T.A.P. CARD
5 THEN YOU JUST DON'T HAVE IT AND I HAVE TO WRITE YOU A TICKET."
6 AS HE BEGAN TO WRITE THE TICKET I FOUND MY T.A.P. CARD AND T
7 TAPPED IT TO SHOW PROOF OF VALIDATION. THE OFFICER GOT UPSET.
8 I SMILED. I SMILED BECAUSE IT WAS FUNNY TO ME HOW THIS OFFICER
9 SKIPPED THE DOZENS OF PUBLIC TRANSIT RIDERS TO ONLY ASSUME
10 THAT I WOULD BE A CANDIDATE TO VIOLATE THE TRAIN EVASION FARE
11 DUE TO MY PHYSICAL APPEARANCE, LATINO, YOUNG AND MORE TATTOOS
12 AND GRAFFITI ON A NEW YORK SUBWAY. HE WAS FRUSTRATED THAT HE
13 COULD NOT JUSTIFY THE TICKET SO HE RESPONDED "I DON'T KNOW WHY
14 YOU'RE SMILING FOR. WITH YOUR UGLY TEETH." I REMID BY ASKING
15 WHERE'S YOUR PROFESSIONALISM AND ASKING FOR HIS BADGE NUMBER
16 SO I CAN PUT IN A COMPLAINT. THAT REALLY AGITATED HIM. AS I
17 WAITED FOR THE NEXT TRAIN TO ARRIVE, I WAS NOW BEING
18 APPROACHED BY 7 L.A. COUNTY DEPUTIES WITH TASERS BEING POINTED
19 AT ME. I ASKED, "WHAT IS GOING ON? I'M NOT ON PAROLE OR
20 PROBATION AND I HAVE MY T.A.P. CARD WITH ME, SO WHAT IS THE
21 NEED FOR ALL THIS?" I WAS FORCEFULLY DETAINED AND I WAS PUT IN
22 HANDCUFFS. ONE OF THE DEPUTIES STATED THAT, I AM A CHICANO BUT
23 YOU SPEAK LIKE A N-I-G-G-A. I GOT REAL FRUSTRATED BECAUSE I DO
24 HAVE BLACKS IN MY FAMILY. I DIDN'T GET TO FINISH. TWO MINUTES
25 NOT ENOUGH.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, THANK YOU, THANK YOU.

3 ROBERT CRISTO? MICHELE ZORILLA. TREVA ELLISON. YES, MA'AM.

4

5 **SPEAKER:** HE'S SAYING THAT THERE'S SOMEBODY ELSE WAIVED HIS

6 TIME FOR THEM? IF YOU GUYS COULD CONFIRM THAT INFORMATION?

7

8 **SPEAKER:** ALEX DIDN'T TESTIFY. THAT WAS THE OTHER PERSON.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WHO IS THAT? WE ONLY HAVE ONE PERSON.

11 I'M SORRY. WE STILL HAVE ANOTHER 30 TO GO. YES, MA'AM.

12

13 **MARITZA GALVEZ:** HI, MY NAME IS MARITZA WITH THE YOUTH JUSTICE

14 COALITION. I'M HERE TO SPECIFICALLY TALK ABOUT WHY IT'S

15 ESSENTIAL TO HAVE TRUE COMMUNITY REPRESENTATION ON THE

16 CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION. AS A KID, I SAW MY MOTHER AND

17 SISTER BOTH GO IN AND OUT OF THE SYSTEM. I WAS 13 YEARS OLD

18 TRACKING THE IMMIGRANT INFORMATION SYSTEM. I WAS A YOUTH

19 VISITING SEPARATED BY A GLASS WINDOW. I WAS A LOVED ONE WHO

20 WAS CONSTANTLY DEHUMANIZED AND DISREGARDED AS I VISITED MY

21 FAMILY. TODAY WE ARE PUSHING THAT 4 OUT OF THE 9 MEMBERS OF

22 THE COMMITTEE BE CHOSEN BY THE COMMUNITY AND BE ACTUAL

23 COMMUNITY REPRESENTATIVES. WE BELIEVE THAT IN ORDER TO CHANGE

24 THE SYSTEM, THE ACTUAL COMMUNITY NEEDS TO BE AT THE TABLE. WE

25 BELIEVE THAT OUR STORIES AND OUR TRUTH NEEDS TO BE HEARD AND

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 REPRESENTED. THE PAPER THAT YOU WERE JUST HANDED IS-- I'M
2 SORRY. THIS MEANS SPECIFICALLY FOLKS THAT HAVE BEEN DIRECTLY
3 IMPACTED, PEOPLE THAT HAVE BEEN DETAINED, FAMILIES WHO HAVE
4 BEEN-- FAMILIES WHO HAVE LOST LOVED ONES AND HAVE DAILY
5 INTERACTIONS AND CONTACT WITH LAW ENFORCEMENT. JUST TO SPEAK
6 ON THE PAPER YOU WERE HANDED.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
9 JOSEPH VILLELA? YES, MA'AM.

10

11 **KIM MCGILL:** GOOD MORNING, KIM MCGILL WITH THE YOUTH JUSTICE
12 COALITION. I ALSO APPRECIATE ALL THE HARD WORK THAT THE BOARD
13 OF SUPERVISORS AS WELL AS THE WORKING GROUP PUT INTO THIS
14 EFFORT. BUT I ESPECIALLY WANT TO APPLAUD ALL THE COMMUNITY
15 ORGANIZATIONS AND COMMUNITY MEMBERS WHO HAVE COME OUT WEEK
16 AFTER WEEK, MONTH AFTER MONTH ON THIS ISSUE AND FOUGHT FOR IT
17 LONG BEFORE ANY OF US WERE INVOLVED FOR DECADES. I WANT TO ASK
18 THAT EVERYBODY IN THE AUDIENCE WHO STANDS FOR SUBPOENA POWER
19 AS WELL AS ALL THE OTHER FIVE NONNEGOTIABLES FROM THE
20 COMMUNITY PLEASE STAND SO YOU COULD SEE THE POWER THAT'S
21 REPRESENTED TODAY. I'M HERE TODAY ON BEHALF OF CARLA FIGUEROA
22 BECAUSE I LIKE TO BRING STORIES OF OUR ACTUAL MEMBERS WHO ARE
23 IMPACTED BY THESE ISSUES. WE MET CARLA'S MOTHER AT COUNTY JAIL
24 ABOUT 2-1/2 MONTHS AGO. SHE WAS CONCERNED THAT HER DAUGHTER
25 THE WHOLE TIME SHE WAS AT COUNTY JAIL WAS HAVING FLUID TAKEN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OUT OF HER STOMACH EVERY SINGLE WEEK AND NEVER GOT A
2 DIAGNOSIS. THE COUNTY JAIL SYSTEM, THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT
3 SENT HER AS SOON AS THEY COULD TO THE STATE PRISON SYSTEM
4 WHERE SHE ONLY HAD A YEAR'S SENTENCE, AND THEY SENT HER
5 WITHOUT A DIAGNOSIS. AS SOON AS SHE GOT TO STATE PRISON, SHE
6 WAS DIAGNOSED WITH STAGE FOUR CANCER AND SHE WAS TRANSFERRED
7 TO A HOSPITAL TO REMOVE ONE OF HER OVARIES. WITHIN A MATTER OF
8 WEEKS SHE WAS TRANSFERRED AGAIN TO THE HOSPITAL AND THEY
9 REMOVED HER ENTIRE UTERUS. DURING THAT ENTIRE TIME, WE WENT TO
10 EVERYONE IN THE STATE, TO EVERYONE IN THE COUNTY INCLUDING THE
11 INSPECTOR GENERAL'S OFFICE--

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR: .**

14

15 **KIM MCGILL:** CARLA DIED LAST MONDAY.

16

17 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** TREVA ELLISON, AND OLIVER BUIE. YES,
18 SIR.

19

20 **ROBERT CRISTO:** ALL RIGHT. HELLO MY NAME IS ROBERT CRISTO, AND
21 TODAY I'M REPRESENTING THE LOS ANGELES BROWN BERETS. CARLOS
22 OLIVERA WAS SHOT IN THE BACK IN CITY TERRACE BY EAST L.A.
23 SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT ON HAZARD AVENUE. HE WAS RIDING HIS
24 SKATEBOARD. HE WAS STOPPED, SEARCHED AND ABUSED, AND THEN SHOT
25 IN THE BACK. CARLOS OLIVERA-- I'M SORRY, EDUARDO RAMIREZ AND

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RICARDO LARA WERE BOTH KILLED IN FRONT OF THEIR HOUSE DURING A
2 FAMILY PARTY. NEIGHBORS SAY THAT THE SHERIFFS JUST DROVE IN
3 AND OPENED FIRE. THIS DIDN'T HAPPEN IN JAIL. THIS HAPPENED ON
4 THE STREETS. PEOPLE OF COLOR IN LOW INCOME COMMUNITIES ARE
5 FACING SUPPRESSION TACTICS BY THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT AND WHO
6 IS THERE TO WATCH? WHO IS THERE TO PROSECUTE THEM WHEN THEY
7 VIOLATE PEOPLE'S RIGHTS AND THEY TAKE THEIR LIVES? WHO IS
8 THERE TO STOP THEM FROM HURTING THE UNKNOWABLE AMOUNT OF
9 PEOPLE THAT THEY HURT EVERY DAY IN THE COUNTY SYSTEM? I'M HERE
10 IN SUPPORT OF REAL SUBPOENA POWER AND A REAL COMMITTEE THAT'S
11 FILLED WITH REAL CIVILIANS NOT EX COPS WHO MAY NOT WEAR THE
12 UNIFORM ANYMORE BUT STILL KEEP THAT MENTAL STYLE. WE NEED A
13 CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT WITH REAL SUBPOENA POWER. THANK YOU.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. I CALLED UP OLIVER BUIE AND
16 REVEREND LARRY FOY. JONATHAN KLEIN. PAUL JUNG. YES, MA'AM.

17

18 **MICHELE ZORILLA:** GOOD AFTERNOON, MY NAME IS MICHELE ZORILLA,
19 AND THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK. I'M HERE WITH
20 DIGNITY AND POWER NOW. I AM A LEAD ORGANIZER FOR THIS CIVILIAN
21 OVERSIGHT COMMISSION. THE CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION
22 WITHOUT SUBPOENA POWER AND A STRONG M.O.U. IS LIKE BUILDING A
23 HOME WITH NO FOUNDATION AND NO PLUMBING. IT DOESN'T MAKE
24 SENSE. I'VE CONTACTED OVER 100 PROFILES OF COMMISSIONS ACROSS
25 THE STATE AND ACROSS THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY, AND THOSE THAT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HAVE SUBPOENA POWER, IT WORKS. THERE'S A COLLABORATION BETWEEN
2 THE SHERIFF AND THE COMMISSION THAT WORKS IF YOU HAVE SOMEONE
3 THAT'S WILLING TO ACCEPT THAT, MAYBE OUR SHERIFF HAS NO
4 INTENTION AND DOESN'T DESIRE THAT. BUT WHEN YOU HAVE
5 PERSONALLY BEEN AFFECTED BY POLICE BRUTALITY, IT'S SOMETHING
6 THAT YOU LOOK AT AND YOU SEE THAT IF IT WORKS, YOU WOULDN'T BE
7 WAITING THREE YEARS TO HAVE AN INVESTIGATION WHEN AN OFFICER
8 HAS SEXUALLY ABUSED YOU. IT DOESN'T TAKE THREE YEARS. IF THAT
9 SUBPOENA POWER WOULD HAVE BEEN IN BACK IN 2011, MAYBE I
10 WOULDN'T HAVE TO BE SITTING HERE FOR THE NEXT THREE OR FOUR
11 YEARS TELLING MY STORY OVER AND OVER AGAIN IN THE SUPPORT OF
12 SUBPOENA POWER. THANK YOU.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. PASTOR? REVEREND?

15

16 **OLIVER BUIE:** YES. I'M REVEREND OLIVER BUIE WIITH HOME AND
17 UNITED METHODIST CHURCH AND I'D JUST LIKE TO SAY THAT I'M IN
18 SUPPORT OF SUBPOENA POWER AND M.O.A. I BELIEVE THAT YOU NEED
19 TO GIVE THIS COMMISSION THE NECESSARY RESOURCES TO BE ABLE TO
20 BE EFFECTIVE, TO BE ABLE TO CARRY OUT ITS JOB. AND IF YOU
21 DON'T GIVE IT SUBPOENA POWER AND M.O.A., THAT IT WOULD NOT BE
22 ABLE TO CARRY OUT ITS JOB. ALSO, I'D LIKE TO THANK SUPERVISOR
23 KUEHL, SUPERVISOR THOMAS AND SOLIS IN THEIR SUPPORT AND
24 FORWARD THINKING ON THIS ISSUE. ALSO, CITIES SUCH AS NEW YORK
25 CITY AND PHILADELPHIA HAVE ALREADY TAKEN THESE STEPS. I DON'T

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 KNOW WHY LOS ANGELES IS STILL BEHIND HERE IN THE 21ST CENTURY.
2 WE CLAIM TO BE A FIRST-CLASS CITY. WHY DON'T WE LIVE OUT THAT
3 TRUTH AND DO THE RIGHT THING? ALSO, I COME IN HERE, EVERY TIME
4 I COME IN HERE, I READ THOSE WORDS, THAT GOVERNMENT OF THE
5 PEOPLE, BY THE PEOPLE, AND FOR THE PEOPLE. LET'S LIVE IT OUT
6 INSTEAD OF JUST LET IT BE SOMETHING WRITTEN ON THE WALL. GOD
7 BLESS YOU.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, PASTOR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
10 JOSEPH DOV. YES, SIR.

11

12 **REV. LARRY FOY:** I'M REVEREND LARRY FOY FROM THE NEW WAY OF
13 LIFE REENTRY PROJECT AND THE NEW MILLENNIUM CHURCH. ON JULY
14 24, TRESHON CAREY, A YOUNG BLACK WOMAN WAS RELEASED, AFTER
15 COMMUNITY MEMBERS PAID HER BAIL. THE JUDGE, JUDGE RAY GERARDO,
16 AGREED TO A BAIL CONTINGENT UPON SHE BEING RELEASED TO NEW WAY
17 OF LIFE REENTRY PROJECT. MISS CAREY WHICH WAS NOT RELEASED TO
18 NEW WAY OF LIFE REENTRY PROJECT NOR WAS THE PROJECT NOTIFIED
19 OF HER RELEASE. RATHER, SHE WAS DUMPED OFF AT THE BACK DOOR OF
20 U.S.C. COUNTY MEDICAL CENTER. IT WAS ONLY A COUPLE DAYS LATER
21 THAT WE PUT OUT A SEARCH AND FOUND MISS CAREY. I'M IN FAVOR OF
22 CIVIL COMMISSION, PARTICULARLY FOR SUBPOENA POWER AND FOR NO
23 LAW ENFORCEMENT BECAUSE I BELIEVE THAT PEOPLE SHOULD BE
24 TREATED WITH DIGNITY AND NOT AS GARBAGE.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME CALL UP ARYEH
2 COHEN. RABBI?

3

4 **JONATHAN KLEIN:** I'M RABBI JONATHAN KLEIN FROM CLERGY AND LAITY
5 UNITED FOR ECONOMIC JUSTICE AND WE COME WITH A COMMITMENT HERE
6 TO RECOGNIZING THAT PEOPLE IN OUR CITY ARE SUBJECT TO LAW
7 ENFORCEMENT ON A DAILY BASIS AND RECOGNIZE THAT WE HAVE TO
8 ESTABLISH A MORE-- THERE'S BEEN A LOT OF TALK ABOUT TRUST. THE
9 FACT OF THE MATTER IS THERE ISN'T TRUST RIGHT NOW. AND WE HAVE
10 TO FIGURE OUT HOW TO GET THERE. BUT THE ONLY WAY IT'S GOING TO
11 HAPPEN IF THIS BODY TAKES SERIOUSLY THE IDEA OF CIVILIAN
12 OVERSIGHT. WE AREN'T GOING TO GET THERE THROUGH HOPES AND A
13 SENSE THAT SOMEHOW THINGS ARE GOING TO NATURALLY GET BETTER.
14 WE HAVEN'T-- THAT SHIP SET SAIL LONG AGO. WE HAVE TO MAKE
15 MAJOR CHANGE. AND THE WHOLE POINT ABOUT LAW ENFORCEMENT ON
16 THIS PANEL, ON THE COMMISSION, IT'S NOT JUST A MATTER OF
17 TRUST; IT'S ABOUT TRYING TO-- I WANT TO REITERATE WITH HERNAN
18 VERA SAID, IT'S ABOUT CONFLICT OF INTEREST. AND WE REALLY WANT
19 TO ENSURE THAT THIS BODY TAKES SERIOUSLY THE ROLE THAT IT IS
20 TO HAVE, WHICH IS THE CHECKS AND BALANCES OF THE SYSTEM.

21

22 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, RABBI. THANK YOU. LET ME
23 ALSO CALL UP ALONI BONILLA. YES, SIR.

24

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **PAUL JUNG:** HI, EVERYONE. MY NAME IS PAUL JUNG. I'M STAFF
2 ATTORNEY AT ASIAN AMERICANS ADVANCING JUSTICE L.A. WE WERE
3 FORMERLY KNOWN AS THE ASIAN-PACIFIC AMERICAN LEGAL CENTER. I'M
4 THE FIRST ATTORNEY WHO IS ACTUALLY FOCUSING ON CRIMINAL
5 JUSTICE RELATED ISSUES IN THE ORGANIZATION. I JUST WANT TO SAY
6 THANK TO ALL THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS AND THE WORKING GROUP
7 COMMITTEE WHO HAVE REALLY FACILITATED THIS PROCESS IN FORMING
8 THIS OVERSIGHT COMMISSION. I JUST WANT TO REEMPHASIZE THAT
9 THIS IS ONE IMPORTANT STEP TOWARDS BUILDING COMMUNITY TRUST
10 ONCE AGAIN IN LAW ENFORCEMENT IN THE COUNTY. I DO WANT TO SAY
11 THAT WE SUPPORT SUBPOENA POWER AND AN M.O.A. IT'S NOT JUST AN
12 M.O.A. IT'S ABOUT HAVING SUBPOENAR POWER AS WELL. THAT WILL BE
13 A LINCHPIN AS FAR AS MOVING FORWARD. I WANT TO EMPHASIZE THAT
14 AS FAR AS THE COMPOSITION, IT'S GOT TO REPRESENTE DIRECTLY
15 IMPACTED PEOPLE, INCLUDING FOLKS WHO ARE BLACK AND LATINO,
16 WOMEN, L.G.B.T.Q. PEOPLE, IMMIGRANTS, YOUNG PEOPLE AND
17 UNDOCUMENTED PEOPLE. THANK YOU.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP ALEX
20 ACEVAS. YES, SIR.

21

22 **JOSEPH DOV:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS JOSEPH DOVE AND I'M WITH
23 C.L.U.E. L.A. I'M SPEAKING HERE TODAY ON BEHALF OF MYSELF,
24 THOUGH. WE NEED TRUE CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT IN LOS ANGELES COUNTY.
25 AND THAT CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT WILL ONLY BE ACCOMPLISHED WITHOUT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HAVING ANY FORMER OR LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS ON THIS
2 COMMISSION. THAT DOES NOT GIVE THE APPEARANCE OF CONFLICT OF
3 INTEREST AS SOME PEOPLE HAVE STATED. THAT IS A PERFECT EXAMPLE
4 OF CONFLICT OF INTEREST. THE SHERIFFS ARE NOT THE C.I.A. OR
5 THE N.S.A, SHROUDED IN MYSTERY AND NEEDING THAT SECRECY. THEY
6 ARE A PUBLIC AGENCY THAT NEEDS TRANSPARENCY BECAUSE THEY SERVE
7 THE PEOPLE. AND CURRENTLY THE PUBLIC DOES NOT HAVE TRUST IN
8 THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT. AN M.O.A. IS NOT ACCEPTABLE, EITHER.
9 WE'VE BEEN TRYING FOR AN M.O.A. FOR A YEAR AND A HALF, AND IT
10 HAS NOT BEEN ACCOMPLISHED. THE PUBLIC NEEDS SUBPOENA POWER.
11 THE COMMISSION NEEDS SUBPOENA POWER. THANK YOU.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
14 ANGELA CHUNG. YES, SIR.

15

16 **ARYEH COHEN:** HI, I'M RABBI ARYEH COHEN, I TEACH AT THE
17 AMERICAN JEWISH UNIVERSITY RABBINICAL SCHOOL, ALSO ON THE
18 BOARD OF C.L.U.E. IT IS OR IT SHOULD BE MORE THAN OBVIOUS THAT
19 WE NEED A CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION WITH REAL POWER AND
20 TEETH. LEGITIMACY AND AUTHORITY OF THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT
21 AND THE COUNTY JAIL IS DEPENDENT ON THE TRANSPARENCY AND
22 ACCOUNTABILITY OF THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT. THE ONLY WAY TO BE
23 SURE OF THAT ACCOUNTABILITY IS AN INDEPENDENT OVERSIGHT
24 COMMISSION WHICH HAS THE POWER OF SUBPOENA SO THAT NO ONE CAN
25 HIDE BEHIND THE DISCRETION OF A SHERIFF'S BADGE. SECOND, THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 COMMISSION, THE COMMITTEE MUST SURELY REFLECT THE COMMUNITY,
2 MUST TRULY REFLECT THE COMMUNITY. THEREFORE I SUPPORT THE
3 RECOMMENDATION OF 4 OF 9 OF THE MEMBERS OF THE COMMUNITY BE
4 COMMUNITY MEMBERS. FURTHER, IN ORDER TO ENSURE ITS
5 INDEPENDENCE, WE OPPOSE THE INCLUSION OF MEMBERS OF LAW
6 ENFORCEMENT. ONE CORNERSTONE OF THE COMMUNITY IS THE
7 RELATIONSHIP OF TRUST BETWEEN LAW ENFORCEMENT AND COMMUNITY.
8 IN ORDER TO BEGIN RESTORING AND BUILDING THAT TRUST, WE NEED A
9 CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION WITH REAL POWER. THANK YOU.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
12 JACQUELINE MEJIA. YES, MA'AM.

13

14 **ALEX ACEVEZ:** MY NAME IS ALEX ACEVEZ OF LOS ANGELES BROWN
15 BERETS. MY TIME WAS GOING TO GO TO JOSE GALLEGOS, BUT YOU
16 DIDN'T LET HIM SPEAK. SO IT'S GOING TO GO TO ALONI BONILLA.

17

18 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY, SHE WILL TAKE YOUR TIME. OKAY
19 THEN, ONE MOMENT. ESTHER LIM. AND LUIS GARCIA Y AYVENS. YES,
20 MA'AM.

21

22 **ALONI BONILLA:** MY NAME IS ALONI, AND I AM A HIGH SCHOOL MATH
23 TEACHER AT FREE L.A. HIGH SCHOOL AND ORGANIZER WITH THE YOUTH
24 JUSTICE COALITION. I WAS ACTUALLY BEATEN INSIDE OF A HOSPITAL
25 BY A 240-POUND MALE OFFICER DURING AN ARREST. AND I HAPPENED

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO PULL TOGETHER ENOUGH MONEY AND LOANS TO PAY AN ATTORNEY TO
2 FIGHT THIS CASE. AND THE LAWYER WAS ABLE TO SUBPOENA THE VIDEO
3 THAT CAPTURED THE BEATING THAT RESULTED IN EYE AND FACE
4 CONTUSIONS, FIVE SLIPPED DISCS AND MENTAL TRAUMA. WE CAN SIT
5 HERE AND TALK ABOUT THE CASES WHERE SUBPOENA POWER MAY OR MAY
6 NOT WORK. IT IS NOT UP TO YOU TO DECIDE WHAT CASES THE
7 SUBPOENA POWER WILL WORK. IT IS UP TO YOU TO ENSURE THE
8 OVERSIGHT HAS WHAT IT NEEDS TO TRULY REPRESENT THE COMMUNITY
9 AND HAVE THOSE POWERS ALREADY IN PLACE IN THE CASE THAT IT MAY
10 OR MAY NOT NEED THEM. YOU WANT TO MAKE SURE THAT THE POLICE
11 COMMISSION-- THAT THIS OVERSIGHT DOESN'T BECOME TOO COZY WITH
12 THE SHERIFFS AND JUST TO RELY ON AN M.O.A. THIS CAN CREATE
13 EVEN MORE DISTRUST OF LAW ENFORCEMENT. IF YOU LOOK AT THE
14 POLICE COMMISSION FOR L.A.P.D., YOU WILL SEE THAT ITS FAILURE
15 TO TRULY LISTEN TO THE COMMUNITY CONCERNS AND MANY TIMES THEY
16 BACK UP THE L.A.P.D. BECAUSE THE PEOPLE IN PLACE, THE
17 COMPOSITION AND MAKEUP. THEY DON'T REPRESENT THE COMMUNITY.
18 AND IF YOU HAVE PEOPLE WHO HAVE BEEN DIRECTLY IMPACTED AND
19 KNOW WHAT IT'S LIKE TO BE KILLED AND BRUTALIZED BY THE SAME
20 ORGANIZATION THAT IS ABUSINGUS, THEN THAT'S WHERE REAL CHANGE
21 BEGINS TO HAPPEN WHEN YOU HAVE PEOPLE DIRECTLY IMPACTED THAT
22 HAVE POWER, THAT HAVE REAL POWER. THANK YOU.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM. LET ME ALSO CALL UP
25 REVEREND PETER LAARMAN. YES, MA'AM.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1

2 **ANGELA CHUNG:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS ANGELA CHUNG AND I'M
3 HERE ON BEHALF OF THE CHILDREN'S DEFENSE FUND OF CALIFORNIA.
4 WE WANTED TO REALLY THANK THE LEADERSHIP OF THE COUNTY BOARD
5 OF SUPERVISORS AND THE WORKING GROUP ON BEING VERY CLEAR THAT
6 WE NEED CIVILIAN REVIEW OVERSIGHT. THE QUESTION FOR THE TABLE
7 IS: WHAT FORM DOES IT TAKE? ONE OF THE MOST IMPORTANT ISSUES
8 WE WORK ON AT C.D.F.C.A. IS THE ISSUE OF VIOLENCE AND TRAUMA.
9 AND VIOLENCE AND TRAUMA IS NOT JUST ABOUT POLICING OR WHAT'S
10 IN THE JAILS BUT IT'S REALLY ABOUT OUR WHOLE ECOSYSTEM, ALL OF
11 OUR COMMUNITIES. AND SO THE DECISION BEFORE THE BOARD IS A
12 VERY HISTORICAL ONE THAT FUTURE GENERATIONS WILL BE IMPACTED
13 AND LOOK BACK ON. AND THE SUPERVISORS, WE ARE LATE TO THE
14 PARTY, BUT THE BENEFIT OF BEING LATE TO THE PARTY IS REALLY
15 UTILIZING WHAT'S NOT WORKED AND WHAT WE NEED MORE TO MAKE SURE
16 THAT THIS REVIEW BOARD REALLY HAS AN IMPACT ON COMMUNITIES,
17 CHILDREN AND FAMILIES. WHEN WE HARM PEOPLE IN OUR COMMUNITIES,
18 WHEN WE PROVIDE TRAUMA AND VIOLENCE AND WE DON'T DEAL WITH
19 THAT TRAUMA AND VIOLENCE, THEN WE'RE CONTINUING THAT FLOW OF
20 HARM TO THE REST OF OUR OTHER COMMUNITIES. SO I REALLY URGE
21 YOUR BOARD TO TAKE THIS AS A MORAL ISSUE. THANK YOU.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP JAIME
24 GARCIA. JAIME GARCIA. YES, MA'AM.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **JACQUELINE MEJIA:** GOOD AFTERNOON. MY NAME IS JACQUELINE MEJIA,
2 POLICY ADVOCATE WITH THE COLLATION FOR HUMAN IMMIGRANT RIGHTS
3 OF LOS ANGELES, ALSO KNOWN AS C.H.I.L.A. I'D LIKE TO THANK THE
4 WORKGROUP FOR THEIR RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUPERVISORS FOR
5 PUTTING THIS MOTION FORWARD. C.H.I.L.A.'S IN STRONG SUPPORT OF
6 THE SHERIFF'S OVERSIGHT COMMISSION AND THE RECOMMENDATIONS PUT
7 FORTH BUY THE, WORKING GROUP. WE MUST WORK TO CHANGE THE
8 CULTURE AND RAPPORT OUR COMMUNITIES WITH LAW ENFORCEMENT. THE
9 CREATION OF AN OVERSIGHT COMMISSION ENSURES COMMUNITY
10 INCLUSION. LOS ANGELES COUNTY'S A VERY DIVERSE COUNTY,
11 THEREFORE IT MUST BE REPRESENTED IN THE MEMBERSHIP OF THE
12 OVERSIGHT COMMISSION. IT IS CRUCIAL TO INCLUDE SUBPOENA POWER.
13 NO CURRENT OR RTIRED LAW ENFORCEMENT IN A DIVERSE COMMISSION
14 COMPOSED FOUR COMMUNITY APPOINTED MEMBERS WHO REPRESENT ALL OF
15 LOS ANGELES COUNTY INCLUDING THE IMMIGRANT AND THE
16 UNDOCUMENTED COMMUNITY. ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRANSPARENCY SHOULD
17 BE A TOP PRIORITY FOR LOS ANGELES COUNTY. APPROVING THESE
18 RECOMMENDATIONS WOULD BE A STEP FORWARD. THANK YOU.

19

20 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. MICHELE ZORILLLA? SHE
21 ALREADY SPOKE AND ARNOLD SACHS. YES, SIR.

22

23 **LUIS GARCIA:** THANK YOU. MY NAME IS LUIS GARCIA Y AYVENS. I
24 REPRESENT THE SENATE SELECT COMMUNITY COMMITTEE ON
25 CALIFORNIA'S CORRECTIONAL SYSTEM. TRUST AND CONFIDENCE NEEDS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 TO BE BUILT BY THIS BOARD AND THE SHERIFF FOR THE PEACE OF
2 MIND OF THE COMMUNITIES. THIS REQUIRES AN ADEQUATE BUDGET AND
3 INVESTIGATION OF THE PRACTICE OF BRUTALITY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT
4 KILLINGS. ALL REQUIRE THE CIVILIAN REVIEW BOARD TO HAVE
5 MAJORITY CIVILIAN REPRESENTATIVES, INCLUDING MEXICAN-
6 AMERICANS, THE MAJORITY-MINORITY IN THIS COUNTY, WITH SUBPOENA
7 POWER AND A SHERIFF'S MEMORANDUM OF AGREEMENT. BOTH ARE NEEDED
8 FOR TRANSPARENCY AND EFFECTIVE CREDIBILITY, CREDIBLE
9 OVERSIGHT. SO WE THANK THIS BOARD FOR TAKING THE REINS OF ITS
10 INHERENT SUPERVISORY POWERS WHERE THE BUCK STOPS. THANK YOU.

11

12 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

13

14 **ESTHER LIM:** ESTHER LIM WITH THE A.C.L.U. SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA.
15 THE A.C.L.U. FOR 40 YEARS HAVE BEEN WANDERING THE L.A. COUNTY
16 JAILS. I DON'T HAVE ENOUGH TIME TO GO OVER WHY THIS BOARD HAS
17 FAILED TO HOLD THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT ACCOUNTABLE. BUT HERE
18 WE ARE TALKING ABOUT CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT. I THINK O.I.G. MAX
19 HUNTSMAN IS VERY OPTIMISTIC ABOUT GETTING COOPERATION FROM THE
20 SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT. HE MAY HAVE FORGOTTEN ABOUT O.I.R. AND
21 MERRICK BOBB AND P.A.R.C. AND THE REASON WHY HE GOT RID OF
22 THEM WHEN HE FIRST CAME ON A YEAR AND A HALF AGO IS BECAUSE
23 THESE OVERSIGHT AGENCIES DO NOT HAVE THE POWER TO ENSURE
24 ACCOUNTABILITY AND TRUST AND TRANSPARENCY FROM THE SHERIFF'S
25 DEPARTMENT. IT'S VERY IMPORTANT THAT THE CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HAS THE PROPER TOOLS, HAVE THE PROPER EQUIPMENT TO ENSURE THAT
2 THE PEOPLE WHO ARE ASSIGNED TO THIS COMMISSION HAVE THE
3 ABILITY TO ACTUALLY HOLD THE SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT ACCOUNTABLE
4 AND IT SHOULDN'T DEPEND ON WHO THE SHERIFF IS. BUT THE MISSION
5 OF THE DEPARTMENT IS TO PROTECT THE COMMUNITY AND ENSURE THAT
6 THE COMMUNITY TRUSTS THE DEPARTMENT.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. PASTOR?

9

10 **SPEAKER:** GOOD AFTERNOON. AND THANK YOU FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY.
11 AND, AGAIN, I OFFER MY THANKS, AS WELL, TO THE WORKING GROUP.
12 I WANT TO ECHO WHAT SUPERVISOR KUEHL SAID ABOUT THE MOMENT IN
13 WHICH WE'RE HAVING THIS CONVERSATION. IT'S A VERY UNUSUAL
14 MOMENT, BUT IT'S NOT AN EPIPHENOMENON THAT'S GOING TO GO AWAY.
15 THE INTEREST OF THE COMMUNITY IN CHANGING THE SYSTEM, IN
16 PROFOUNDLY CHANGING THE SYSTEM IS DEEP AND IT'S ONLY GAINING
17 FORCE. SO WHY WOULD LOS ANGELES AT A TIME-- AT A JUNCTURE LIKE
18 THIS CONSIDER A PLAN FOR OVERSIGHT THAT'S IN ANY WAY WEAKER
19 THAN THE PLANS AVAILABLE ON OPTION, IN ANY WAY WEAKER? I WAS
20 VERY DISAPPOINTED TO HEAR MR. HUNTSMAN TALK ABOUT THE FACT
21 THAT WE CAN RELY UPON THE CORDIALITY, REALLY, BETWEEN THE
22 DEPARTMENT AND HIS OFFICE. THAT'S NOT SATISFACTORY AND IT
23 DOESN'T REPRESENT SYSTEMIC CHANGE. SO PLEASE CONSIDER THE
24 MOMENT.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

2

3 **JAMIE GARCIA:** MY NAME IS JAMIE GARCIA AND I'M WITH THE STOP
4 L.A.P.D. SPYING COALITION. I AGREE WITH MARK RIDLEY-THOMAS
5 THAT CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT IS NOT A NEW CONCEPT. I ALSO WANT TO
6 LIST WHAT MISS KUEHL HAS STATED ABOUT THE WORK THAT NEEDS TO
7 BE DONE. WITH SUBPOENA POWER AND THE ABILITY OF THE COMMISSION
8 TO DIRECT INSPECTOR GENERAL TO DO INVESTIGATIONS IS REALLY
9 LONG OVERDUE. SPECIFICALLY INVESTIGATIONS ARE NEEDED ON THE
10 DEVELOPMENT OF MASSIVE AMOUNTS OF HUMAN ELECTRONIC
11 SURVEILLANCE USED BY SHERIFF'S DEPARTMENT THAT IS INFILTRATING
12 OUR COMMUNITIES. THESE PROGRAMS OFTEN NEED NATIONAL SECURITY
13 CLEARANCE TO ACCESS WHAT AND HOW THEY OPERATE. THE NATIONAL
14 SUSPICIOUS ACTIVITY REPORTING INITIATIVE IS AN EXAMPLE. SECRET
15 FILES ARE BEING COLLECTED ON ANGELINOS FOR NONCRIMINAL
16 ACTIVITY. THERE ARE MANY SURVEILLANCE PROGRAMS FOR THE COMING
17 CIVILIAN OVERSIGHT TO BEGIN TO UNEARTH AND INVESTIGATE. PLEASE
18 MOVE FORWARD WITH SUBPOENA POWER AND M.O.A. ALLOW AS MUCH
19 POWER AS NECESSARY TO EXPOSE THE CHANGING NATURE OF DOMESTIC
20 LAW ENFORCEMENT OPERATING IN REGARD TO SURVEILLANCE, SPYING
21 AND INFILTRATION OF COMMUNITIES. THERE IS MUCH THE COMMUNITY
22 AND GOVERNMENT OFFICIALS ARE UNAWARE OF.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. MR. SACHS.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **ARNOLD SACHS:** WHY, THANK YOU. I DON'T KNOW HOW I DID IT BUT I
2 ENDED UP LAST AGAIN.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YOUR PERSONALITY.

5

6 **ARNOLD SACHS:** YEAH, I KNOW. M.O.A., PEOPLE ARE TALKING ABOUT
7 M.O.A. THERE'S AN M.O.A. BETWEEN THE SHERIFF AND THE BOARD AND
8 THERE'S AN M.O.A. BETWEEN THE SHERIFF AND THE O.I.G. AND
9 THERE'S AN M.O.A. BETWEEN THIS NEW PANEL. SO IT'S THREE
10 M.O.A.S. AND THEY COULD ALL CONTAIN DIFFERENT LANGUAGE. SO BE
11 AWARE OF THAT. BE VERY AWARE. PEOPLE TALK ABOUT
12 ACCOUNTABILITY. PEOPLE THAT ARE MORE ACCOUNTABLE THAN THE
13 BOARD WITH THEIR DISCUSSIONS WITH THE SHERIFF BECAUSE THEY ARE
14 THE PEOPLE THAT NEGOTIATE THE CONTRACTS WITH THE SHERIFF'S
15 DEPARTMENT. THE ELECTED SHERIFF IS NOT INVOLVED IN THOSE
16 NEGOTIATIONS. WHY DOESN'T THE BOARD TALK ABOUT THE PEACE
17 OFFICERS' BILL OF RIGHTS? THAT'S A STATE LAW THAT ALLOWS FOR
18 THE TRANSFER OF INFORMATION BETWEEN THE CONFIDENTIAL
19 INFORMATION. DISCUSS THAT. THAT'S FROM AN EDITORIAL FROM THE
20 L.A. TIMES. THAT'S REALLY IMPORTANT. YOU TALK ABOUT THESE
21 M.O.A.S LIKE THEY'RE PILLS. YOU SHOULD TAKE ONE.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME SAY THAT TO THE
24 COUNTY COUNSEL, COULD WE ALSO INCLUDE IN THE REPORT BACK ANY
25 UNINTENDED CONSEQUENCES THAT CHARTER AMENDMENTS IN YOUR

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS WOULD BE IMPACTED OR ANY UNINTENDED
2 CONSEQUENCES OF A CHARTER AMENDMENT IN YOUR RESEARCH AND
3 ANALYSIS WOULD BE INCLUDED SO WE HAVE A FULL REPORT BACK.

4

5 **MARY WICKHAM, COUNSEL:** YES, SUPERVISOR.

6

7 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY, MOTION TO RECEIVE AND FILE.

8 SUPERVISOR KUEHL. SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED. THANK

9 YOU. WE BEGIN WITH THE SECOND SUPERVISORIAL DISTRICT FOR

10 ADJOURNMENTS.

11

12 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** MR. MAYOR, YOU REQUEST THAT WE ADJOURN IN

13 MEMORY OF OUR RESPECTIVE CONSTITUENTS AT THIS TIME? IS THAT

14 THE REQUEST, MR. MAYOR?

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** COULD DO THAT, YES, SIR.

17

18 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** ALL RIGHT. HAROLD WILLIAMS, BORN AUGUST 4,

19 1924 IN FLEMINGSBURG, KENTUCKY. PASSED ON JUNE 21 AT THE AGE

20 OF 91. HE GREW UP IN CINCINNATI. AFTER GRADUATING HIGH SCHOOL,

21 HE WAS DRAFTED INTO THE U.S. NAVY AND SERVED AS A RADIO

22 OPERATOR ON A SUBMARINE CHASER IN THE PACIFIC. HE WAS DENIED

23 THE CHANCE TO BECOME AN AVIATOR BECAUSE OF HIS ETHNICITY, HIS

24 RACE. AND SO IN 1944, HE MET HIS IDOL, PAUL WILLIAMS. NO BLOOD

25 RELATIONSHIP. NO BLOOD RELATION. A FAMOUS AND INFLUENTIAL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ARCHITECT WHO WORKED HERE IN LOS ANGELES AND THEIR FRIENDSHIP
2 INSPIRED MANY TO LEARN ABOUT ARCHITECTURE, NOT THE LEAST OF
3 WHICH WAS HAROLD WILLIAMS. SO HE WENT ON WITH HIS CAREER. HE
4 GRADUATED FROM MIAMI UNIVERSITY IN OHIO, AN ARCHITECTURE
5 DEGREE. SCHOOL'S ONLY AFRICAN-AMERICAN STUDENT AND BECAME A
6 DRAFTSMAN AT THE FIRM, ARCHITECTURAL FIRM IN CLEVELAND. AND
7 THEN IN 1954 HE MARRIED BETTY SMITH AND THEY MOVED TO LOS
8 ANGELES WHERE HE WORKED FOR HIS MENTOR AT THE PAUL R. WILLIAMS
9 & ASSOCIATES FIRM. SERVED AS A DRAFTSMAN ON HOMES FOR PERSONS
10 SUCH AS FRANK SINATRA AND OTHER THE CLIENTS. AND THEN IN 1958
11 HE BECAME THE NINTH AFRICAN-AMERICAN ARCHITECT TO BE LICENSED
12 IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. HE DID MANY INTERESTING PROJECTS,
13 BUT THE ONE FOR WHICH HE'S PERHAPS MOST KNOWN IS THE COMPTON
14 CITY HALL AND CIVIC CENTER. AND IT WAS FEATURED AS A MEMORIAL
15 TO DR. MARTIN LUTHER KING, JR. IN COLLABORATION WITH SCULPTOR
16 GERALD GLADSTONE. IT REFLECTED DR. KING'S MOUNTAIN TOP SPEECH.
17 MR. WILLIAMS DID MANY, MANY PROJECTS. VAN NUYS TO WATTS MANY
18 PLACES IN BETWEEN. AND AFTER 1965, HE SERVED AS THE COMMITTEE
19 CHAIR FOR THE SIMON RODIA WATTS TOWERS AND WORKED TO PRESERVE
20 THAT ICONIC LANDMARK AND HELPED LEAD THE WORK FOR THE WATTS
21 TOWERS ARTS CENTER. MR. WILLIAMS IS SURVIVED BY HIS WIFE,
22 BETTY, CO-FOUNDER OF THE NATIONAL BLACK NURSES ASSOCIATION AND
23 SEVERAL NIECES AND NEPHEWS AND A HOST OF FRIENDS AND
24 COLLEAGUES WHO WILL MOST ASSUREDLY MISS HIM FOR ALL THAT HE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HAS DONE IN THE FIELD OF ARCHITECTURE AND MORE. HAROLD
2 WILLIAMS, MR. MAYOR.

3

4 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SECOND. WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

5

6 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** MR. MAYOR, LET ME TAKE THE OPPORTUNITY TO
7 STRIKE A NOTE ON THE HISTORY OF THE MOMENT. I MAKE REFERENCE
8 TO MEDICARE. WE TALK ABOUT THE 50TH ANNIVERSARY OF SO MANY
9 THINGS. IT'S FAIR TO SAY WE HAD THE 50TH ANNIVERSARY OF
10 L.A.C.M.A. THIS YEAR THE 50TH ANNIVERSARY OF THE MUSIC CENTER.
11 THE 50TH ANNIVERSARY OF THE VOTING RIGHTS ACT. THE 50TH
12 ANNIVERSARY OF THE UPRISING OR RIOT IN WATTS. BUT WE OUGHT TO
13 PAY ATTENTION TO THE FACT THAT THIS IS THE 50TH ANNIVERSARY OF
14 MEDICARE, THE GOLDEN ANNIVERSARY THAT WAS ON JULY 30TH, 1965,
15 THAT THEN PRESIDENT LYNDON BAINES JOHNSON SIGNED INTO LAW,
16 LEGISLATION THAT ESTABLISHED THE MEDICARE AND MEDICAID
17 PROGRAMS, A HALLMARK ACHIEVEMENT FOR WHAT WAS THEN KNOWN AS
18 THE GREAT SOCIETY. FOR 50 YEARS THESE TWO PROGRAMS HAVE BEEN
19 PROTECTING HEALTH AND WELL-BEING OF MILLIONS OF AMERICANS,
20 SAVING LIVES AND IMPROVING THE ECONOMIC SECURITY FOR OUR
21 NATION. THE MEDICAID PROGRAM HAS BEEN THE BACKBONE OF OUR
22 COUNTY'S PUBLIC HEALTH SYSTEM. IF DR. KATZ WERE HERE, HE WOULD
23 ATTEST TO THAT VERY FACT. AND THE MEDICARE PROGRAM HAS LIFTED
24 A GENERATION OF SENIORS OUT OF POVERTY AND CONTINUES TO BE THE
25 NATION'S GOLD STANDARD FOR PROVIDING HEALTHCARE THROUGH A

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SINGLE PAYER MODEL. APPROXIMATELY 96 PERCENT OF ELIGIBLE
2 SENIORS ARE ENROLLED IN THIS ESSENTIALLY PUBLIC PROGRAM. THE
3 GOVERNMENT-SPONSORED AND RUN HEALTHCARE DELIVERY. MEDICARE
4 COVERAGE HAS DRASTICALLY REDUCED THE INCIDENCE OF BANKRUPTCY
5 RESULTING FROM THE ABSENCE OF HEALTH INSURANCE, ENABLING
6 SENIORS TO LEAVE A FINANCIAL LEGACY TO THEIR FAMILIES AND
7 INDEED THEIR PROGENY. THOUGH FAR FROM PERFECT, BOTH PROGRAMS
8 MUST BE PROTECTED, IMPROVED AND EXPANDED TO COVER EVERYONE
9 THROUGHOUT THEIR LIFE. I JUST WANT TO SIMPLY URGE ALL OUR
10 RESIDENTS TO JOIN IN THE CELEBRATION AND HONOR THESE LANDMARK
11 LEGISLATIVE ACHIEVEMENTS. HAPPY BIRTHDAY. HAPPY ANNIVERSARY.
12 50 YEARS OF MEDICARE.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL, DO YOU HAVE ANY
15 ADJOURNMENT MOTIONS?

16

17 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR. I ALSO WANT TO POINT
18 OUT THAT DURING THE PRESIDENCY OF F.D.R. THERE WAS TALK ABOUT
19 A MEDICAL SECURITY PROGRAM FOR THE ELDERLY. SO IT CAME TO
20 FRUITION IN 1965, BUT OF COURSE IT WAS 30 YEARS EARLIER THAT
21 THEY BEGAN WORK ON IT. AND I THINK IT JUST SHOWS THAT
22 SOMETIMES YOU DON'T ALWAYS GET TO THE END OF YOUR IDEAS IN
23 YOUR LIFETIME. BUT PUTTING THEM INTO PLAY IS OFTEN JUST AS
24 GOOD A CONTRIBUTION. MAY I ASK THAT WHEN WE ADJOURN TODAY, WE
25 ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF JAMES L. WHITE, LONGTIME RESIDENT OF

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SANTA MONICA AND A SCREENWRITER. BORN IN RURAL KENTUCKY,
2 SERVED IN THE VIETNAM WAR. AND THEN USED THE G.I. BILL TO
3 FURTHER HIS SCHOOLING BEFORE EVENTUALLY RELOCATING TO
4 HOLLYWOOD TO PURSUE HIS SCREEN- WRITING CAREER. HE WORKED ON A
5 LOT OF PROJECTS OVER THE YEARS, A NUMBER OF THEM FOCUSING ON
6 MUSICAL PERFORMERS INCLUDING DINAH WASHINGTON, BESSIE SMITH
7 AND ROBERT JOHNSON. BUT "RAY," THE MOVIE ABOUT RAY CHARLES,
8 WAS THE ONLY SCRIPT TO BE SUCCESSFULLY PRODUCED IN HIS
9 LIFETIME. THOUGH IT WAS A GREAT ONE. AND IT HELPED TO EARN
10 DIRECTOR TAYLOR HACKFORD THE BEST PICTURE NOMINATION. MR.
11 WHITE IS SURVIVED BY HIS WIFE ELIZABETH, TWO DAUGHTERS, MONEE
12 AND MARTINA, AND A SON JAMES WHITE II. THANK YOU.

13

14 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.
15 SUPERVISOR KNABE.

16

17 **SUP. KNABE:** YES, THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR, MEMBERS OF THE BOARD. I
18 KNOW THAT ALL MEMBERS WILL WANT TO JOIN IN THIS, BUT I WANT
19 THE ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF PAT EPSTEIN, LONGTIME FRIEND OF ALL
20 OF US AND WIFE OF OUR JERRY EPSTEIN. PASSED AWAY QUIETLY ON
21 JULY 22ND AFTER A LONG AND WONDERFUL LIFE, FILLED WITH MANY
22 EXTENDED FAMILY AND FRIENDS. SHE LEAVES HER DEVOTED HUSBAND OF
23 MORE THAN 66 YEARS JERRY. TOGETHER AND AS INDIVIDUALS THEY
24 HAVE BEEN A VERY SPECIAL AND UNFORGETTABLE COUPLE WHO HAD A
25 MEANINGFUL IMPACT ON THE LIVES OF SO MANY. PAT WAS BORN IN NEW

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 YORK AND RAISED IN ATLANTA. SHE WAS THE ONLY CHILD OF LEO AND
2 HANNA TANNENBAUM. SHE MET JERRY, THE LOVE OF HER LIFE, WHO WAS
3 A STUDENT AT EMORY UNIVERSITY AT THE END OF WORLD WAR II. THEY
4 MARRIED ON DECEMBER 26, 1948 AT A BEAUTIFUL CEREMONY AT THE
5 MAYFAIR CLUB IN ATLANTA. THE WEDDING WOULD BE THE ONLY THE
6 FIRST OF MANY SPECTACULAR PARTIES THAT PAT AND JERRY HAD
7 PLANNED AND HOSTED OVER THE DECADES AS PAT BECAME THE
8 CONSUMMATE AND GRACIOUS HOST AND PAT AND JERRY SETTLED
9 PERMANENTLY IN LOS ANGELES IN DECEMBER, 1949. FOR DECADES,
10 INCLUDING IN THE LAST MONTH OF HER LIFE, PAT WAS AN ARTIST, A
11 SCULPTURIST WORKING PRIMARILY IN ALABASTER AND LATER PAPER
12 MACHE. HER WORK CAN BE FOUND AT ST. JOHN'S HOSPITAL, THE
13 JEWISH HOME FOR THE AGING AND MANY PRIVATE HOMES THROUGHOUT
14 THE COUNTY AND COUNTRY. SHE ENJOYED HER INVOLVEMENT WITH THE
15 ADVISORY BOARD OF THE FASHION INSTITUTE OF DESIGN AND
16 MANAGEMENT. SHE WAS VERY ACTIVE IN HADASSAH, IN THE IRENE
17 DUNNE GUILD OF ST. JOHN'S HOSPITAL IN SANTA MONICA. THE
18 DOCTORS, NURSES, STAFF AT ST. JOHNS WERE NOT JUST CAREGIVERS
19 BUT MANY BECAME CLOSE FRIENDS FOR OVER FOUR DECADES. THE
20 COMPASSIONATE ATTENTION WAS PARTICULARLY MEANINGFUL DURING THE
21 LAST MONTHS OF PAT'S LIFE. PAT AND JERRY'S GENEROSITY AND
22 DEDICATION TO MANY FRIENDS AND FAMILY WAS LEGENDARY. THEY
23 LEAVE A LEGACY OF ADOPTED CHILDREN AND GRANDCHILDREN WHO HAVE
24 AND WILL CONTINUE TO BENEFIT FROM THEIR LOVING ADVICE,
25 ASSISTANCE AND SUPPORT. SHE WILL BE DEEPLY MISSED. ALSO THAT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WE ADJOURN IN MEMORY OF ABDO SAAB, BELOVED HUSBAND OF LOURDES
2 SAAB, OUR CHIEF DEPUTY OF PROTOCOL, WHO PASSED AWAY
3 UNEXPECTEDLY ON JULY 23RD. ALL MEMBERS. HE WAS BORN IN
4 LEBANON. EDUCATED JESUIT SCHOOL. STUDIED IN FRANCE. RECEIVED
5 HIS CIVIL ENGINEERING DEGREE. HE CAME TO LOS ANGELES IN 1972
6 AND SOON FELL IN LOVE WITH A MEXICAN-BORN ANGELINO LOURDES.
7 THEY RAISED THEIR FAMILY IN FIFTH DISTRICT AND CURRENTLY
8 RESIDE IN THE FIRST DISTRICT. HAD A LONG, ILLUSTRIOUS CAREER
9 AS A BUSINESSMAN RISING QUICKLY TO THE VICE PRESIDENT OF
10 DOWNTOWN L.A. MOTORS. HE WENT ON TO OWN SEVERAL BUSINESSES, A
11 TRAVEL AGENCY, CONSULTING FIRM. VERY ACTIVE IN THE POLITICAL
12 COMMUNITY, LOCAL LAW ENFORCEMENT. WAS ADVISER TO BOTH FEDERAL
13 AND LOCAL ADMINISTRATIONS FOR THE MIDDLE EAST. HE CARED DEEPLY
14 ABOUT CIVIL LIBERTIES AND JUSTICE. HIS PRESENCE WAS FELT IN
15 EVERY ROOM. HE CHARMED EVERYONE, MADE A LASTING IMPRESSION NO
16 MATTER THEIR BACKGROUND. HE TREATED EVERYONE EQUALLY WITH
17 RESPECT AND AS A FRIEND. HE LOVED HELPING PEOPLE AND MAKE
18 BEING THEM LAUGH. HE COULD OUTWIT THE QUICKEST WORDSMITHS BUT
19 ALSO COULD BE A DEPENDABLE FRIEND IN HARD TIMES. HE LOVED HIS
20 COUNTRY, LEBANON. HE LOVED HIS ADOPTED COUNTRY THE U.S. HE
21 CHERISHED INTEGRITY AND WORK IN POLITICS AND LIFE. HE LOVED
22 HIS FAMILY DEARLY AND ACTED SELFLESSLY IN EVERY IMAGINABLE
23 WAY. HE WILL BE MISSED BY ALL THE LIVES HE TOUCHED AND MOST
24 IMPORTANTLY BY THE FAMILY HE LEAVES BEHIND. THEIR HOPE IS TO
25 CONTINUE TO TOUCH THE LIVES THE WAY HE DID. SURVIVED BY HIS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WIFE LOURDES, THEIR TWO DAUGHTERS, LIANE AND JESSICA, BROTHER,
2 GEORGE, SISTERS GEORGETTE, LAYLA, AIDA AND MAY. HE WILL BE
3 MISSED BY ALL THAT KNEW HIM. OUR THOUGHTS AND PRAYERS ARE WITH
4 LOURDES AND HER FAMILY AT THIS TIME. ALSO THAT WE ADJOURN IN
5 MEMORY OF MR. PAUL PERRY, A LONGTIME RESIDENT OF LONG BEACH
6 WHO PASSED AWAY ON JULY 11TH. GREW UP IN LONG BEACH, ENLISTED
7 IN THE NAVY. HE MOVED BACK HOME AFTER GETTING OUT OF THE NAVY.
8 WENT TO PEPPERDINE WHERE HE GRADUATED IN 1950. HE WAS A
9 DEDICATED, EFFECTIVE TEACHER IN LONG BEACH UNIFIED. HE
10 VOLUNTEERED FOR THE Y.M.C.A. FOR OVER 47 YEARS. COMMITTED TO
11 HELPING KIDS IN NEED. HE IS SURVIVED BY HIS DAUGHTER KAREN,
12 THREE GRANDCHILDREN, LAUREN, ANDREA, DYLAN AND GREAT GRANDSON,
13 ASHER, AS WELL AS MANY NIECES, NEPHEWS AND SISTER-IN-LAW. HE
14 WILL BE MISSED BY ALL WHO KNEW HIM. FINALLY THAT WE ADJOURN IN
15 MEMORY OF CARMEN GONZALEZ. A LONGTIME RESIDENT OF WEST
16 UNINCORPORATED WHITTIER. SHE WAS WELL KNOWN AS A STRONG
17 ADVOCATE IN THE LOCAL COMMUNITY. THOSE WHO KNEW HER RECALL HOW
18 SHE TOOK IT UPON HERSELF TO PUT A HOSE OVER HER FENCE IN THE
19 GRASSY AREAS IN HER NEIGHBORHOOD SO THE LOCAL CHILDREN WOULD
20 HAVE A PLACE TO PLAY. THE AREA THAT SHE NURTURED OVER THE
21 YEARS FOR THOSE CHILDREN EVENTUALLY BECAME WHAT WE KNOW TODAY
22 AS AMIGO PARK. OVER TIME, SHE BECAME VERY INVOLVED IN THE
23 PROGRAM AND EVENTS THAT TOOK PLACE IN HER BACKYARD. SHE WAS
24 ALSO A LONGTIME MEMBER OF THE PICO RIVERA SHERIFF'S STATION
25 COMMUNITY ADVISORY COUNCIL. SHE IS SURVIVED BY HER SON

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 FRANKIE, DAUGHTER IRENE AND GRANDSON RAYMOND. SHE LIKED
2 NOTHING MORE THAN GIVING HER TIME TO MAKE THE COMMUNITY A
3 BETTER PLACE. HER PASSING IS A TREMENDOUS LOSS NOT ONLY TO HER
4 FAMILY AND FRIENDS BUT ALL OF US WHO KNEW HER HERE IN LOS
5 ANGELES COUNTY. SHE WILL BE MISSED BY ALL WHO KNEW AND LOVED
6 HER. THOSE ARE MY ADJOURNMENTS.

7

8 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.
9 ALSO TO LOURDES [SAAB] AND HER FAMILY ON HER HUSBAND'S [ABDO]
10 PASSING, HE WAS INTEGRALLY INVOLVED WITH OUR PROTOCOL OFFICE.
11 HE WAS A REALLY RIGHT HAND/LEFT HAND FOR LOURDES AND WAS A
12 STRONG SUPPORTER OF HIS FAMILY, LOURDES AND HER EFFORT. SHE'S
13 DONE A SUPERB JOB. IT'S A SHOCK TO EVERYONE. BUT OUR PRAYERS
14 ARE WITH HER AND HER FAMILY. ALSO ON PAT EPSTEIN AS WAS
15 STATED, SHE WAS A REMARKABLE LADY PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 91
16 BUT SHE WAS A WELL-KNOWN SCULPTURIST AND ARTIST, AS WELL, AND
17 SERVED ON THE ADVISORY BOARD OF THE FASHION INSTITUTE OF
18 DESIGN AND MANAGEMENT. QUITE ACTIVE IN HADASSAH, AND THE IRENE
19 DUNNE GUILD OF ST. JOHN'S HOSPITAL IN SANTA MONICA. AND THE
20 SISTER WHO IS THE ADMINISTRATOR AT ST. JOHN'S GAVE ONE OF THE
21 MOST BEAUTIFUL EULOGIES OF PAT YESTERDAY AT THE CEREMONY. AND
22 SHE WAS QUITE INVOLVED WITH THE FAMILY. ALSO HAROLD CRAIG,
23 LONGTIME EXPERT IN GOVERNMENT BUSINESS COOPERATION AND CHINESE
24 AMERICAN TRADE, HE PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 59. 59. HE WAS
25 C.E.O. OF CRAIG ASSOCIATES. MANAGING PARTNER OF GREENPIPE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 CAPITAL GROUP. MEMBER OF THE UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHERN
2 CALIFORNIA'S INTERNATIONAL PUBLIC POLICY AND MANAGEMENT
3 FAMILY. HE IS SURVIVED BY HIS WIFE, DR. JOANNE YU, PROFESSOR
4 AT THE UNIVERSITY OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA BUT HE WAS INVOLVED
5 IN MANY OF THE PROJECTS AT U.S.C. AND ECONOMIC AFFAIRS AND
6 WORLD TRADE. I HAD THE OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK BEFORE HIS GROUPS
7 AT U.S.C. ANGELA MA WONG PASSED AWAY AT THE AGE OF 68.
8 EDUCATOR, WRITER, PUBLISHER. SHE WAS A FENG SHUI EXPERT AND
9 ENTREPRENEUR. MEMBER OF THE ROTARY CLUB, CO-FOUNDER OF
10 CHINESE-AMERICAN HISTORICAL SOCIETY OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA.
11 RECEIVED NUMEROUS AWARDS FROM THE COUNTY AND FOR HER
12 HUMANITARIAN SERVICES TO THE COMMUNITIES. SURVIVED BY HER
13 HUSBAND NORM AND THEIR FOUR CHILDREN AND SIX SIBLINGS. KENT
14 KNEPPER, RETIRED DEPUTY SHERIFF. PASSED AWAY MAY 1ST. HIS LAST
15 ASSIGNMENT WAS AT THE MALIBU STATION. HE WAS ALSO A VETERAN OF
16 THE UNITED STATES ARMY. SECONDED BY SUPERVISOR THOMAS. WITHOUT
17 OBJECTION, SO ORDERED.

18

19 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** MR. MAYOR? I DON'T HAVE ANY ADJOURNMENTS,
20 BUT I HAVE TWO ANNOUNCEMENTS. ONE IS, I WANTED TO APPLAUD THE
21 WORK OF OUR SHERIFF, ESPECIALLY THE INVESTIGATIVE UNIT
22 REGARDING THE CRIMES THAT TOOK PLACE IN SOUTH EL MONTE. THERE
23 WERE THREE YOUNG TEENAGERS THAT WERE KILLED AND THEY FOUND THE
24 THREE SUSPECTS. THEY BELIEVE IT HAD A LOT TO DO WITH THE
25 REWARD THAT WE ALSO HELPED TO PROVIDE. SO THAT, I THINK,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 REALLY PROMPTED SOME PEOPLE. THESE PEOPLE ARE BEING
2 EXTRADICTED AND BEING BROUGHT BACK FROM MEXICO FOR
3 PROSECUTION. SO I WANT TO THANK THE SHERIFF FOR THAT. I ALSO
4 WANT TO JUST ON A LIGHTER NOTE JUST SHARE THAT IT WAS REALLY A
5 PLEASURE TO SEE THE CEREMONY FOR THE SPECIAL OLYMPICS AT THE
6 COLISEUM AND TO BE ABLE TO ENGAGE WITH SO MANY PEOPLE FROM
7 AROUND THE WORLD AND REALLY BRINGING MANY OF US TOGETHER. AND
8 I WANT TO TIP MY HAT AND GIVE A SHOUT OUT TO FIRST LADY
9 MICHELLE OBAMA FOR BEING HERE AND ALSO FOR OUR AMBASSADOR FROM
10 TOKYO, CAROLINE KENNEDY WHO SOME OF US HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO
11 TOUCH BASE WITH AGAIN. SO WE'RE VERY HONORED AND PLEASED THAT
12 WE'VE BEEN ABLE TO HOLD THESE CEREMONIES. AND I BELIEVE LATER
13 TONIGHT THERE'S ALSO A CEREMONY ON GRAND PARK THAT EVERYONE IS
14 INVITED TO ATTEND. THANK YOU.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP AN ITEM
17 6, 14 FOR DR. CLAVREUL. 6, 14, 17-A ARNOLD SACHS. AND ITEM 14
18 STEPHON BECKAM. YES, SIR.

19

20 **STEPHON BECKAM:** 14 IS ABOUT HEALTH AND MENTAL HEALTH SERVICES.
21 GIVE SOMEBODY A \$500,000 GRANT. I WOULD LIKE FOR HIM TO MAKE A
22 PROGRAM THAT HELPS WOMEN, MEN WHO HAS MENTAL ILLNESS THAT THE
23 D.C.F.S. USE AS HANDLE TO ACCUSE PEOPLE OF WHATEVER THEY
24 CHOOSE TO ACCUSE THEM OF TO TAKE THEIR CHILDREN. NOW, MY WIFE
25 AIN'T NEVER BEEN ARRESTED, NEVER BEEN HOSPITALIZED, AIN'T

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 NEVER BEEN IN TROUBLE FOR HER CONDITION. AND FOR D.C.F.S. TO
2 USE THIS AS A REASON TO NOT RETURN MY KIDS TO HER AND WE CAN'T
3 FIND NOBODY FROM THE HEALTH DEPARTMENT, HEALTH MENTAL
4 DEPARTMENT TO HELP HER WITH HER RIGHTS THAT IS GRANTED TO HER
5 BY CALIFORNIA CONSTITUTION? FEDERAL CONSTITUTION? AND IT
6 STATES THE PERSON WITH MENTAL ILLNESS HAS THE SAME RIGHTS AND
7 RESPONSIBILITIES GUARANTEED AS ALL OTHER PERSONS BY FEDERAL
8 CONSTITUTION AND LAWS OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA. AND IT
9 STATES THE RIGHT TO DIGNITY, PRIVACY AND HUMANE CARE, THE
10 RIGHT TO BE FREE FROM HARM INCLUDING UNNECESSARY AND EXCESSIVE
11 PHYSICAL RESTRAINT, ISOLATION, MEDICATION, ABUSE OR NEGLECT.
12 NOW, THE D.C.F.S. KEEP ON WANTING TO MEDICATE MY WIFE, WHICH
13 SHE DON'T NEED MEDICATION. THAT'S NOT THEIR DECISION TO MAKE;
14 THAT'S HER DECISION. AND FOR YOU OR FOR THIS DEPARTMENT AND
15 MARK THOMAS NOT TO WANT TO SPEAK TO US AND PEOPLE DETAINED OUR
16 KIDS AND OUR KIDS ARE BEING ABUSED AND THEY DON'T WANT TO
17 RETURN OUR KIDS BECAUSE SHE IS BIPOLAR SCHIZOPHRENIC THAT
18 AIN'T NEVER CAUSED NO PROBLEM EVER IN HER LIFE? AND THEY WOULD
19 NOT RETURN OUR KIDS? THAT IS A PROBLEM. AND Y'ALL ARE GRANTING
20 SOMEBODY \$500,000 TO PROVIDE PROGRAMMATIC, ADMINISTRATIVE
21 ACTIVITIES RELATED TO PUBLIC HEALTH, DEVELOPMENT, NECESSARY
22 PROGRAMS TO IMPROVE PATIENT CARE WITHIN THE DEPARTMENT OF
23 HEALTH SERVICE? I BELIEVE THAT PATIENTS DESERVE THE RIGHTS TO
24 HAVE SOMEBODY IN THEIR ADVOCACY TO HELP THEM WITH STUFF LIKE
25 THIS THAT OCCURS TO THEM BECAUSE MY CHILDREN IS STILL TOOKEN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AND THEY ARE BEING ABUSED AND THEY ARE BEING DRUGGED. AS WE
2 SPEAK, MY SIX-YEAR-OLD SON IS BEING FORCED GRABBED BY HIS FACE
3 AND PUNCTURED WITH MEDICATION.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. MR. SACHS.

6

7 **ARNOLD SACHS:** YES. THANK YOU. I DID HOLD A FEW ITEMS. I HELD
8 ITEM NO. 6, IT DEALS WITH APPOINTMENTS. AND, AGAIN, WE HAD
9 DISCUSSIONS ABOUT APPOINTMENTS. BUT I'M STILL WAITING
10 PATIENTLY FOR APPOINTMENTS TO THE PERSONAL ASSISTANCE SERVICES
11 COUNCIL. THAT'S BEEN SO PREVALENT ON YOUR AGENDA REGARDING IN
12 HOME SUPPORTIVE HEALTHCARE WORKERS. WHO APPOINTS THEM? WHO
13 PUTS THOSE MEMBERS ON THAT BOARD? AND WHEN DO THEY GET
14 APPOINTED? I DON'T THINK I'VE EVER SEEN ANYBODY IN ANY BOARD
15 MEETING APPOINTED TO THAT COUNCIL. IS THAT A COUNCIL THAT YOU
16 JUST CREATED LIKE ONE OF THOSE COMMISSIONS THAT YOU'VE CREATED
17 WITH THE ABILITY OF THE BOARD TO ACT LIKE THAT AND JUST YOU'RE
18 ACTUALLY THE PEOPLE THAT SIT ON THE PERSONAL ASSISTANCE
19 SERVICE COUNCIL AND MAKE THE DECISIONS REGARDING THOSE
20 SALARIES? DON'T KNOW. DON'T GET AN ANSWER. AND I HELD ITEM 14,
21 TOO. BECAUSE IT DOESN'T REALLY REFLECT ANYTHING ABOUT NUMBER
22 OF GRANTS THAT YOU'RE LOOKING FOR, BUT WHAT CAUGHT MY
23 ATTENTION IS PART OF THIS ITEM THAT SAYS THESE GRANTS ARE
24 CONSISTENT WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE AWARDS AND/OR GRANTS,
25 THE APPLICATIONS. BUT THEN IT GOES ON FURTHER TO SAY THAT

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 REVISIONS REQUESTED BY EITHER PARTY TO THE AWARDS, TERMS AND
2 CONDITIONS THAT ALLOW FOR THE ROLLOVER OF UNSPENT FUNDS AND
3 THE REDIRECTION OF FUNDS. WELL, IF YOU'RE GOING TO MEET THE
4 REQUIREMENTS OF THE APPLICATION, AND THE APPLICATION
5 REQUIREMENTS DON'T ALLOW FOR THE ROLLOVER OR RE-DIRECTION OF
6 FUNDS, I CAN'T IMAGINE THAT THE GRANTORS, THE PEOPLE GIVING
7 THE MONEY, THEY WOULD WANT THAT MONEY TO GO TOWARDS A
8 PARTICULAR PROCESS OR SITUATION OR NEED? THE PEOPLE WHO WOULD
9 WANT TO ROLL OVER THE MONEY WOULD BE THE PEOPLE WHO ARE
10 GETTING THE GRANT AND/OR REDIRECT THOSE FUNDS WOULD BE THE
11 PEOPLE THAT ARE GETTING THOSE GRANTS. AND THAT WOULD BE THE
12 COUNTY. BECAUSE THAT'S HOW YOU END UP WITH ROLLOVER FUNDS FROM
13 THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT BLOCK GRANT FUNDS AND THE ACTUAL
14 PROGRAMS YOU HAVE THERE AND THE ABILITY TO ADJUST THE AMOUNTS
15 OF THE AWARDS? WELL YOU'RE GETTING A GRANT. AGAIN, IT'S THE
16 GRANTEE THAT WOULD HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO DO THAT. THE PEOPLE
17 GIVING THE MONEY, THEY'RE NOT GOING TO-- THEY'RE NOT GOING TO
18 SAY WE'LL HOLD BACK 10 PERCENT OF 15 PERCENT, IT IS GOING TO
19 BE THE COUNTY. YOU'RE THE ONES PUTTING THE SIPHON ON THE
20 FUNDING. BUT, AGAIN, IT'S ONLY COMMON SENSE. AND WHEN WE DEAL
21 WITH THE COUNTY, COMMON SENSE IS THE FIRST CASUALTY. AND THEN
22 I HELD ABOUT THE ELECTRICAL OUTAGE AT THE PARK, I MEAN WE JUST
23 DID SOLAR POWER. WHY DON'T YOU LOOK INTO SOLAR POWER AT THE
24 PARK?

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. WHY DON'T YOU STAY RIGHT
2 THERE. WE'RE GOING THE CALL UP S-3. SO IF YOU STAY THERE, MR.
3 SACHS. AND DR. CLAVREUL? OKAY. SO ON THE MOTION?

4

5 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** MR. MAYOR, WE HAVE A DEPARTMENT
6 PRESENTATION FOR CONSIDERATION. LORAYNE?

7

8 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** MR. MAYOR, THE ITEMS THAT
9 ARE BEFORE YOU RIGHT NOW ARE ITEMS NO. 6, 14 AND 17-A.

10

11 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MOTION BY KNABE. SECOND WITHOUT
12 OBJECTION, SO ORDERED. SUPERVISOR? ONE MINUTE MR. SACHS AND
13 DR. CLAVREUL IF YOU WANTED TO TALK ON THAT, AS WELL.

14

15 **ARNOLD SACHS:** THERE'S A PRESENTATION, I HEARD. CAN WE SPEAK
16 AFTER THE PRESENTATION? ANOTHER 15 MINUTES. WAITED 20 MINUTES
17 TO SPEAK.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** DO WE HAVE A PRESENTATION ON THIS?
20 OKAY. WE'LL HEAR THE PRESENTATION FIRST.

21

22 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** THERE ARE REPRESENTATIVES FROM THE
23 DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH AND REGIONAL PLANNING THAT ARE
24 COMING FORTH. AND WE'RE DELIGHTED TO HEAR YOUR PRESENTATION.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **RICHARD BRUCKNER:** GOOD AFTERNOON BOARD MEMBERS AND MAYOR.
2 WE'RE HERE TODAY TO PROVIDE BACKGROUND ON THE CALIFORNIA
3 SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY'S REPORT ON WELL STIMULATION AND IN
4 PARTICULAR ON HIGH PRESSURE, HYDRAULIC FRACKING. I'M JOINED
5 TODAY BY MY COLLEAGUES FROM PUBLIC HEALTH, INTERIM HEALTH
6 OFFICER JEFF GUNZENHAUSER AND ANGELO POLOMO, DIRECTOR OF
7 ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, AS WELL AS TIM STAPLETON OF OUR LAND USE
8 REGULATION GROUP AND LUIS PEREZ TO MY RIGHT WHO IS A SENIOR
9 PROJECT MANAGER FOR MARINE RESEARCH SPECIALISTS, OUR EXPERT
10 CONSULTANTS. THIS DISCUSSION ON HYDRAULIC FRACKING IS BUILT ON
11 THE NEGATIVE ENVIRONMENTAL FACTS THAT OCCURRED IN NORTHWESTERN
12 AND EASTERN PORTIONS OF OUR COUNTRY. THEY RESULTED IN THE
13 COMMISSIONINGS OF BY THE CALIFORNIA COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND
14 TECHNOLOGY FOLLOWING THE ADOPTION OF S.B.4, A BILL IN 2013 BY
15 SENATOR PAVLEY WHICH REQUIRED AMONG OTHER THINGS THAT C.C.S.T.
16 ASSESS CURRENT AND FUTURE WELL STIMULATIONS, BETTER KNOWN AS
17 FRACKING, PRACTICES AND RISKS, DEFINE HYDRAULIC FRACKING,
18 REQUIRE THE DEPARTMENT OF OIL, GAS AND GEOTHERMAL RESOURCES
19 AND THE DEPARTMENT OF CONSERVATION TO DEVELOP REGULATIONS
20 RELATED TO WELL STIMULATION, INSPECT WELL STATUS SITES AND
21 REQUIRE OPERATORS TO PROVIDE PUBLIC NOTICE AND INFORMATION AS
22 DRILLING PROCEEDS AND UPON CONCLUSION OF DRILLING. WE ARE
23 PARTICULARLY INTERESTED IN THIS GIVEN THE COUNTY'S ROLE IN
24 REGULATING THE INGLEWOOD OIL FIELD. THE COMBINATION OF THE
25 STANDARDS REQUIRED BY THE 2008 COMMUNITY STANDARDS DISTRICTS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 AND THE ADDITIONAL REQUIREMENTS IN THE SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT
2 MAKE THIS ARGUABLY THE MOST HIGHLY REGULATED OIL FIELD IN THE
3 STATE, IF NOT THE NATION. PURSUANT TO THESE DOCUMENTS, PUBLIC
4 AGENCIES, INCLUDING REGIONAL PLANNING, MONITOR AIR QUALITY,
5 GROUND WATER AND NOISE AS WELL AS A COMMUNITY COMPLAINT
6 HOTLINE. THERE ARE ALSO REQUIREMENTS REQUIRING DRILL PLANS AND
7 DRILLING STANDARDS, PARTICULARLY TO KEEP THE DRILLING SITES A
8 SAFE DISTANCE FROM RESIDENTS. IT IS IMPORTANT TO CLARIFY THAT
9 THERE HAVE BEEN TWO HIGH PRESSURE HYDRAULIC FRACKING
10 PROCEDURES IN THE INGLEWOOD OIL FIELD, ONE IN 2011 AND ANOTHER
11 IN 2012 WHICH WAS REQUIRED PURSUANT TO THE TERMS OF THE
12 AGREEMENT. THIS STUDY WAS REQUESTED BY COMMUNITY STAKEHOLDERS
13 AND THERE HAS BEEN NO HYDRAULIC FRACKING SINCE. I'VE CONTACTED
14 OTHER LARGE LAND OWNERS WHO HAVE WELL OPERATIONS IN L.A.
15 COUNTY. ARA ENERGY, WHICH OPERATES IN THE EASTERN PORTION OF
16 THE COUNTY, NEWHALL LAND AND FARMING COMPANY IN THE SANTA
17 CLARITA AREA, AND TEJON RANCH IN THE NORTHWESTERN PART OF THE
18 COUNTRY. THEY ALL REPORT THAT THEY DO NOT, I REPEAT, DO NOT
19 USE HYDRAULIC FRACKING TO STIMULATE WELL PRODUCTION AND DO NOT
20 RECALL IT EVER BEING USED IN THE PAST. HYDRAULIC FRACKING HAS
21 NOT BEEN SUCCESSFUL IN THE TWO FRACKING INCIDENTS IN THE
22 INGLEWOOD OIL FIELD. OUR EXPERTS IN THE C.C.S.T. STUDY REPORT
23 CAN TELL US THAT THE SOIL TYPES IN L.A. COUNTY ARE SANDSTONE,
24 HIGHLY POROUS, IMPERMEABLE AND THEREFORE EXTRACTION FROM THESE
25 AREAS GENERALLY DO NOT RESPOND WELL TO HYDRAULIC FRACKING SO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 IT'S NOT AN ECONOMIC APPROACH TO EXTRACTION OF OIL. OTHER
2 RESULTS FROM THE C.C.S.T. STUDY INCLUDE, AS ALL GOOD
3 SCIENTIFIC REPORTS SAY, ADDITIONAL STUDY. THE CALIFORNIA
4 EXPERIENCE WITH HYDRAULIC FRACKING IS VERY DIFFERENT FROM THAT
5 OF OTHER PARTS OF THE UNITED STATES. MOST HYDRAULIC FRACTURING
6 IN CALIFORNIA OCCURS OUTSIDE OF L.A. COUNTY AND IN THE SAN
7 JOAQUIN VALLEY. THE DIRECT IMPACTS OF HYDRAULIC FRACKING
8 APPEAR SMALL BUT HAVE NOT BEEN FULLY INVESTIGATED. AND THEIR
9 LAST MAJOR FINDING WAS THAT THE MAJORITY OF IMPACTS ASSOCIATED
10 WITH HYDRAULIC FRACKING ARE CAUSED BY INDIRECT IMPACTS OF THE
11 OIL AND GAS PRODUCTION ENABLED BY THE FRACKING. THEY WENT ON
12 TO SAY THAT GOOD MANAGEMENT AND MITIGATION MEASURES CAN
13 ADDRESS THE VAST MAJORITY OF POTENTIAL DIRECT IMPACTS OF WELL
14 STIMULATION. AND AS MENTIONED ABOVE BUT WORTH REPEATING, THE
15 MAJORITY OF PETROLEUM RESERVES OF THE GIANT LOS ANGELES BASIN
16 ARE SANDSTONE, HIGHLY POROUS, IMPERMEABLE AND THEREFORE NOT
17 GENERALLY REQUIRE HYDRAULIC FRACKING AS A COMMON PRACTICE.
18 HAVING LOOKED AT THESE ISSUES AND BRIEFLY REVIEWED OUR ZONING
19 CODE REQUIREMENTS FOR OIL DRILLING, I WOULD SUGGEST THAT WE
20 REVISIT OUR CODE AND LOOK AT WHERE AND UNDER WHAT CONDITIONS
21 WE PERMIT OIL EXTRACTION. THIS ISSUE IN THE ZONING CODE HAS
22 NOT BEEN EXAMINED IN SOME TIME. NOW I WOULD ASK ANGELA PALOMO,
23 DIRECTOR OF ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH AT THE DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC
24 HEALTH TO MAKE A STATEMENT.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **ANGELO PALOMO:** THANK YOU. THE C.C.S.T. STUDY CONCLUDES THAT
2 MORE RESEARCH IS NEEDED AS THE PLANNING DIRECTOR REFERENCED TO
3 UNDERSTAND THE IMPLICATIONS OF OIL FIELD PRODUCTION ON THE
4 HEALTH OF URBAN COMMUNITIES. SUCH RESEARCH IS NEEDED TO ASSESS
5 OVERALL RISKS AND TO INFORM LOCAL DECISIONS ON EXISTING AND
6 PROPOSED OIL FIELD OPERATIONS. THIS IS ESPECIALLY RELEVANT TO
7 REGIONS LIKE OUR OWN WHERE PRODUCTION OFTEN TAKES PLACE IN
8 AREAS THAT ARE HIGHLY POPULATED AND SEISMICALLY ACTIVE. FOR
9 THE INGLEWOOD OIL FIELD, D.P.H. DID PERFORM A COMMUNITY HEALTH
10 ASSESSMENT THAT INCLUDED A SURVEY OF 1,000 RESIDENTS AND AN
11 ANALYSIS OF THE INCIDENCE OF CANCER, BIRTH DEFECTS, LOW BIRTH
12 WEIGHT AND MORTALITY USING STATE AND COUNTY HEALTH DATA BANKS.
13 THE ASSESSMENT WAS DESIGNED TO COMPARE SPECIFIC HEALTH
14 OUTCOMES IN THE INGLEWOOD COMMUNITIES WITH OUTCOMES IN THE
15 REST OF THE COUNTY. WE FOUND THESE OUTCOMES WERE THE SAME IN
16 THE INGLEWOOD AREA AS IN THE REST OF THE COUNTY, CONTROLLING
17 FOR APPROPRIATE DEMOGRAPHIC VARIABLES. IN SITUATIONS WHERE
18 THERE ARE CONCERNS ABOUT EMISSIONS AND POTENTIAL IMPACTS ON
19 HEALTH, THE APPROACH IS ALMOST ALWAYS TO MONITOR THE
20 OPERATIONS TO ENSURE THAT CHEMICALS ARE NOT BEING RELEASED
21 ABOVE EXISTING STANDARDS OR AT LEVELS THAT WOULD REPRESENT A
22 SIGNIFICANT EXPOSURE AND ASSOCIATED RISK TO WORKERS OR
23 RESIDENTS IN THE COMMUNITY. THE GOAL OF THIS APPROACH IS TO
24 PREVENT EXPOSURE AND ASSOCIATED RISK, AND THIS IS THE STANDARD
25 BASIS UPON WHICH INDUSTRIAL FACILITIES ARE REGULATED BY STATE,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 COUNTY AND FEDERAL AUTHORITIES THROUGHOUT THE COUNTRY.
2 OCCASIONALLY A HEALTH STUDY IS SUGGESTED FOR THE PURPOSE OF
3 DETERMINING WHETHER INDIVIDUALS IN THE COMMUNITY HAVE BECOME
4 ILL AS A RESULT OF EXPOSURE TO A PARTICULAR CHEMICAL SOURCE.
5 WHEN THESE TYPES OF STUDIES ARE CONDUCTED, THEY ARE TYPICALLY
6 DONE ON POPULATIONS INVOLVING TENS OF THOUSANDS OF
7 INDIVIDUALS. THEY TAKE PLACE OVER MANY YEARS. AND TYPICALLY
8 COST MANY MILLIONS OF DOLLARS. BUT IN THE SETTING OF A
9 COMMUNITY OR GROUP OF COMMUNITIES SUCH AS IN THE INGLEWOOD
10 AREA, THESE STUDIES ARE GENERALLY NOT FEASIBLE AND VERY
11 UNLIKELY TO PRODUCE MEANINGFUL RESULTS. THE POPULATION IS
12 SIMPLY TOO SMALL TO SEE A CONNECTION. FOR THESE REASONS,
13 CONCERNS ABOUT COMMUNITY HEALTH RISKS ARE BEST ADDRESSED BY
14 CONTINUED EMISSIONS MONITORING OF THE OIL FIELD OPERATIONS AND
15 THE SURROUNDING ENVIRONMENT. THE MONITORING REQUIREMENTS
16 ESTABLISHED FOR THE INGLEWOOD OIL FIELD ARE EXTENSIVE. AND
17 WITH REGULAR REPORTING AND OUTREACH TO THE COMMUNITY, THEY
18 PROVIDE ASSURANCE THAT THE FIELD CONTINUES TO OPERATE SAFELY.
19 D.P.H. MAINTAINS REGULAR CONTACT WITH THE COMMUNITY SO THAT
20 NEW CONCERNS OR CHANGES IN CONDITIONS CAN BE ADDRESSED
21 PROMPTLY. D.P.H. DOES NOT DIRECTLY REGULATE OIL FIELD
22 OPERATIONS, BUT IT DOES HAVE AN IMPORTANT ROLE IN WORKING WITH
23 STATE AND LOCAL REGULATORY AGENCIES TO ENSURE PUBLIC HEALTH IS
24 AT THE CENTER OF THEIR DECISIONMAKING. WHILE THERE ARE
25 EFFECTIVE MEASURES IN PLACE WITHIN THE INGLEWOOD FIELD,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 MEASURES COULD CERTAINLY BE STRENGTHENED IN OTHER OIL FIELD
2 PRODUCTION FACILITIES IN THE COUNTY. AND WE LOOK FORWARD TO
3 WORKING WITH THE BOARD OF BOARD OF SUPERVISORS, REGIONAL
4 PLANNING AND OTHER AGENCIES TO IMPROVE OPERATIONAL SAFETY AND
5 MONITORING WITHIN THESE OTHER FACILITIES. THANK YOU.

6

7 **SUP. RIDLEY-THOMAS:** THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. MAYOR. AND I WANT
8 TO ACKNOWLEDGE THE WORK OF BOTH DEPARTMENTS IN REGIONAL
9 PLANNING AND PUBLIC HEALTH. IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE HAVE THAT
10 INFORMATION AND YOUR TEAMWORK HAS BEEN INSTRUCTIVE TO THE
11 BOARD. THE STUDY TO WHICH YOU REFER HAS GOT QUITE A BIT OF
12 ATTENTION. AND IT'S APPROPRIATE THAT SUCH WAS THE CASE. I'M
13 GLAD THAT YOU PUNCTUATE THE POINT THAT THERE IS NO FRACKING
14 GOING ON IN THE BALDWIN HILLS OIL FIELD, MORE TECHNICALLY
15 KNOWN AS THE INGLEWOOD OIL FIELD, AND THAT IS IMPORTANT FOR
16 EVERYONE TO KNOW AND APPRECIATE. BUT I THINK THE COUNCIL'S
17 REPORT DIDN'T DO JUSTICE TO OR FULLY REVIEW OR INCORPORATE THE
18 EXTENSIVE PROTECTIONS PERTAINING TO AIR QUALITY, GROUND WATER,
19 SEISMIC ACTIVITY, NOISE, SOUNDS, SMELLS AND OTHER
20 ENVIRONMENTAL ISSUES THAT THIS BOARD HAS PUT IN PLACE
21 THROUGHOUT THE COMMUNITY STANDARDS DISTRICT AND THE SUBSEQUENT
22 SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS. IT SEEMS TO ME THAT SHOULD HAVE BEEN
23 MADE CLEAR, OTHERWISE IT WOULD HAVE CAUSED PEOPLE TO SPECULATE
24 THAT SUCH PROTECTIONS DON'T EXIST. WE DID WRITE THEM AND MADE
25 IT CLEAR THAT THEY SHOULD AVAIL THEMSELVES OF THE STUDY IN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 SOME DETAIL AND CAUSE THAT TO BE PART OF THEIR ANALYSIS IN THE
2 FUTURE. AND IT OUGHT TO BE FURTHER UNDERSTOOD THAT THE
3 SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT WAS PURSUANT TO SUBSTANTIAL SUSTAINED--
4 THOSE ARE EUPHEMISTIC TERMS, I WANT YOU TO UNDERSTAND THAT--
5 PROTRACTED DISCUSSIONS THAT WERE INFORMED BY COMMUNITY INPUT.
6 I THINK YOU GET MY DRIFT. SO THERE IS NO DENYING THE FACT THAT
7 WE HAVE DONE THE RIGHT THING. PERMIT ME TO MAKE THE FOLLOWING
8 MOTION, JOINED BY SUPERVISOR SOLIS. WE WISH TO MOVE THAT THE
9 BOARD "DIRECT THE DIRECTOR OF THE DEPARTMENT OF REGIONAL
10 PLANNING IN CONSULTATION WITH THE INTERIM DIRECTOR OF THE
11 DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC HEALTH TO DEVELOP A DETAILED INVENTORY OF
12 ALL OIL FIELDS CURRENTLY OPERATING WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF
13 THE COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES, INCLUDING WHETHER THE FIELDS ARE
14 OPERATING BY RIGHT AND THE LEVEL OF ENVIRONMENTAL MONITORING
15 CURRENTLY REQUIRED AS WELL AS A REVIEW OF THE ZONES IN WHICH
16 DRILLING ACTIVITIES WOULD BE PERMITTED AND REPORT TO THE BOARD
17 WITHIN 120 DAYS WITH A RECOMMENDATION ON THE STRATEGY TO
18 ENSURE OPTIMAL, APPROPRIATE AND CONSISTENT REGULATION OF THESE
19 FACILITIES. AND WE FURTHER MOVE THAT THE BOARD DIRECT THE
20 INTERIM CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER TO PURSUE ALL APPROPRIATE
21 LEGISLATIVE STRATEGIES TO ENSURE THAT SUFFICIENT FUNDING IS
22 MADE AVAILABLE FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA TO CONTINUE TO
23 STUDY THE POTENTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL AND HEALTH IMPACTS
24 ASSOCIATED WITH OIL AND GAS PRODUCTION ACTIVITIES THROUGHOUT
25 THE STATE AND TO REPORT BACK AS A PART OF THE ROUTINE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 LEGISLATIVE UPDATES FOR THE STATUS AND PROGRESS REPORT ON
2 STEPS TAKEN TO ACCOMPLISH THIS TASK." MR. MAYOR, I WOULD SO
3 MOVE.

4

5 **SUP. HILDA SOLIS:** MR. MAYOR, I JUST WANT TO CONCUR AND THANK
6 THE AUTHOR OF THE MOTION BECAUSE I THINK THIS IS A REALLY
7 IMPORTANT ISSUE. AND I AM GLAD TO SEE THE COLLABORATION OF OUR
8 AGENCIES AND WOULD EVEN FURTHER ATTEST THAT THE NEED TO ALSO
9 HAVE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH INVOLVED AT SOME POINT. SOME OF THE
10 THINGS THAT WE'RE FACING WITH HERE, THE EFFECTS THAT THESE
11 TYPES OF FACILITIES HAVE ON OUR COMMUNITY ARE BOUNDLESS. WE
12 DON'T HAVE ENOUGH DATA. AND THE MORE RESOURCES THAT WE CAN
13 APPLY WILL SERVE US WELL IN TERMS OF OUR HEALTHCARE COSTS,
14 TREATMENT AND ALL OF THAT. AND I'M CONCERNED BECAUSE IN MY
15 DISTRICT, IN THE FIRST DISTRICT, WE HAVE MONTEBELLO, WE HAVE
16 ROSEMEAD, NEIGHBORING WHITTIER WE DO HAVE OIL FIELDS. WE HAVE
17 OTHER PLACES THAT HAVE NOT BEEN LOOKED AT AND THEY ARE HIGHLY
18 POPULATED. I JUST WANT TO CONCUR THAT IT IS VERY IMPORTANT AND
19 OF GREAT VALUE FOR US TO HAVE MORE DATA AND INFORMATION. SO I
20 APPLAUD THE AUTHOR. THANK YOU.

21

22 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** MR. MAYOR?

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** SUPERVISOR KUEHL?

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** I HAVE A QUESTION, IF I MAY. I AM VERY
2 SUPPORTIVE OF THE MOTION. BUT I WAS A LITTLE DISTURBED AND
3 WANTED TO PRESS FURTHER ON THE QUESTION OF ANY STUDY OF HEALTH
4 IMPACTS BY ANY OF THESE POTENTIALLY POLLUTING INDUSTRIES,
5 ALTHOUGH THE PROTECTIONS IN PLACE ARE ALWAYS VERY HELPFUL. BUT
6 I BELIEVE THAT YOU SAID WE CANNOT ASCERTAIN THE IMPACT OF ANY
7 OF THESE INDIVIDUAL PIECES ON PUBLIC HEALTH BECAUSE THE SAMPLE
8 IS TOO SMALL. SO, AS WE THEN LOOK AT OTHER OIL FIELDS IN THE
9 COUNTY, I'M ASSUMING THAT WOULD BE THE SAME, THAT THERE WOULD
10 NOT BE THE ABILITY TO ASSESS A CUMULATIVE IMPACT JUST OF OIL
11 MANUFACTURE OR DRILLING ON PUBLIC HEALTH. HOW BIG A SAMPLE IS
12 NEEDED? AND HOW WOULD SUCH A STUDY BE CONDUCTED? I KNOW THAT
13 WE'VE LOOKED AT CANCER CLUSTERS, FOR INSTANCE, IN THE COUNTY.
14 WE HAD THE ISSUE IN MY DISTRICT, RADIATION, ET CETERA. BUT
15 WHAT WOULD IT TAKE FOR PUBLIC HEALTH TO BE ABLE TO LOOK AT
16 SUCH A QUESTION?

17

18 **ANGELO POLOMO:** WELL, SUPERVISOR, WHEN WE DO CONDUCT REVIEWS
19 LIKE IF THERE'S A CONCERN SURROUNDING A PARTICULAR FACILITY,
20 WE DO LOOK AT PARTICULAR DISEASE OUTCOMES. SO, FOR EXAMPLE, IF
21 THERE WAS-- APPEARED TO BE A CLUSTER OF CANCERS, WE COULD
22 ACTUALLY REVIEW THE DATABASES TO DETERMINE THAT. BUT I THINK
23 WHAT WE SEE HERE IS SORT OF REFLECTED IN THE MOTION IN THAT
24 THERE DOES NEED TO BE RESEARCH. BUT WE THINK THE RESEARCH ON
25 THE GENERAL PROCESS OF OIL FIELD PRODUCTION, INCLUDING THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ENHANCED RECOVERY METHODS REFERENCED, SHOULD BE UNDERTAKEN. ON
2 THE WHOLE, THEY SHOULD BE LOOKING AT A NUMBER OF SITES TO
3 DETERMINE WHERE WE HAVE POTENTIAL RELEASES THAT COULD IMPACT
4 PUBLIC HEALTH. AND THEN WE HAVE TO HAVE VERY RIGID STANDARDS
5 AT EACH OF THE SITES WITHIN OUR JURISDICTION THAT MAKE SURE
6 THAT WE'RE GOING TO ACHIEVE EMISSION LEVELS THAT ARE BELOW THE
7 LEVELS CONSIDERED TO BE SAFE. I GUESS WHAT WE'RE SAYING IS
8 THAT THE RETROSPECTIVE ANALYSES TO DETERMINE WHETHER OR NOT OR
9 PROSPECTIVE ANALYSES TO DETERMINE-- TO USE A KIND OF STUDY
10 LIKE THE ONE WE REFERENCED, THE SAMPLE SIZE IS ALMOST ALWAYS
11 TOO SMALL. BUT PERHAPS DR. GUNZENHAUSER WANTS TO COMMENT
12 FURTHER.

13

14 **JEFF GUNZENHAUSER:** YES, I'M JEFF GUNZENHAUSER, INTERIM HEALTH
15 OFFICER. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR THE CHANCE TO COMMENT ON
16 THIS. WHAT WE'RE SAYING IS THAT IF WE WAIT FOR A LARGE STUDY
17 THAT'S TIMELY AND COSTLY, IT WON'T BE VERY HELPFUL IN
18 INFORMING US ON HOW TO DO THE RIGHT THINGS THAT WE KNOW WE
19 NEED TO DO. SO LIKE MR. POLOMO SAID, WE DO WANT TO TRACK
20 HEALTH OUTCOMES, INVESTIGATE CLUSTERS, BE AWARE OF HEALTH
21 INFORMATION; BUT GIVEN THE SMALL SAMPLE SIZE OF THE
22 COMMUNITIES THAT WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, THE NORMAL SCIENTIFIC
23 STUDIES WOULD NOT BE ABLE TO DETECT IMPORTANT CHANGES IN RARE
24 DISEASES, SUCH AS INFREQUENT CANCER. SO WE WANT TO REALLY JUST
25 TRACK THOSE BUT NOT FUND A HUGE HEALTH STUDY, WHICH WE DON'T

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THINK WILL BE PRODUCTIVE. THE ACTUAL SCIENCE AROUND THIS
2 PARTICULAR HEALTH ISSUE IS PRETTY LIMITED, LARGELY BECAUSE OF
3 THE NATURE OF THE ISSUE. IT'S HARD TO CATEGORIZE THE EXPOSURE.
4 IT'S ALSO WHEN YOU LOOK AT THINGS LIKE ALL CAUSE MORTALITY OR
5 ALL CAUSE CANCER, YOU REALLY AREN'T GETTING DOWN TO THE REALLY
6 IMPORTANT ISSUES OF MAYBE THERE'S A PARTICULAR CANCER,
7 PARTICULAR HEALTH RISK. SO I THINK THE APPROACH HERE IS
8 GENERALLY TO ENFORCE, LIKE WE HAVE, WITH THE BALDWIN HILLS
9 AREA, TO ASSURE THAT AT THE SOURCE WHERE WE HAVE CONCERNS,
10 WE'RE MONITORING AND DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN TO MINIMIZE AND
11 PREVENT EXPOSURES IN THE COMMUNITY.

12

13 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** AND IS THERE SUFFICIENT DATA OR HAS THERE
14 BEEN SUFFICIENT DATA TO COMPARE EMISSIONS BEFORE MEASURES WERE
15 TAKEN AND EMISSIONS AFTER MEASURES WERE TAKEN? NOBODY'S
16 NODDING BUT YOU. [LAUGHTER.]

17

18 **LUIS PEREZ:** SUPERVISOR, YES. LUIS PEREZ WITH M.R.S. AND ONE OF
19 THE THINGS THAT WE DID AS PART OF THE E.I.R. THAT WAS DONE FOR
20 THE BALDWIN HILLS SITE IS WE DID MODELS TO TRY TO UNDERSTAND
21 WHAT THE EMISSIONS WOULD BE. AND SO I THINK AS PUBLIC HEALTH
22 WAS SUGGESTING, IT IS PROBLEMATIC TO TRY TO UNDERSTAND WHAT'S
23 HAPPENING TO PEOPLE THAT MAY BE AFFECTED. SO A BETTER WAY TO
24 APPROACH IT IS TO UNDERSTAND WHAT WE CAN DO AT THE SOURCE TO
25 LIMIT THE EMISSIONS THAT COULD OCCUR FROM THERE. SO WHEN WE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DID THE MODELING, ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE FOUND THROUGH
2 LOOKING AT THE AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT STUDIES AND TO
3 DOING OUR OWN MODELING WAS THAT THESE PARTICULATES WAS THE
4 MAJOR POLLUTANT THAT IS CAUSING CANCER RISK. AND SO WE FOCUSED
5 OUR MITIGATION ON PUTTING FILTERS IN PLACE THAT WOULD REDUCE
6 UP TO 90 PERCENT OF THE EMISSIONS FROM DIESEL PARTICULATES.
7 YOU WANT TO ADDRESS WHAT IS PARAMOUNT WITH REGARDSTO PUBLIC
8 HEALTH. SUBSEQUENT TO THAT, THERE WAS A STUDY THAT WAS
9 CONDUCTED A COUPLE YEARS AGO THAT DID MONITORING OF THE FIELD
10 IN FOUR DIFFERENT LOCATIONS SURROUNDING THE OIL FIELD TO TRY
11 TO DETERMINE EXACTLY WHAT KINDS OF EMISSIONS, WHAT KINDS OF
12 TOXIC WERE COMING OUT OF THE OIL FIELD DURING THE TIME THAT
13 ACTIVITIES SUCH AS DRILLING, REDRILLING AND SO ON WERE
14 OCCURRING. AND WHAT WE FOUND THROUGH THIS INDEPENDENT STUDY
15 THAT WAS DONE BY A THIRD-PARTY THROUGH THE SETTLEMENT
16 AGREEMENT WAS THAT THE EMISSIONS WERE ACTUALLY LOWER THAN WHAT
17 WE MODELED. AND SO WE'RE ABLE TO DETERMINE ON THE GROUND
18 BECAUSE OF THOSE MONITORS AT THE SOURCE, IS NOT PRODUCING THE
19 KINDS OF EMISSIONS THAT WOULD BE RISKY TO THE POPULATION
20 SURROUNDING THE OIL FIELD.

21

22 **SUP. SHEILA KUEHL:** I LIKE THAT APPROACH VERY MUCH BECAUSE IT
23 DOESN'T REQUIRE US TO TIE CAUSE AND EFFECT, IN A WAY. IT'S
24 ALMOST LIKE STRICT LIABILITY, WHERE YOU JUST SAY, WE HAVE
25 STUDIES SHOWING THAT DIESEL PARTICULATES ARE DANGEROUS TO

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HEALTH, SO WE'RE JUST GOING TO ASSUME WE DON'T WANT DIESEL
2 PARTICULATES TO BE EMITTED HERE. I THINK THAT IT'S A VERY GOOD
3 AND USEFUL APPROACH. THANK YOU VERY MUCH, MR. MAYOR.

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. ANY OTHER COMMENTS? WE HAVE TWO
6 SPEAKERS? MR. SACHS AND MR. LUCAS.

7

8 **ARNOLD SACHS:** YES, I WAS SOMEWHAT STRUCK BY THE BEGINNING OF
9 THIS PRESENTATION. INDEPENDENT SCIENTIFIC ASSESSMENT OF WELL
10 STIMULATION IN CALIFORNIA. IN PARTICULAR, FRACKING. IS THERE
11 ANY OTHER KIND OF STIMULATION OF WELLS IN CALIFORNIA THAT
12 WASN'T ADDRESSED BY THIS REPORT? IT WAS ALSO MENTIONED THAT
13 THERE WERE TWO INCIDENTS REQUIRED AS PER THE AGREEMENT IN THE
14 INGLEWOOD OIL FIELD. AND THE INCIDENTS WOULD HAVE BEEN
15 FRACKING. PER THE AGREEMENT. BECAUSE I BELIEVE THE PERSON
16 SPEAKING SAID OTHER AREAS THAT HAVE OIL FIELDS DO NOT DO
17 FRACKING. MAYBE IT'S BECAUSE THEY DON'T HAVE IT AS PART OF
18 THEIR AGREEMENT. AND SUPERVISOR SOLIS MENTIONED WHITTIER. WHAT
19 IS THE STATUS OF THE WHITTIER OIL FIELDS? I MEAN, YOU STILL
20 DON'T KNOW WHAT THAT IS. BUT I DO SEE IN THE FUTURE
21 INDEPENDENT SCIENTIFIC ASSESSMENT OF WALLET STIMULATION AS A
22 SALES TAX. WHAT A GREAT IDEA. WALLET STIMULATION.

23

24 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MR. LUCAS.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **ROBERT LUCAS:** GOOD AFTERNOON. I'M VERY NAIVE WHEN IT COMES TO
2 THIS FRACKING, BUT I HAD AN OPPORTUNITY TO GO INTO THE OIL
3 FIELDS BECAUSE BELIEVE ME, THEY THEY'RE WILLING TO ACCEPT
4 ANYBODY TO WORK AROUND THAT STUFF. THE PROCESS OF FRACKING IN
5 AND OF ITSELF IF YOU'VE EVER BEEN WITHIN FIVE MILES OF IT, THE
6 FEELING AND SENSATIONS THAT I FELT IS ENOUGH. I DON'T NEED A
7 SCIENTIFIC REPORT. I DON'T NEED 10 PERCENT THAT IT MIGHT BE
8 CANCEROUS. JUST LISTEN AND SMELL AND WATCH. THAT SHOULD TELL
9 IT ALL TO YOU. IF YOU STAND UP IN THE INGLEWOOD OIL FIELDS,
10 THEY PARALLEL AND LOOK AN AWFUL LOT LIKE SIGNAL HILL IN THE
11 SHAPE OF THEM. AFTER YEARS OF PULLING OIL FROM SIGNAL HILL.
12 YOU CAN WATCH WHEN THE SUN'S COMING UP HOW IT SAGS AND
13 BUCKLES. IF YOU LOOK OVER IN INGLEWOOD, PLEASE, NO FRACKING.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** OKAY. MOTION TO RECEIVE AND FILE.
16 MOTION BY KNABE. SECOND WITHOUT OBJECTION, SO ORDERED. NOW
17 PUBLIC COMMENT. MR. LUCAS. WHY DON'T YOU STAY. YOU PASS? OR
18 ARE YOU COMING? OKAY. JOSE MARTINEZ. IRENE PANG. STENSON
19 TOLAN. MR. LUCAS.

20

21 **ROBERT LUCAS:** HOWDY. YOU KNOW, SUPERVISOR SOLIS MENTIONED
22 ABOUT THE SPECIAL OLYMPICS. I WENT DOWN THERE FOR THE OPENING.
23 DO YOU KNOW WHAT? SOME OF THE MOST REMARKABLE INDIVIDUALS, NOT
24 THE ATHLETES BUT THE PEOPLE THAT ARE SUPPORTING THESE
25 ATHLETES, I CAN'T TELL YOU HOW REMARKABLE THESE PEOPLE ARE.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 50,000 VOLUNTEERS. I'VE NEVER EXPERIENCED SUCH A SENSE OF WOW
2 IN SUCH A GRAND FORA IN MY LIFE. I NEVER FELT SO ALIVE AND
3 THINGS PUT IN PERSPECTIVE. AND IT'S STILL GOING ON. THE EVENTS
4 ARE FREE AND I URGE YOU GO DOWN. IT WILL CHANGE THE WAY YOU
5 LOOK AT YOUR LIFE. EUNICE SHRIVER KENNEDY, REMARKABLE WOMAN. I
6 WAS A KID. THANK GOD FOR HER. THE THING ABOUT IT IS THAT I
7 MENTIONED ABOUT THE GRAND OPENING IN BOYLE HEIGHTS OF THE
8 B.H.S. I WANTED TO LEAVE AN OPEN INVITATION TO EVERYBODY ABOUT
9 DECEMBER/JANUARY. I DON'T KNOW. I MAY HAVE JUMPED THE
10 POLITICAL FENCE HERE BECAUSE MR. HUIZAR'S CITY COUNCIL SENT A
11 REP TO D.H.S. I MEAN, I HAVE BEEN OVER THERE, BUT IT'S NOT THE
12 SAME AS HERE. AND SO I'M DOWN THERE VOLUNTEERING, DO WHAT I
13 DO. AND FIND OUT THAT THIS REP IS COMING. YOU KNOW EVERYBODY'S
14 IN AN UPROAR I SAID COME ON MAN, YOU KNOW. AND THEN THE GUY
15 STANDS B.H.S. UP. AND I THINK I KNOW THIS INDIVIDUAL. SO I'M
16 GOING TO STOP BY THAT OFFICE AND LET THEM KNOW THAT HE MISSED
17 OUT ON A GOOD BRUNCH AND THAT I DON'T CARE HOW BUSY HE WAS OR
18 WHAT FELL IN HIS PATH THAT DAY. WHEN YOU MAKE A COMMITMENT TO
19 DO SOMETHING IN SUCH A VITAL PHILOSOPHY THAT'S DONE THERE AND
20 THE PEOPLE THAT WOULD HAVE APPRECIATED JUST TO POP IN, I'LL
21 LET THEM KNOW HOW I FELT ABOUT IT.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WELL THE LAW ENFORCEMENT OFFICERS FROM
24 ALL OVER THE WORLD WERE THE ONES WHO WERE SPONSORS AND
25 PARTICIPATED AND WERE THE ROLE MODELS FOR THOSE SPECIAL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 OLYMPIC ATHLETES ALONG WITH THEIR FAMILIES AND VOLUNTEERS.

2 THEY DID A PHENOMENAL JOB.

3

4 **ROBERT LUCAS:** I GOT MORE HUGS THAN I'VE HAD IN MY WHOLE LIFE.

5 IT WAS REMARKABLE.

6

7 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** LET ME ALSO CALL UP ANISSA BESTER AND

8 STEPHON BECKAM. YES, SIR.

9

10 **STENSON TOLAN:** MY NAME STENSON TOLAN. I WANT TO THANK RIDLEY-

11 THOMAS FOR DOING A GOOD JOB AND THE REST OF THE SUPERVISORS

12 FOR DOING A VERY EXCELLENT JOB. I TAKE MY HAT OFF TO YOU GUYS.

13 THANK YOU.

14

15 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, SIR. LET ME ALSO CALL UP

16 AYESHA WEBSTER. AYESHA WEBSTER? YES, MA'AM OR.

17

18 **IRENE PANG:** MY NAME IS IRENE. I HAVE A QUESTION. DOES ANYONE

19 WILL BREAK OWN REAL PROPERTY AND TOOK THE WALL SUPPORTING AWAY

20 FROM THE BUILDING. EVEN CAUSE THE KILLING AND INJURY THE

21 PERSON INSIDE THE BUILDING. SIMILAR SITUATIONS THAT FALL DOWN

22 IN [INAUDIBLE] INVOLVED TO THE BIG CASE. THIS THE BUILDING

23 LOCATED IN THE 11635 RILEY BOULEVARD, EL MONTE WHICH MATTERS

24 DANGER TO ALL. THIS IS THE BUILDINGS, THE ILLEGAL OCCUPANTS

25 NEED TO FOLLOW GOVERNMENT AND COUNTY ORDERS. IN FACT, THE

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 ILLEGAL OWNER NEED THE OWNERSHIP CONFIRMING. I CONCERNED THAT
2 YELLING OF DIFFERENT PERSON WHICH SOME DANGER AND SUFFER IS
3 IMPORTANT TO INVESTIGATION TO PROTECT THE VICTIMS IN OUR
4 SOCIETY. DOES ANYONE HAVE THE RIGHT TO DIG OUT THE MINERAL
5 ROCK WHEN SOMEONE FOUND THE MINERAL ROCK BECAUSE ON THE SAME
6 EARTH AND KNOW ABOUT THERE ARE THE MINERAL ROCK IN THE EARTH.
7 THE GOOD PERSON BY THE CIVIL RIGHTS, THE GOOD PERSON HAD THE
8 RIGHT TO GO TO SCHOOL AND SHOPPING IN ANY CAR, ANY STATE.

9

10 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP, WE
11 HAVE STEPHON HERE. LET ME ALSO CALL UP KREIGH HAMPEL. AND
12 NYSHAN BECKAM YES, MA'AM.

13

14 **ANISSA BESTER:** THANK YOU, MR. MAYOR AND THE BOARD. MY NAME IS
15 ANISSA BESTER. I WAS HERE LAST WEEK ON TUESDAY TO TALK ABOUT
16 THE INJUSTICE THAT I'M GOING THROUGH WITH THE D.C.F.S. AT THIS
17 POINT WHEN I CAME LAST WEEK, MY DAUGHTER WAS NOT TAKEN. AT
18 THIS POINT MY DAUGHTER, THEY TOOK MY DAUGHTER FROM SCHOOL.
19 THEY GOT A WARRANT TO TAKE HER OUT OF MY CARE. AND SHE'S BEEN
20 IN A FOSTER PLACEMENT SINCE FRIDAY. BASICALLY I'M HERE BECAUSE
21 I ONLY HAVE TWO MINUTES TO TALK TO YOU, BUT I'M HERE BECAUSE
22 THIS CASE IS A C.P.S. INVESTIGATION SHOULD NOT HAVE GONE AS
23 FAR AS IT WENT. IT SHOULD HAVE BEEN OPEN AND SHUT. AND
24 BASICALLY I'M PRESENTED WITH FALSE ALLEGATIONS OF NEGLECT FOR
25 MY BABY. I LOVE MY BABY. THERE WAS A DOMESTIC INCIDENT BETWEEN

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 HER FATHER AND MYSELF DECEMBER 2014. I DIDN'T HEAR FROM C.P.S.
2 AGAIN UNTIL 7 MONTHS LATER. AND EVERYTHING HAS BEEN ESCALATING
3 SINCE THEN. IT'S REALLY A TRAGEDY THAT THEY HAVE THE POWER TO
4 TAKE KIDS FROM THEIR HOME WITH LITTLE TO NO EVIDENCE OF
5 ANYTHING. I KNOW I'M NOT THE ONLY ONE. I KNOW THAT THERE ARE A
6 LOT OF PEOPLE WHO ARE GOING THROUGH THIS AND THEY FEEL LIKE
7 THEY DON'T HAVE A VOICE. OR THEY'RE SCARED OR THEY JUST FEEL
8 LIKE NOTHING WILL CHANGE. I'M HERE TODAY TO SHED LIGHT ON THAT
9 AND TO SPARK THAT CHANGE BECAUSE THIS CANNOT CONTINUE. IT'S
10 ABSURD. AND I'M HURTING. MY ENTIRE FAMILY IS HURTING. MY
11 DAUGHTER IS HURTING. SHE IS CONFUSED. SHE DOESN'T KNOW WHY SHE
12 CAN'T COME HOME. AND I'M COMPLIANT. I'M WILLING TO DO WHATEVER
13 IT IS THAT I NEED TO DO TO GET MY DAUGHTER BACK WITH ME, BUT I
14 WILL NOT ACCEPT ANYONE TELLING ME THAT I AM NEGLIGENT OR I AM
15 NOT TAKING CARE OF MY DAUGHTER BECAUSE MY DAUGHTER IS MY LIFE.
16 AND I'M JUST LOOKING FOR HELP IN THIS SITUATION FOR MYSELF AND
17 FOR OTHERS. THANK YOU.

18

19 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** WHERE DO YOU LIVE?

20

21 **ANISSA VESTER:** IN INGLEWOOD.

22

23 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** HAVE SOMEBODY FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF
24 CHILDREN AND FAMILY SERVICES COME UP.

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **ANISSA VESTER:** THANK YOU.

2

3 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** YES. CHIEF COMMANDER SHELIAH WARD.

4 ARNOLD SACHS? YES, SIR.

5

6 **SPEAKER:** I WOULD LIKE TO-- I REQUESTED THAT REGIONAL
7 SUPERVISOR OF MARK THOMAS, REGINALD CARTER, I REQUESTED FOR ME
8 TO HAVE A DIFFERENT CASEWORKER. THEY REFUSED TO GIVE ME A
9 DIFFERENT CASEWORKER. THAT'S A VIOLATION OF MY RIGHTS. I WOULD
10 LIKE TO HAVE MY CASE REMOVED FROM DISTRICT 2. THAT WAS A
11 VIOLATION OF MY RIGHTS. THEY REFUSED TO DO IT. BUT I WOULD
12 LIKE TO ALSO TO ADD THAT MY 10-YEAR-OLD DAUGHTER TRIED TO HURT
13 HERSELF. MY 9-YEAR-OLD DAUGHTER GOT TOENAIL STICKING OUT IN
14 FRONT OF HER TENNIS SHOES WHEN SHE COME HOME TO VISIT. I HAD
15 TO CUT HER TOENAILS. MY SIX-YEAR-OLD TOLD THEM TIME AND TIME
16 AGAIN THAT HIS FOSTER PARENT IS PUNCHING ON HIM, HITTING HIM.
17 THEY LABELED HIM 5150. THEY ARE GRABBING HIS FACE. THEY ARE
18 NOW ADMINISTERING DRUGS TO HIM. I DON'T KNOW HOW. THEY GOT HIM
19 IN AN UNDISCLOSED LOCATION BECAUSE I WENT TO KENDRA AND TOLD A
20 DOCTOR THAT NOT TO GIVE HIM NO PSYCHOTROPIC DRUGS BECAUSE HE
21 NEVER BEEN ON NO DRUGS. THEY GOT MY FOUR-YEAR-OLD ON SLEEP
22 MEDICATION. AND MY FIVE-YEAR-OLD, HE DONE SPLIT HIS EYE OPEN.
23 HE HAD TO HAVE STITCHES. AND MY TWO-YEAR-OLD IS COMING TO
24 VISIT WITH HER VAGINA BLACK AND SMELLING LIKE PEE. AND MISS
25 NUNEZ, OUR CASEWORKER, KEEP ON TRYING TO INCITE MY WIFE WITH

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DIFFERENT THINGS, TELLING HER HOW TO SPEAK TO OUR KIDS, THEY
2 TELLING OUR KIDS NOT TO SAY YES, MA'AM AND NO MA'AM. I DON'T
3 KNOW WHERE THEY GET OFF SAYING THAT AT, TO TELL OUR KIDS THAT
4 THEY DON'T HAVE TO SAY YES, MA'AM OR NO MA'AM. BUT THIS IS
5 WHAT THEY'RE DOING. I WOULD LIKE FOR OUR CASE TO BE MOVED FROM
6 THAT DISTRICT. I HAVE ASKED OVER AND OVER AND THEY REFUSED TO
7 DO IT.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. LET ME ALSO CALL UP DEBRA
10 POLEE. YES, SIR.

11

12 **KREIGH HAMPEL:** THANK YOU, MAYOR AND SUPERVISORS FOR YOUR
13 ATTENTION TO PHARMACEUTICAL AND SHARPS ISSUE. MY NAME IS
14 KREIGH HAMPEL. TODAY I'M SPEAKING AS A BOARD MEMBER OF THE
15 CALIFORNIA PRODUCT STEWARDSHIP COUNCIL OR C.P.S.C. STRONGLY
16 SUPPORTS THE COUNTY'S ORDINANCE, THE COUNTY'S PROPOSED
17 ORDINANCE FOR PHARMACEUTICALS AND SHARPS. C.P.S.C. IS A
18 NONPROFIT COALITION OF 138 CALIFORNIA CITIES, COUNTIES AND
19 SPECIAL DISTRICTS THAT FORMED IN 2006 TO EDUCATE, ADVOCATE AND
20 SUPPORT EXTENDED PRODUCER RESPONSIBILITY. OUR BOARD IS
21 COMPRISED OF BOTH PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR MEMBERS, INCLUDING
22 THOSE IN THE HEALTHCARE INDUSTRY. WE ALL WANT BUSINESSES TO
23 THRIVE WITH EXTENDED PRODUCER RESPONSIBILITY. C.P.S.C. HAS
24 RECEIVED STRONG SUPPORT FROM LOS ANGELES COUNTY. AND THE
25 COUNTY IS JOINED BY THE CITY OF LOS ANGELES, TWO SPECIAL

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 DISTRICTS AND 21 OTHER CITIES WITHIN THE COUNTY THAT HAVE
2 ADOPTED RESOLUTIONS REGARDING E.P.R. IN CALIFORNIA. EXTENDED
3 PRODUCER RESPONSIBILITY WORKS ALL OVER THE WORLD FOR HOUSEHOLD
4 BATTERIES, AUTOMOBILES PACKAGING, INSECTICIDES, PAINTS, SHARPS
5 AND MEDICINES. AND WE HAVE MANY OF THESE PROGRAMS HERE IN
6 CALIFORNIA. C.P.S.C. HAS DEVELOPED F.A.Q. SHEETS SPECIFIC TO
7 E.P.R. FOR MEDICATIONS AND SHARPS IN FRANCE, PORTUGAL, MEXICO,
8 BRAZIL AND COLOMBIA. CANADA ALSO HAS VERY SUCCESSFUL PROGRAMS
9 FOR BOTH PHARMACEUTICALS AND SHARPS DESIGNED AND OPERATED BY
10 PRIVATE SECTOR. THIS ORDINANCE ALIGNS WITH THOSE MODELS THAT
11 ARE SUCCESSFUL IN OTHER PARTS OF THE WORLD. C.P.S.C. HAS
12 COSPONSORED STATE LEGISLATION ATTEMPTS IN THE PAST TWO YEARS.
13 WHEN THOSE STATE BILLS FAILED, SENATOR JACKSON SENT A LETTER
14 TO THE COUNTY SUPERVISORS AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS STATEWIDE
15 ASKING THEM TO ADOPT LOCAL ORDINANCES. UNLIKE THE WORKPLACE,
16 THERE ARE NO AGENCIES OVERSEEING HOME-GENERATED
17 PHARMACEUTICALS AND SHARPS. BECAUSE PUBLIC COLLECTIONS NEED
18 HELP, DRUGS AND NEEDLES ARE TOSSED IN TRASH AND RECYCLING
19 CONTAINERS AND WORKERS IN THOSE FIELDS ARE EXPOSED.

20

21 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. WE HAD THAT CONTINUED FOR
22 TWO WEEKS, BUT WE ARE MOVING FORWARD ON THAT. AND GLAD TO
23 TWEAK IT SOME. BUT HOPE YOU COULD COME BACK. THANK YOU. MR.
24 SACHS?

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **ARNOLD SACHS:** YES, OKAY, THANK YOU. ARNOLD SACHS. AND BASED ON
2 LAST WEEK'S DISCUSSION ABOUT THE WAGE INCIDENT ORDINANCE OR
3 STUFF, I WAS SOMEWHAT FASCINATED ABOUT THE SITUATION WITH THE
4 LONG SHORE MEN COMING UP WITH THE TRUCKERS. IT JUST SO
5 HAPPENED THAT THE NEXT DAY, THIS CALIFORNIA LABORERS
6 COMMISSIONERS OFFICE RULED THAT IN SAN FRANCISCO AN UBER
7 DRIVER SHOULD BE CLASSIFIED AS AN EMPLOYEE NOT AS AN
8 INDEPENDENT CONTRACTOR. SO, I'M WONDERING: WOULD THEY HAVE
9 OVERSIGHT OVER THE TRUCKERS AT THE PORT OF LOS ANGELES AND
10 LONG BEACH? LONG BEACH IS GOING TO HAVE-- THE CITY OF LONG
11 BEACH IS GOING TO HAVE A MEETING ABOUT THE CITY TIDELANDS AND
12 HARBOR COMMITTEE TO DISCUSS THAT LABEL OF INDEPENDENT TRUCKER
13 VERSUS EMPLOYEE. AND THEN THERE WAS THE STORY ABOUT THE
14 N.L.R.B. THE NATIONAL LABOR RELATIONSHIP BOARD. YOU WOULD
15 THINK. AND THEN ON TOP OF EVERYTHING ELSE, ARE THESE THE ONLY
16 TWO HARBORS OR PORTS IN THE COUNTRY THAT HAVE THIS PROBLEM?
17 DOES IT HAPPEN IN SAN FRANCISCO? DOES IT THIS HAPPEN SAN
18 DIEGO? DOES IT THIS HAPPEN THE STATE OF WASHINGTON? DOES IT
19 HAPPEN IN TEXAS? DOES IT HAPPEN IN IN LOUISIANA? DOES IT
20 HAPPEN IN GEORGIA? DOES IT HAPPEN IN SOUTH CAROLINA? DOES IT
21 HAPPEN IN NEW YORK? WHERE ALL THESE. ALL INDEPENDENT TRUCKERS
22 HAVE FACED THE SAME SITUATION? WHO'S IN CHARGE? YOU HAVE NO
23 CONCEPT, NO ABILITY TO WRITE A 5-SIGNATURE LETTER TO LOOK AT
24 THIS? THEY DON'T PAY FOR WORKER'S COMP. THEY DON'T PAY MEDICAL
25 COSTS. EVERYTHING FALLS ON THAT. AND WHO OVERSEES AS

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 INDEPENDENT TRUCKERS OR INDEPENDENT OPERATORS, WHO OVERSEES
2 THE LICENSING? DOES THE COUNTY? DOES THE CITY? WHERE DOES THE
3 PUBLIC SIT ON THIS?

4

5 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU.

6

7 **ARNOLD SACHS:** ACT PROFESSIONAL. THINK ABOUT THAT.

8

9 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** MISS WARD.

10

11 **SHELIAH WARD:** GREETINGS IN THE SPIRIT OF THE WORLD HARD. CHIEF
12 COMMANDER SHELIAH WARD. I REPRESENT THE PEOPLE IN THIS COUNTRY
13 SINCE I WAS A CHILD. I'M APPALLED AT WHAT'S GOING ON IN
14 AMERICA, SO-CALLED TODAY. MY CHILDREN WERE TAKEN FROM ME AND I
15 WAS CALLED UNFIT. THEY TRIED TO ARREST ME AND ACCUSE ME OF
16 BEING SOMEONE THAT I'M NOT, UNTIL I RAN OUT THE FRONT DOOR,
17 WHERE SOMEONE WAS WAITING FOR ME, TO IDENTIFY ME JUST BECAUSE
18 I'M BLACK AND JUST BECAUSE I WAS SAYING FREE NELSON IRANI, AND
19 FREE GERONIMO PRATT. TODAY I ESTABLISHED A MINISTRY IN LEIMERT
20 PARK TO CURTAIL ALL THAT NEGATIVE ENERGY TO SOMETHING POSITIVE
21 THE WAY I WAS RAISED BY THE GRACE OF THE ALMIGHTY GOD AND LED
22 BY THE GRAVEYARD AND THE CROSSROADS. TODAY YOU SEND PEOPLE IN
23 LEIMERT PARK TO ATTACK ME LAST YEAR FOR KWANZAA. TODAY YOU
24 SEND PEOPLE IN LEIMERT PARK TO ATTACK THE PEOPLE IN LEIMERT
25 PARK FOR BEING DRUMMERS, FOR BEING NORMAL, TO BEING PEACEFUL.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THANK YOU. DO YOU WANT THEM TO TURN INOT VIOLENT PEOPLE AND
2 BURN THIS MOTHER DOWN? SEND THEM THERE AGAIN. I DARE YOU. SEND
3 THEM THERE AGAIN. THE PEOPLE ARE READY AND THEY'RE WAITING FOR
4 YOU. YOU DONE TOLD HE PEOPLE THAT THEY CANNOT BUILD IN LEIMERT
5 PARK FOR BLACKS. WE CAN'T HAVE NEVER HAVE A PLACE FOR US?
6 NOBODY GOES TO CHINATOWN AND DISRESPECT THEM. WE DON'T DISPECT
7 ELVIRA STREET. WE DON'T DISPECT NOBODY ELSE'S CULTURE BUT YOU
8 PEOPLE CAN COME AND DISRESPECT US? WHAT PERSIAN MAN? I'M THE
9 DUMB SON OF A BISCUIT EATER THAT NEEDED TO HELPED THE PERSIANS
10 AND IRANIANS SELL THEIR OIL SO WITH THE OIL CRISIS WITH IRAN,
11 AND NEVER GOT PAID. SO WHAT THE HELL A MAN DOING OVER HERE IN
12 LEIMERT PARK MESSING UP FOR THE DAY, AND MESS UP MY MINISTRY
13 THAT GOD GAVE ME TO SAVE THIS WORLD SO IT WON'T BURN TILL
14 AFTER I'M DEAD NOT WHILE I'M LIVING? YOU'VE TAKEN ALL THE
15 BUSINESSES FROM ALL THE BLACK PEOPLE AND DEAD MEN AND ALL OVER
16 THERE TO BRING BACK WHAT? YOU THINK PEOPLE ARE GOING TO SIT BY
17 AND WATCH THIS? ANYBODY WHO THEY TOOK YOUR CHILDREN FROM YOU,
18 PEOPLE, CALL 310-918-4047. 310-948-4047. OR CALL 213-281-1071
19 FOR ME. YOU'RE NOT GOING THE GET HELP FROM NOBODY ELSE. THEY
20 DIDN'T HELP ME. THEY'RE NOT GOING TO HELP YOU. TILL TODAY I
21 HAVEN'T GOT A VICTIMS. WHERE'S THE VICTIMS FUND FOR HELPING ME
22 FROM BEING JUMPED IN THE PARK AND THE MEDICAL ATTENTION THAT
23 I'M SUPPOSED TO GET THAT I'M PAYING FOR WHILE MY ELECTRICITY
24 IS BEING CUT OFF?
25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

2

3 **DEBORAH POLEE:** HI, I'M DEBORAH POLE. CIVIL SERVICE EMPLOYEE
4 AND AGAIN I SAY IT'S A SHAME WHEN I HAVE TO COME DOWN HERE AND
5 DISCUSS OUR DIRTY LAUNDRY WHEN THINGS SHOULD BE TAKEN CARE OF
6 IN-HOUSE IN THE OFFICE. I FILED FOR F.M.L.A. WHICH IS FAMILY
7 MEDICAL LEAVE IN 2013 FOR MY MOM, WHICH IS SUPPOSED TO BE
8 APPROVED, DENIED OR TOLD WHATEVER YOU NEED WITHIN A FIVE-DAY
9 PROCESS. IT TOOK OVER A YEAR TO GET IT TAKEN CARE OF AND THEN
10 IN 2014, AFTER WAITING SEVERAL MONTHS-- SEVEN MONTHS, RATHER,
11 IT GOT DENIED. THEY WAITED. THEY SENT IT TO SEVERAL EMPLOYEES.
12 THEN THEY BROUGHT IN A MANAGEMENT ANALYST AND SHE DENIED IT
13 AFTER SEVEN MONTHS OF WAITING FOR IT TO BE APPROVED BECAUSE I
14 ENQUIRED ABOUT THE H.I.P.A.A. LAW. THEY WERE ASKING ME THINGS
15 ABOUT HOW I WAS GOING TO TAKE CARE OF MY MOM AND I ASKED WAS
16 THAT A VIOLATION OF THE H.I.P.A.A. LAW? SO IT GOT DENIED. NOW
17 AND I DID IT FOR 2015, MAY OF 2015, IT HAS BEEN OVER 90 DAYS
18 AND I HAVEN'T RETURNED TO WORK UNTIL NEXT MONTH WILL BE THE
19 THREE MONTHS IN WHICH YOU'RE ENTITLED TO USE. AND WHEN I
20 RETURN I'M ALREADY BEING TOLD THAT I'VE ABANDONED MY JOB, SO
21 MY JOB IS IN JEOPARDY BY THE DIRECTOR. SHE'S SENDING OUT
22 NOTICES TO MY HOME TO QUESTION ME BRINGING IN A NOTICE, A
23 MEDICAL NOTICE. AND IF YOU'RE FAMILIAR WITH F.M.L.A. LAWS, IT
24 IS PERTAINING TO TAKING THE PAPERWORK TO A PHYSICIAN IN WHICH
25 I'VE DONE FOR THE LAST THREE YEARS TO SHOW THAT MY MOTHER,

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 WITH ALL THE THINGS THAT ARE HAPPENING TO HER, IT MAKES ME
2 ELIGIBLE. AND SO I CAN'T BRING HER PHYSICIAN'S EXCUSE. BUT
3 SHE'S STILL CHALLENGING MY JOB. AND THIS IS SUPPOSED TO BE
4 FEDERALLY PROTECTED. SO I NEED TO KNOW HOW AM I GOING TO
5 PROTECT MYSELF WHEN I'M ACTUALLY SUPPLYING THE THINGS THAT ARE
6 REQUIRED AND IT'S BEING IGNORED? I AM ALSO MEETING WITH MISS
7 SPILLER NEXT WEEK BECAUSE EVERY TIME I BRING ISSUES TO YOU
8 GUYS, MY ISSUES ESCALATE. I'M BEING CALLED IN BY INTERNAL
9 AFFAIRS. I'M BEING CALLED IN BY THE DIRECTOR, THE DIVISION
10 CHIEF, EVERYBODY WHO HAS AUTHORITY OVER ME ARE CAUSING ME
11 UNNECESSARY HAVOC. SO I NEED YOUR HELP.

12

13 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU. YES, MA'AM.

14

15 **NYESHA BECKAM:** HELLO. MY NAME IS NYESHA BECKAM. I'M HERE TO
16 SPEAK ON BEHALF OF MY FAMILY OF EIGHT. ME AND MY HUSBAND HAVE
17 BEEN MARRIED FOR 20 YEARS. WE HAD 6 CHILDREN IN 8 YEARS. OUR
18 OLDEST IS 10, OUR YOUNGEST IS 2. THEY HAVE BEEN KIDNAPPED BY
19 THE STATE AND HAVE BEEN ABUSED IN THE PAST 90 DAYS IN STATE'S
20 CUSTODY. WE'VE CALLED AND ASKED FOR HELP FROM EVERYONE FROM
21 THE BOTTOM OF THE CHAIN TO THE TOP OF THE CHAIN. EVERYONE
22 REFUSES TO HELP US. OUR OLDEST SON HAS SAID THAT HE'S BEEN
23 ABUSED IN TWO OF THE FOSTER HOMES THAT HE'S BEEN IN. AND MY
24 YOUNGER SONS ARE STILL IN THESE FOSTER HOMES. MY DAUGHTER
25 COMES TO VISIT EVERY WEEK. SHE'S GOT URINE IN HER DIAPER FROM

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 THE FRONT TO THE BACK. SO YOU KNOW THAT SHE'S DIRTY. MY
2 OLDEST, NEXT TO OLDEST DAUGHTER HAS SOTO SYNDROME SO SHE GROWS
3 FASTER THAN NORMAL AND SHE'S NOT BEING CARED FOR PROPERLY. MY
4 10-YEAR-OLD HAS TRIED TO COMMIT SUICIDE. SHE'S NEVER TRIED TO
5 HURT HERSELF IN THE PAST. NONE OF MY CHILDREN HAVE HAD ANY
6 ABUSE DONE TO THEM IN THE PAST OUT OF 10 YEARS OF US HAVING
7 THIS FAMILY AND RAISING THESE CHILDREN. THERE HAS BEEN NO
8 REPORT OF ABUSE FROM W.I.C., SCHOOL, DOCTORS, DENTISTS OR ANY
9 OF THAT. MY YOUNGEST BOY, EDDIE ACCIDENTALLY BROKE HIS LEG THE
10 29TH OF APRIL AND EVER SINCE THEN Y'ALL HAVE TAKEN MY KIDS AND
11 THEY HAVE BEEN ABUSED IN Y'ALL'S CUSTODY AND IT'S JUST NOT
12 RIGHT, YOU KNOW. IT'S NOT RIGHT AT ALL. AND SOMEBODY HAS GOT
13 TO DO SOMETHING ABOUT IT BECAUSE I DIDN'T ABUSE MY CHILDREN
14 BUT NOW MY CHILDREN ARE BEING ABUSED. THANK YOU.

15

16 **SUP. ANTONOVICH, MAYOR:** THANK YOU, MA'AM.

17

18 **LORAYNE LINGAT, DPTY. EXEC. OFCR.:** IN ACCORDANCE WITH BROWN
19 ACT REQUIREMENTS, NOTICE IS HEREBY GIVEN THAT THE BOARD OF
20 SUPERVISORS WILL CONVENE IN CLOSED SESSION TO DISCUSS ITEMS
21 NO. C.S.-1 AND C.S.-2, CONFERENCES WITH LEGAL COUNSEL
22 REGARDING EXISTING LITIGATION. ITEM NO. C.S.-3, CONFERENCE
23 WITH LEGAL COUNSEL REGARDING SIGNIFICANT EXPOSURE TO
24 LITIGATION, ONE CASE. ITEM NO. C.S.-4, PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT,
25 RECRUITMENT AND CONSIDERATION OF CANDIDATES FOR THE

July 28, 2015

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 APPOINTMENT TO THE POSITION OF COUNTY COUNSEL; ITEM NO. C.S.-
2 5, PUBLIC EMPLOYMENT, CONSIDERATION OF CANDIDATES FOR THE
3 APPOINTMENT TO THE POSITION OF DIRECTOR OF PARKS AND
4 RECREATION; ITEM NO. C.S.-6, DEPARTMENT HEAD PERFORMANCE
5 EVALUATIONS; AND ITEM NO. C.S.-7, CONFERENCE WITH LABOR
6 NEGOTIATOR SACHI A. HAMAI AND DESIGNATED STAFF AS INDICATED ON
7 THE POSTED AGENDA. THANK YOU.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



REPORT OF ACTION TAKEN IN CLOSED JULY 28, 2015

CS-1. CONFERENCE WITH LEGAL COUNSEL - EXISTING LITIGATION

(Paragraph (1) of Subdivision (d) of Government Code Section 54956.9) Lindsay F. v. County of Los Angeles, et al., Los Angeles Superior Court Case No. BC 473127

This case involves an alleged sexual assault by a Sheriff's Deputy. (15-3527)

The Board authorized settlement contribution in the matter entitled Lindsay F. v. County of Los Angeles, et al. The details of the settlement will be made available once finalized by all parties.

The vote of the Board was unanimous with all Supervisors being present.

No reportable action was taken on items CS-2, CS-3, CS-4, CS-5, CS-6 or CS-7.

THE MEETING TRANSCRIPT

OF THE MEETING OF THE LOS ANGELES COUNTY BOARD OF SUPERVISORS



1 I, JENNIFER A. HINES, Certified Shorthand Reporter Number
2 6029/RPR/CRR qualified in and for the State of California, do
3 hereby certify:

4 That the transcripts of proceedings recorded by the Los
5 Angeles County Board of Supervisors July 28, 2015,
6 were thereafter transcribed into typewriting under my
7 direction and supervision;

8 That the transcript of recorded proceedings as archived
9 in the office of the reporter and which have been provided to
10 the Los Angeles County Board of Supervisors as certified by
11 me.

12 I further certify that I am neither counsel for, nor
13 related to any party to the said action; nor
14 in anywise interested in the outcome thereof.

15 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this
16 30th day of July 2015, for the County records to be used only
17 for authentication purposes of duly certified transcripts
18 as on file of the office of the reporter.

19

20 JENNIFER A. HINES

21 CSR No. 6029/RPR/CRR

22

23